

WITTGENSTEIN ON PHILOSOPHY, OBJECTIVITY, AND MEANING

This volume of new essays presents groundbreaking interpretations of some of the most central themes of Wittgenstein's philosophy. A distinguished group of contributors demonstrates how Wittgenstein's thought can fruitfully be applied to contemporary debates in epistemology, metaphilosophy, and philosophy of language. The volume combines historical and systematic approaches to Wittgensteinian methods and perspectives, with essays providing detailed analysis that will be accessible to students as well as specialists. The result is a rich and illuminating picture of a key figure in twentieth-century philosophy and his continuing importance to philosophical study.

JAMES CONANT is Chester D. Tripp Professor of Humanities and Professor of Philosophy at the University of Chicago, as well as Humboldt Professor at the University of Leipzig. He has published widely on topics including philosophy of language, philosophy of mind, aesthetics, German idealism, and history of analytic philosophy.

SEBASTIAN SUNDAY is Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Oxford. His research covers a range of philosophical areas, with a focus on logic and epistemology.

WITTGENSTEIN ON
PHILOSOPHY,
OBJECTIVITY, AND
MEANING

EDITED BY

JAMES CONANT

University of Chicago

SEBASTIAN SUNDAY

University of Oxford



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107194151

DOI: 10.1017/9781108151764

© Cambridge University Press 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd, Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Conant, James, editor.

TITLE: Wittgenstein on philosophy, objectivity, and meaning / edited by James Conant, University of Chicago, Sebastian Sunday, University of Oxford.

DESCRIPTION: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2019. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2019008053 | ISBN 9781107194151 (alk. paper)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Wittgenstein, Ludwig, 1889–1951.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC B3376.W564 W5795 2019 | DDC 192–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019008053>

ISBN 978-1-107-19415-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	page vii
<i>Preface</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xii
1 Anatomy of a Muddle: Wittgenstein and Philosophy <i>Alexander George</i>	I
2 Explaining What We Mean <i>Julia Tanney</i>	28
3 Objectivity <i>Alice Crary</i>	47
4 The Methodological Significance of Intuitions in Philosophy <i>Oskari Kuusela</i>	62
5 Wittgenstein on ‘Seeing Meanings’ <i>Katherine J. Morris</i>	84
6 Bringing the Phenomenal World into View <i>Avner Baz</i>	100
7 First Steps and Conceptual Creativity <i>Michael Beaney</i>	119
8 Wittgenstein and Analytic Revisionism <i>Martin Gustafsson</i>	143
9 Demystifying Meaning in Horwich and Wittgenstein <i>Silver Bronzo</i>	164
10 What Is Meaning? A Wittgensteinian Answer to an Un-Wittgensteinian Question <i>Hans-Johann Glock</i>	185

11	Meaning, Use, and Supervenience <i>William Child</i>	211
12	Some Socratic Aspects of Wittgenstein's Conception of Philosophy <i>James Conant</i>	231
	<i>References</i>	265
	<i>Index</i>	280

Contributors

AVNER BAZ, Tufts University

MICHAEL BEANEY, Humboldt University and King's College London

SILVER BRONZO, National Research University Higher School of Economics

WILLIAM CHILD, University of Oxford

JAMES CONANT, University of Chicago and Leipzig University

ALICE CRARY, University of Oxford

ALEXANDER GEORGE, Amherst College

HANS-JOHANN GLOCK, University of Zurich

MARTIN GUSTAFSSON, Åbo Akademi University

OSKARI KUUSELA, University of East Anglia

KATHERINE J. MORRIS, University of Oxford

SEBASTIAN SUNDAY, University of Oxford

JULIA TANNEY, independent scholar

Preface

Wittgenstein's famous example, in the opening section of the *Investigations*, of the transaction between a shopkeeper and someone who has been sent shopping with a slip of paper marked "five red apples" is followed by this equally well-known dialogue:

— It is in this and similar ways that one operates with words. — "But how does he [the shopkeeper] know where and how he is to look up the word 'red' and what he is to do with the word 'five'?" — Well, I assume that he *acts* as I have described. Explanations come to an end somewhere. — But what is the meaning of the word "five"? — No such thing was in question here, only how the word "five" is used. (PI §1)

Thus ends the opening section. This dialogue will be as intelligible, or unintelligible, to an otherwise intelligent reader as the shopkeeper example itself and the discussion of a quotation from Augustine which precede it. Most readers are likely to have many questions at this point. Is it true that one operates with words in the same way (or similar ways) as the shopkeeper? Why does Wittgenstein say "explanations come to an end somewhere," before he has even begun to give any explanation at all?

On the other hand, if a reader knows the later philosophy of Wittgenstein well, they might recognize in this brief passage several key elements of it, including Wittgenstein's conceptions of meaning as use; of rule-following as a practice; of a philosophical problem as being of the form "I don't know my way about"; his notion of a language-game as an object of comparison; and his emphasis on description over explanation in philosophy.

