

# **Dance as Portrayed in the Media**

Sabrina D. Misirhiralall

The Journal of Aesthetic Education, Volume 47, Number 3, Fall 2013, pp. 72-95 (Article)

Published by University of Illinois Press



→ For additional information about this article

http://muse.jhu.edu/journals/jae/summary/v047/47.3.misirhiralall.html

# Dance as Portrayed in the Media

# SABRINA D. MISIRHIRALALL

#### 1. Introduction

In a Missouri school district during the late 1980s, parents and students argued that "the policy, reflecting the Christian fundamentalist view that social dance is sinful, violated the constitutionality required by separation of church and state." The school board in Purdy, Missouri, advocated for a policy that banned school dances. In 1986, fundamentalist Christians, a majority of the town residents, wanted to maintain the century-old ban against school dances when some school board members discussed a modification of the policy. As a result, parents and students argued against the policy, which they felt was unconstitutional. This is a clear example of dance as an educational issue in schools where school boards decide whether to advocate for dance education and school dances as a social activity.

This argument continues today as the portrayal of dance in the media is of current interest for dancers, dance educators, and viewers of the performance. Consequently, I seek to determine how knowledge construction of dance develops within the public sphere. Furthermore, I will discuss the effects that the media has on dance education. With the knowledge construction of dance epistemologically and ethically in mind, this research focuses on the way the ideology of written language is used to describe dance in the media of the Western world. The media are forms of literacy that help the public sphere access knowledge and build the public's knowledge construction of dance, yet the public sphere has the potential to influence the media's knowledge construction of dance. John E. Richardson, a scholar of newspaper discourse, states,

Sabrina D. MisirHiralall, a doctoral candidate in the Pedagogy and Philosophy program at Montclair State University and a Kuchipudi Indian classical Hindu dancer, is an active Board Member of the Society for the Study of Women Philosophers. She is also an active member of The Center for Contemplative Mind in Society and the Mid-Atlantic Region of the American Academy of Religion. During spring 2011, she co-organized a dual lecture by Nel Noddings and Virginia Held at MSU on the feminist "ethic of care." She was the featured solo performer in Contemplative Kuchipudi Dance at MSU in April 2012.

The power of journalistic language to do things and the way that social power is indexed and represented in journalistic language are particularly important to bear in mind when studying the discourse of journalism. Journalism has social effects: through its power to shape issue agendas and public discourse, it can reinforce beliefs; it can shape people's opinions not only of the world but also of their place and role in the world; or, if not shape your opinions on a particular matter, it can at the very least influence what you have opinions on; in sum, it can help shape social reality by shaping our views of social reality.<sup>2</sup>

As a result, the public sphere's epistemological and ethical framework for dance develops based on its access to knowledge about what dance is. Sometimes in the media, dance is portrayed solely as entertainment or as an exotic form of expression. I do not mean "exotic" in the traditional sense of the word, which indicates "foreign" or "out of the ordinary." Rather, I mean "exotic" in an erotic fashion. Exotic dance in the U.S. typically refers to pole dancing, lap dancing, strip teasing, and so forth. These kinds of dances are known for an erotic element. This raises an educational issue about the purpose of dance for nonexotic dancers who may not be portrayed as much in the media. The portrayal of dance in the media may impact on dance education because parents may not want their children to learn exotic dance or be a part of dance entertainment, but parents may desire a dance education for their children that will serve other purposes, such as self-development. However, adults may not be aware of the choices of dance if different types of dance are not portrayed in the media. Therefore, dance, as portrayed in the media, is an educational issue that deserves much-needed attention.

This article attempts to answer a question that many dancers and non-dancers may have. What is dance according to the media? Furthermore, how does the written word portray dance in the media? To answer these questions, this research focuses on the role that the discourse of dance in media plays in the public sphere's knowledge construction of dance. This is important to study because the public sphere's meaning of dance will determine whether dance education is promoted or banned in schools and in society. The aim of this paper is to contribute to the existing literature of dance in the media. One limitation of this contribution is that the research uses only newspaper articles as a source of analysis. Future research should include an analysis of visual and audio clips of dance as portrayed in the media.

