Joel Smith’s definition of empathy V: attempt at a counterexample

Abstract. I present a counterexample based on my efforts to analyse Jeanette Edwards’ book *Born and Bred*.

According to Joel Smith, person $A$ empathizes with $B$ if and only if three conditions are met:

1. $A$ is consciously aware that $B$ is $\psi$.
2. $A$ is consciously aware of what being $\psi$ feels like.
3. On the basis of (1) and (2), $A$ is consciously aware of how $B$ feels.

Are there counterexamples to this definition? Here is an attempt.

ME: Why did you write that non-Western localities are legitimate arenas of study? You should have said, “areas.” You made me make a mistake when quoting you.

JEANETTE: Well, put yourself in my shoes. A single word slip.

ME: I hate you. I don’t empathize with you.

Is Smith departing from more than just the moral aspect of ordinary usage here, because “I hate you,” suggests I am okay with a non-moral concept here. Empathy, as Smith defines it, is not functioning to produce fellow-feeling, even if I believe it was a slip. (Apologies to Professor Edwards, for this impolite example dialogue.)

References