It is noteworthy that Wittgenstein's description of the shopkeeper example does indeed give nothing but descriptions as opposed to explanations. In the subsequent dialogue, quoted above, Wittgenstein underlines this feature of the example: first, by adding the qualification that "it is in this *and similar ways* that one operates with words"; and, second, by

refusing to give explanations in his responses to the interlocutor's questions ("Well, I assume that he *acts* as I have described"), and even adding—somewhat preposterously—that "explanations come to an end somewhere."

This latter statement ("Explanations come to an end somewhere") is perhaps the clearest indication, in this short dialogue, of the kind of interest that Wittgenstein takes in the interlocutor's two questions ("But how does he know where and how he is to look up the word 'red' and what he is to do with the word 'five'?"; "But what is the meaning of the word 'five'?"). Wittgenstein responds to these questions, which are apparently innocent, as if they embodied some kind of objectionable philosophy. This is a feature that these questions and Wittgenstein's responses to them have in common with the earlier quotation from Augustine and Wittgenstein's response to it. In both cases, Wittgenstein appears to think that there is important philosophical work to be done, although (or, perhaps, because) the relevant type of problem is less well defined than a particular philosophical view or theory; the type of problem that Wittgenstein is interested in appears to lie at a somehow deeper or more general level.

The opening section of the *Investigations* is a nutshell, in many ways. It presents various elements of Wittgenstein's philosophy in a nutshell. And, like Wittgenstein's philosophy as a whole, it too is a hard nut to crack. Given this relative inaccessibility of Wittgenstein's philosophy, it is perhaps not surprising that, nowadays, Wittgenstein scholarship—that is, the historical study of the philosopher and his philosophy—continues to thrive, while Wittgensteinian philosophy—that is, both Wittgenstein's philosophy itself and philosophy practiced in the same manner—is increasingly perceived by many philosophers as being, at best, at the periphery of current concerns and debates. Wittgenstein's influence on the analytic tradition was particularly strong, but analytic philosophers are evidently finding it increasingly difficult to see the relevance of much of Wittgenstein's work for contemporary analytic philosophy. This volume strives to repair this recent disconnection of the analytic tradition from one of its founding figures by analyzing Wittgensteinian methods and points of view both from an exegetical perspective and with a view to the contemporary significance of Wittgenstein's philosophy. For this purpose, we decided that it would be best to give our contributors the freedom to treat their subjects with varying degrees of exegetical detail. Since the volume seeks to both interpret and apply Wittgenstein's philosophy, it seemed to us that more free-spirited variations on it should be permitted, or indeed encouraged.

The thematic focus of the volume is on metaphilosophy, epistemology, and the philosophy of language. Naturally, Wittgenstein's conception of philosophy and various related issues concerning the metaphysics, epistemology, and methodology of philosophy itself figure most prominently as a topic of discussion throughout. The chapters of this volume follow no strict sequence, and may be read in any order. However, those new to Wittgenstein's philosophy would do well to start at the beginning: the first two essays are both in-depth yet accessible discussions of the nature of Wittgensteinian philosophy, with the first one developing its argument largely in the form of exegesis and the second proceeding more freely. The following six essays then bring into focus various more narrowly defined questions. The first of this group tackles one central notion for this volume head-on, namely that of objectivity; the second presents a Wittgensteinian perspective regarding the role of intuitions in philosophy; the third offers a detailed and innovative interpretation of Wittgenstein's famous remarks on what he called "aspects," with a focus on related issues regarding the cognition (or perception) of meaning; the next essay also discusses Wittgenstein's remarks on aspects, and in this way develops a new solution to a problem about the nature of perceptual experience; the fifth applies lessons from Wittgenstein's work on aspect perception to questions of conceptual creativity in philosophical analysis; and the sixth discusses (related) questions concerning Wittgenstein's method and an influential type of revisionism in analytic philosophy. The following three essays each discuss linguistic meaning. The first argues against a prominent Wittgenstein-inspired use-theory of meaning; the second develops an alternative such theory; and the third presents a response to two recent criticisms of the related view that facts about meaning—or, more specifically, semantic facts—supervene on (non-semantic) facts about the use of words and concepts. The final essay in this volume is an exam on Wittgenstein and Socrates.

Acknowledgments

We are very grateful to our fellow philosophers who have contributed to this collection, not only for the brilliance of their work but also for their patience while the volume was in preparation. And we are grateful to our commissioning editor at Cambridge University Press, Hilary Gaskin, for her constant support throughout the editing process. Finally, we wish to thank the Alexander von Humboldt Foundation and the Fritz Thyssen Foundation for funding that made completion of the project possible.