#### 2. Review of the Research Literature

Before examining dance in the media, it is crucial to look at the literature on dance because the literature serves as a foundation for research on dance in the media. This literature review examines some of the present dance

#### 74 MisirHiralall

literature with the goal of thinking about how dance is defined in schools and in society. The literature review first focuses on the theme of dance as a part of academia. In academia, the literature discusses school curriculum, dance pedagogy, dance for physical fitness, and dance for a healthy psychological well-being. Second, the review of the literature examines the overlapping theme of class systems as present in education and in society among dancers and nondancers. The review of the literature continues with an examination of Indian classical dance in the third section. This third section is included because there is a history of class struggles present within the Indian classical dance tradition, which helps to provide background knowledge about dance education and dance in society. It is my hope that this research will lead to a distinctive project that seeks to answer a narrower question: What is dance in the Indian classical dance tradition, and how does this impact on Indian classical dance education?

#### Academia

After a preliminary examination of the literature of dance in academia, it is evident that many scholars feel that dance should be infused into the curriculum not as a separate subject area but rather as a method to teach academic-content areas, such as math, literacy, science, and social studies. For example, dance is used as a way to teach a fraction lesson in math or a science lesson about the solar system.<sup>3</sup> The literature uses the term "creative dance" to discuss dance as a way to teach academic subject areas. Sheryle Bergmann and Colla MacDonald state that there is a need to integrate creative dance into the school curriculum.<sup>4</sup> Bergmann defines creative dance as a type of dance that does not require professional dance training, but rather focuses on each student's interpretation of ideas as well as the expression of feelings. She writes,

Stanley (1977) distinguishes between functional movement, which is movement geared toward accomplishing a practical task such as kicking a ball, and expressive movement, which involves expressing a thought or feeling.<sup>5</sup>

This is the difference between physical education activities and dance because physical education activities, in this sense, seem like a robotic form of expression, whereas creative dance deals with the expression of thoughts and feelings as a way to give an idea or action meaning. Thus, it seems that Bergmann indicates that a student can kick a ball in a robotic, physical education way or kick the ball as a creative dance move that seeks to express a thought or feeling. This would give meaning to the kicking of the ball. Here, it is evident that dance is more than a means to an ends to teach academic-subject areas. Furthermore, the underlying implication is that, while dance might be a part of physical education programs in schools, dance is more

than an activity for physical fitness. Even though physiologically dance is a type of exercise that helps the human body remain healthy, dance also involves expressive movement based on thoughts and feelings. Therefore, the physiological being and the psychological being of the dancer are linked. Consequently, dance educators need to consider the physiological being and the psychological being of dance students.

This theme is further evident in the arcade game Dance Revolution, which provides a stimulus for an analysis of what dance is. According to *The New York Times*, several states use Dance Revolution as a part of their physical education programs with the hope of infusing a less competitive sport into the physical education curriculum. West Virginia, in 2007, was the leading state that advocated for Dance Revolution as a part of a physical education program that promotes physical fitness. This indicates that dance is a physical fitness activity that helps students to maintain physiological health. It is important for dance educators to acknowledge that this type of dance is a part of some physical education programs because the arcade game may impact on how the public sphere constructs knowledge of dance education.

In Dance Revolution, there is a pattern of arrows that appears on a screen. The players need to imitate the pattern on the screen using their feet:

The arcade version of Dance Revolution works like this: as strobe lights flash and music thumps out of large, neon-lit speakers, each player follows a dance sequence, symbolized by a pattern of arrows scrolling up the game screen, by stepping on the corresponding quadrants of a raised dance platform. Scores are based on the accuracy and timing of the player's steps. The game ends if the player misses too many steps.<sup>7</sup>

Irene Chien writes about the Dance Revolution arcade game as active yet passive, embodied yet disembodied, passionate yet addictive. The author explores the computational aspect of dance as well as the corporeal aspect of dance as new media. In this form of dance, the body makes sense of the computer's mathematical depiction of dance in the arcade game. The author writes,

This is not an inchoate, touchy-feely, or expressive dance, but one based on a body that is simultaneously carnal and abstract, that pushes the body's muscles to make sense of and fulfill the computer's mathematical predictability and precision, that is pre-programmed yet experienced as potential.<sup>8</sup>

This type of dance is not expressive but rather focuses on mimicking the computer's pattern of rhythmic movement. The arcade game promotes a lived experience through dance. The term "rebound" is used by the author to describe the meaning making of the player and the images on the screen.

This is where it becomes vital to think about dance as an educational issue based on how dance is portrayed in the media. This frame analysis will help determine how the media discusses dance in academia. The media's portrayal of dance may determine the place of dance in education. Moreover, if dance has a place in education, according to the media, then it is imperative to think about the teaching methods that should be implemented to teach dance. It is crucial to examine the literature of dance in academia that focuses on dance instruction.

Whether dance is used to teach academic-subject areas or as a part of physical education programs, scholars agree that teacher-education programs need to stress the aesthetic qualities of the arts. This will allow teachers to integrate the arts in the academic curriculum in an appropriate manner, as well as into physical education programs. In particular, dance education is an area of interest because many scholars believe that dance education promotes the aesthetic education of children, which is important for the academic growth of students. Jay Seitz says that the artistic consciousness of students will awaken as they seek to become aware of self-expression through dance:

Rudolf Laban maintained that aesthetic education in the movement arts strengthened the spontaneous faculties of expression and fostered artistic expression in the young. It accomplishes this by fostering awareness of the body with regard to space and rhythm, maintaining flexibility of the spine and promoting muscular development, developing the ability to communicate more effectively with peers, abetting personality development, promoting aesthetic taste and discrimination, as well as encouraging a creative attitude. This is so because rhythmic movement is the basis of art, play, and work, according to Laban and because movement injects itself into all intellective activities: the balanced flow of harmony of ordered movement.<sup>10</sup>

As a result, students self-develop once they learn to express themselves through aesthetic movement. Seitz writes about the students as the viewers of dance and also as dancers who move aesthetically. Consequently, dance educators need to consider dance students as dancers but also as members of an audience who view the performance.

Yet, some scholars believe dance is more than an aesthetic art based on expressive movement. There is a need for dance pedagogy that moves beyond the aesthetic and expressive element that defines dance. To teach dance, Tyson E. Lewis develops and writes about biopedagogy since he believes that dance is an educational practice that should be included in education programs. According to Lewis, biopedagogy is a combination of Giorgio Agamben's theory of biopower and Alain Badiou's theory of truth. Agamben's theory of biopower states that the body is a machine that disciplines

itself. This leads to social efficiency. Thus, for Agamben, life and power are tied together. Badiou's theory of truth states that truth is like a rupture that knocks on the knowledge door to introduce the new. Lewis's biopedagogy is a blend of Agamben's and Badiou's theories. For Lewis, biopedagogy includes the physiological aspect of the body as well as the mental ability to think about what truth is. The truth is communicated through the body during dance. Biopedagogy focuses on teaching dance in a way that places an emphasis on both the mind and the body. In other words, dance is used for physical fitness as well as for emotional well-being. Therefore, dance educators who implement biopedagogy will engage in a pedagogy that considers the physiological and psychological well-being of dance students.

The literature of dance in academia presents a problem to explore in the frame analysis. What is dance in education? The answer to this question will determine how teachers use dance in classrooms. It is of interest to determine how dance is used in classrooms today. This will help to explore the possibility of whether there needs to be a change regarding dance in education. Furthermore, the frame analysis of dance in the media will show if dance has a place in schools and if it is vital to think about dance pedagogy in education based on what dance is.

# Class Systems

Aside from dance in academia, the dance literature explores issues of class. Before the dance literature of class is discussed, it is important to keep in mind that, throughout the history of education, issues of class struggle have proven to have a social, cultural, and political impact on the education of students in schools. Walter Feinberg and Jonas Soltis discuss the "hidden curriculum" as an issue of class struggles. Lacording to these authors, Marxists also agree that the hidden curriculum is a curriculum in schools that functions differently for different children from different social classes. As a result, students are not offered equal opportunity in schools, despite the efforts of policy makers to ensure an equitable education for all. Samuel Bowles and Herbert Gintis elaborate on the inequities of the hidden curriculum:

We have emphasized elements on the "hidden curriculum" faced in varying degrees by all students. But schools do different things to different children. Boys and girls, blacks and whites, rich and poor are treated differently. Affluent suburban schools, working-class schools and ghetto schools all exhibit a distinctive pattern of sanctions and rewards.<sup>13</sup>

Evidently, students develop social skills based on the notions of the hidden curriculum. Moreover, the cultural background of students has an impact on how the students will be taught to participate in society. Politically, it seems that the hidden curriculum prepares elite students for elite occupations in society and prepares working-class students for working-class occupations in society.

To build on this issue of class based on the dance literature, Stacey Prickett distinguishes between bourgeois dances and proletariat dances. <sup>14</sup> While bourgeois dances focus on mechanics and form, proletariat dances have a social and political purpose. In the case of proletariat dance, dance is used as a form of protest or as a way of communicating ideas to the public with the goal of advocating for social and political agendas. Dance educators need to consider bourgeois dance and proletariat dance because they are a part of the knowledge construction of dance in the public sphere. Pricket states,

The stock market crash of 1929 signaled the beginning of the Depression, a period in which the imbalances in society were heightened. Levels of poverty, unemployment and real need grew inexorably. Discontent with economic and social conditions was amplified and dance was increasingly turned to as an expression of protest.<sup>15</sup>

During the Great Depression, dance was used as a form of protest where the public expressed its concerns about the social and political situations of the time. In addition, oppressed workers as well as minorities used dance to raise class consciousness about their particular situation. To accomplish this, group discussions were a key element in the dance of the proletariat because the discussions were the place where individuals would gain an understanding of the issues. Prickett concludes, "Instead of working within established political circles to change society, the dancers focused their energies on changing the world through their dance activities." <sup>16</sup>

Dancers focused on communicating ideas for political change through dance in the hope that the dances would stimulate thoughts and actions that would foster social and political change. In this instance, dance becomes a part of a deeper, educational issue that seeks not only to determine its place in academia but also to engage the public sphere in social discourse.

The literature posits a problem that deals with the purpose of dance from a social and political perspective. Based on the dance literature, there is an indication that dance is defined based on class systems. Here, the purpose of dance differs for individuals from different classes. If this is granted, then this means that dance pedagogy will differ for individuals based on class. Thus, there is a need to explore this issue of class further in the media. This frame analysis will help determine whether an issue of class is present within schools and in society today in dance education.

#### Indian Classical Dance

The dance literature of Indian classical dance provides further examples of social and political struggles within the dance world. This is primar-

ily because of the caste system in India, which may be discussed from a Hindu religious perspective or an Indian cultural perspective. According to the Indian caste system, Brahmans are a part of the upper-class nobility. From the cultural perspective of politicians, Indian classical dance is seen as a middle-class art, which upper-class women should be skilled in but not publicly perform. In other words, Brahman women are not encouraged to dance publicly. As a result, many dance educators in India adhere to the laws implemented in the political sphere due to the caste system. Because of the social and political nature of Indian classical dance, I have included dance literature that explores these issues.

As the literature explores the purpose of dance in Indian society, the literature investigates the traditional guru/shishya system of traditional Indian classical dancers. The pedagogy of the system is discussed as a system where students (*shishyas*) become a part of the teacher's (guru's) family life. <sup>19</sup> In some cases, students even take the last name of their teachers. In this system, only children from certain social classes are accepted into the gurus' homes to learn from the gurus who, according to Ananya Chatterjea, are transmitters of knowledge to the students:

I dwell on the ideals and practices inherent in this tradition because this relationship between the giver and receiver of knowledge is a prime factor in structuring the mode of training.<sup>20</sup>

Chatterjea says that students should not question the guru but just do as told. Because the guru teaches the students, students are expected to show respect at all times for the guru:

One begins and ends the training session by touching the guru's feet as a mark of respect; one appropriately lowers one's eyes when the guru scolds vigorously: all this is part of a learned behavior system that is still part of the training in classical dance and some of the performing arts.<sup>21</sup>

In this case, respect is seen as always listening to the guru and not engaging in debate.

Nevertheless, this form of respect is not always given to dance gurus in a university setting. There is an underlying issue about who has the authority to teach Indian classical dance and how respect should be shown to teachers. Chatterjea goes on to describe contemporary gurus who are a part of the university setting. Indian universities have tried to maintain the guru/shishya system but have found it difficult because teachers are no longer responsible for students once they leave class.<sup>22</sup> From this point on, dance became infused into a variety of traditions and was even used to further the agendas of social and political causes. Dance education in the Indian classical dance tradition began to change.

In particular, dance became infused in the Hindu temples of India. Devadasis were temple dancers who were given a house, food, and a financial income for living expenses.<sup>23</sup> Even though girls are born into the devadasi system, a girl who desires to be a devadasi could seek approval from the king. Because of the social norms, some would say that the devadasis were not pure girls but were rather similar to prostitutes. Janet O'Shea writes,

As devadasis were not married to mortals, they were not required to be eternally faithful to one man as is prescribed for many Hindu women. The devadasis were not required to be chaste and thus were permitted more freedom to travel about in the outside world. They were also among the only women of their time who were educated to read and write. Because devadasi families were matrilineal, the family's wealth was controlled by females: it passed from mother to daughter.<sup>24</sup>

Just because the devadasis were not expected to be chaste, this does not mean that they chose to behave like prostitutes. The devadasis were educated women who were capable of making ethical decisions. Nevertheless, British missionaries viewed the devadasi system as a human rights violation. Because of this, the British missionaries helped eradicate the devadasi system through colonization. At that point, the missionaries began to spread Christianity through India. Dance pedagogy has now become an educational issue of colonization and decolonization based on how dance is defined. The British missionaries felt the need to colonize dance education in India, whereas many Indians still feel the need to engage in a decolonization of dance to return to the intended purpose of the dance. Despite the colonization efforts of the British, religious dance still survives even though historical changes have occurred.

This is because Indian classical dancers use dance as means of destroying the ego, ignorance, and other demonic qualities, while simultaneously cultivating virtuous qualities. In Indian classical dances, the ancient epics are used to teach virtue through the dances. According to Sharada Srinivasan, dance, in this sense, is a form of Bhakti worship in which the dancer seeks to mystically unite with God. <sup>26</sup>

The literature of Indian classical dance presents a stimulus for thought about who should learn dance, who has the authority to teach dance, and who should dance in the public sphere. These are educational questions that need to be given attention, but they are not the focus of this study. Rather, the focus of this study is to think about what dance is. The literature of Indian classical dance provides a particular example of the social and political issues that this frame analysis needs to address as the research seeks to determine what dance is in schools and in society. As the research examines the

portrayal of dance in the media, it is crucial to keep in mind the issues that are present in the Indian classical dance literature because these same issues will prove to be relevant during the analysis.

# 3. Methodology

### Lens

The methodological lens for this study uses critical discourse analysis to study the discourse of dance in the *New York Times* as an educational issue in schools and in society. This critical discourse analysis helps determine the meaning of dance based on the textual articles. Robert M. Entman defines framing for critical discourse analysis as

few elements of perceived reality and assembling a narrative that highlights connections among them to promote a particular interpretation. Fully developed frames typically perform four functions: problem definition, causal analysis, moral judgment, and remedy promotion. . . . Framing works to shape and alter audience members' interpretations and preferences through priming.<sup>27</sup>

Thus, this research on dance in the media focuses on identifying the problem within the text, the stakeholders, experts, who is to blame for the problem, and the proposed solutions based on what the articles say. These frames are crucial to examine because they will help determine how written language is used to frame the discourse of dance in the media and how this impacts on dance education.

#### Data

The newspaper articles used from the media for the research are from a Lexis Nexis search that focuses on the retrieval of news articles from the *New York Times*. The *New York Times* provides adequate access to articles that helps build the research because of the detailed reports on education and the arts. For the purposes of this research project, I used the key terms "religious dance," "dance education," and "dance" to search the *New York Times* database. A search for "religious dance" articles with the publication title of the *New York Times* yielded 5,296 articles; "dance education" yielded 8,527 articles; "dance" yielded 115,120 articles. The search needed to be narrowed to meet the manageability of this project. Thus, articles were selected from each of the searches for the first round of coding based on whether the abstract of the articles provided a context for the determination of what dance is. A total of seventy-seven articles were originally examined during the first round of coding based on the articles' relation to schools and dance as portrayed in society. Articles were excluded based on the following criteria:

religious dance on an international level advertisements for independent dance studios reviews of school dances reviews of individual dancers

After reading the seventy-seven articles, I decided to include forty-nine of the articles and exclude twenty-eight in the second round of coding. The included forty-nine articles focus on dance education as well as on how dance is generally portrayed in the media. The excluded articles, despite the abstracts, did not relate to dance education, focused on specific individuals' dance careers, or advertised dance. I then reread each article in the second round of coding, to scrutinize the way the media presented the problem, determine who the stakeholders were, determine who the experts were, determine who was to blame for the problem, and also check for the proposed solutions within the article.

During the third round of coding, I categorized the articles into two large categories: dance in education and dance in society. I chose these two category titles because dance is an educational issue within the educational sphere and also within the public sphere. Keep in mind that these categories are not meant to be separate, distinct labels, but rather overlap with one another. After, I continued to categorize the data as I developed four large themes based on dominant key words. This means that, while many key terms are used across the articles, the articles are categorized based on the key word that appeared the most. The key words of the dance education theme are "dance" and "education." The key words of the social and political class theme are "dance" and "class." The key words of the self-development theme are "dance" and words that imply epistemology or self-development. For example, key words such as "self-confidence," "self-esteem," "meaningful activity," and "social skills" were used to group the articles into this theme. The key words "religious dance," "dance," "traditional," "modern," and "nude" were used to group articles into the theme of religious dance.

Following the third round of coding, I conducted a fourth round as I further categorized the four macro themes into micro themes. The subcategories for each theme are based on the focus of the articles. The first theme of dance in education focused on the subthemes of curriculum, purpose, and meaning of dance in education and dance in higher education. The second theme of the social and political struggles of dance focused on class systems, the public sphere's access to dance education, and dance as a form of entertainment. The third theme of self-development focused on the epistemology of dance and personal development of dancers. The fourth theme of religious dance focused on dance as traditional, modern, and controversial. The following table summarizes the themes of the macro and micro elements of the data:

Table 1.

Total Data Set n = 49				
Dance in Education (education theme)	Curriculum n = 8	Purpose and Meaning n = 5	Higher Education n = 3	Total n = 16
Social and Political Class Struggles (education and society themes)	Class n = 5	Access n = 6	Entertainment n = 3	Total n = 14
Self- Development (In society theme)	Epistemology n = 3	Personal Development n = 5		Total n = 8
Religious Dance (In society theme)	Traditional n = 3	Modern n = 4	Controversy/ Nude Dance n = 4	Total n = 11

# 4. Analysis and Discussion

The first big theme in the data set focuses on dance in education, whereas the second big theme focuses on dance in society. First, I explore dance in education, which is followed by an analysis of the portrayal of dance in society. As mentioned earlier, keep in mind that the themes of dance in education and society overlap.

#### Dance in Education

To begin with, sixteen articles within the data set portray dance as a part of elementary, secondary, and/or higher education. Eight articles focus on the integration of dance into the elementary and secondary curriculum. For example, in the article "Arts Program Infuses a School with Joy," Katherine Damkohler, principal of a Roman Catholic elementary and middle school wonders why "bubbly" kindergarteners become "sullen" middle school students. According to the article, the arts are not ingrained in schools but need to be infused into the curriculum. However, some arts education programs do not teach teachers how to teach the arts. In this case, dance and the arts are presented as a means to an end to teach academic-content areas.

The data set indicates that teachers lack knowledge of the arts, which influences their ability to teach the arts. For example, the article "Teaching Teachers to Put Arts Back in Classroom" discusses the Arts Excel Grant that provides workshops for teachers to learn to integrate the arts into their lesson plans.<sup>29</sup> There is a need for professional development for teachers because teachers lack the expertise needed to infuse the arts into the curriculum. Furthermore, it seems that there is teacher resistance to teaching the

arts. Reporter Abby Goodnough states, "Some institutions report tensions with teachers who say the programs occupy too much of their time." In this case, the dance and the arts are pedagogical issues as teachers need to integrate pedagogy of the arts with content-area pedagogy.

In essence, the news sources indicate that, even though teachers receive professional development, some teachers are resistant to infusing dance into the curriculum. Thus, students are sometimes taught dance by unenthusiastic teachers who have no desire to teach in this area. One way students construct knowledge of dance education is based on how their teachers teach. Thus, aside from the question of what is dance, there is a need for future research to think about who should teach dance. As the literature showed earlier, this is an educational issue that deserves attention.

Seven articles that focused on curriculum state that dance should be used to teach academic-content areas such as literacy, math, science, and social studies. In other words, as the literature review indicated, teachers use dance to teach a fraction lesson in math or a lesson on the solar system in science. Aside from academic-content areas, one article discussed dance as a part of a physical education program. A physical education teacher needs to learn to teach dance, according to the article "New York Day by Day." Another article, "Tapping into the Many Ways Children Think and Learn," states,

Kathleen Gaffney, who founded Artsgenesis in 1991 with her husband, Roger Shea, said she believed that teachers should study the theory to recognize each pupil's strengths, then enhance those strengths through the arts.<sup>32</sup>

According to "Education; Curriculum Changes: A Sampler on Science and the Arts, students need to know how to "interpret the meanings expressed in works of dance, music, theater, and visual arts." 33

Elementary school administrators seem to want to use dance as a means to teach academic-content areas. The articles that maintain this focus on dance in education build around the terms "school curriculum" and "physical fitness." The media portray dance as a means to an end. Some schools infuse dance into physical education programs or as an after-school activity, but dance is not considered a special subject in public schools. Despite the positive portrayal of dance as a therapy and a way to build self-concept, elementary schools do not seem to think about this. The actual subject of dance is not given much attention in the elementary schools except as a means to an end. This implies that dance is not seriously considered in education. Consequently, dance educators and dance pedagogy are not taken seriously in education.

Five articles focus on the purpose and meaning of dance education. According to the article "Dancing through Life," the country does not un-

derstand the purpose of dance education.<sup>34</sup> The article indicates that the Dance Theatre of Harlem seeks to reignite a passion for the arts as it works with public school teachers and encourage them to integrate the arts into the curriculum. However, in some cases, dances are passed down to other dancers who rely on "body memory." In the article "Critic's Notebook: Some Esthetic Problems in Reviving Old Dances," the reporter writes, "Miss Sherman said, 'that to be able to capture the conviction and spirit of these seminal theatrical dances is more important than letter-perfect reconstruction of steps." Thus, there is a difference between the pedagogy of dance teachers who seek to transfer dance knowledge through repetitive choreography and the pedagogy of dance teachers who seek to teach students through the cultivation of creativity.

Here, the findings in the data set indicate that dance is a creative art that moves beyond body memory. This implies that teachers need to understand how to foster the creative nature of the dancer, as opposed to passing down memorized choreography. The media, in this case, portray dance as more than a means to an end. Dance is a creative form of art that has the ability to serve different purposes. While the media indicate that dance should be infused into the academic curriculum as a way to teach math, literacy, social studies, and science, the media also indicate that dance is more than a means to an end. Rather, teachers should use dance to foster creativity in students. This implies that dance educators and dance pedagogy needs to be considered in an educational public sphere.

Two of the five articles focus on a ruling about school dances in Missouri, which was mentioned at the beginning of this article. Judge Russell Clark in 1988 "declared the school's century-old ban on dances unconstitutional." The judge did not understand why the school board wanted him to rule on whether the school district could have or not have school dances. Parents and students argued that "the policy, reflecting the Christian fundamentalist view that social dance is sinful, violated the constitutionality required by separation of church and state," according to the Greenhouse article. The Court of Appeals overturned Judge Clark's ruling, stating that dancing is a "secular" activity and that a prohibition against school dances could be defended as an appropriately "neutral" policy, whatever the motivation behind it. The court of the c

The findings stimulate the public sphere to think about whether dance is sinful in an educational setting. This might help determine if dance is welcomed as an art in schools. The media portray dance, in some cases, as sinful but, in other cases, as not sinful. This is discussed further in depth in the theme that focuses on religious dance because there is a controversy in the media about whether dance is a religious, sinless art, or a nonreligious, sinful art. The media build a case for both sides of the discourse. Thus, it is up to the public sphere to determine which side of the debate makes the most sense.

Three articles discuss a negative portrayal of dance in higher education. According to the article "Practice, Practice, Practice. Go to College? Maybe," "The utility of a college degree in dancing is a matter of endless debate." In other words, it is hard to find stable, paying jobs in the field of dance. This raises an important question for dancers. Should dancers attend college for dance education? The article indicates that they should not, as the reporter writes,

In the 1980s and 90s, most of these programs migrated out of the gym and into the fine-arts departments. Even so, most are not designed to train professional performers. A star or two may emerge every few years, but many more alum become teachers or scholars, or leave the field entirely. Some administrators say their programs flourished simply because people love to dance.<sup>39</sup>

The pedagogy of dance educators in higher education seems to place more of a focus on dance history as opposed to dance technique. As a result, most dance training takes place in independent dance studios. Mark Morris states, "Most college-level dance education should be pedagogy and criticism and history and theory and whatever may not be about performing dance." This is because most dancers who attend college for dance do so to teach as opposed to establish a professional dance career. In addition, there is a focus on a college education for those dancers who desire to dance long term. The article states,

Not going to college at all gives young dancers a head start on what in many cases is a short career, and it remains the norm for professional ballet dancers. Modern dance is physically more permissive, but still mainly a young person's pursuit; those who rise through the ranks outside academia may be at a disadvantage when it comes to finding teaching jobs after they retire from the stage.<sup>41</sup>

Here, we have an interesting underlying debate in the media about whether dance has more relevance as an academic subject area that is studied in college or as a vocation that is studied in an independent studio. The findings suggest that dance is a major in college that is not given as much serious attention as other majors because, even though dancers graduate with dance degrees, there are not many jobs on the market that will hire dancers because dancers who attend college seem to lack training. Thus, the job market for dancers seems to favor dancers who trained in independent studios. Yet, dancers who desire a long-term career need to attend college and receive a dance education. This leads the research to the question of whether dance is a subject of the arts or a vocational trade. It seems that the media indicate that dance is both a subject of the arts that is studied in college but also is a vocational trade that is studied in independent dance studios. More importantly, the media present dance as an intertwined art that requires a college

education that focuses on dance history as well as dance theory but also requires the training of a dancer in dance technique.

Furthermore, the media indicate that dance is not recognized as a component of a liberal arts education by many in higher education. This is particularly true in Ivy League schools. In the past, dance was a sport for women to engage in as a part of physical fitness without the competitive nature of masculine sports. According to Clauda L. Rocco, "Many dance professionals working within academia reinforce the prejudice that there is nothing intellectual about dance, focusing too much on mechanics." Professor Joseph Roach wants to find a place for dance at Yale. It seems that the hope for dance at Yale is to focus on the intellectual aspect as well as the physical aspect of dance. Currently, though, Rocco reports that

[i]t is hard to believe that dance can be taken seriously at Yale while studios consist mainly of minuscule, ill-ventilated, improperly floored spaces tucked into residential basements and gymnasium nooks and crannies.<sup>43</sup>

Yale University and Harvard University are regarded as two of the most prestigious schools in the nation. If Yale and Harvard do not take dance as a serious part of the arts curriculum, then other universities and colleges may also disregard dance education. Nevertheless, some faculty in Ivy League schools hope to give dance a prestigious place in higher education. As of now, though, the media indicate that Ivy League schools do not value dance as an important part of the academics. Harvard focuses only on the physical side of dance. In other words, dance pedagogy is implemented in a manner that solely focuses on the physiological well-being of dance students. The findings speak to the debate regarding whether dance has an important place in higher education.

There is also concern about the prestige of and financial access to dance in professional dance programs. Author Roberta Hershenson, in the article "Ballet Theater and SUNY Team Up," indicates that finances are to blame for a lack of resources for dancers. <sup>44</sup> There is a partnership between Purchase College and the American Ballet Theatre in which both institutions pool their financial resources to cover the expenses of dance education. Here, we see evidence of higher education collaborating with an independent dance studio because of a financial need to cover expenses.

# Social and Political Class Struggles: Education and Society

Fourteen articles focus on social and political aspects of dance. Five of the fourteen articles deal with dance as a part of a class system in society. In particular, there are class struggles within the elementary schools, which are seen through dance. According to the article "Ballroom Dance Resurgence Reaches Classrooms," school children need to learn poise and social

grace since they lack this quality.<sup>45</sup> Therefore, Public School 115 in New York mandated that all fourth- and fifth-graders learn ballroom dancing. To illustrate further, Michael Scott, a former Chicago board president, sees a need to develop peaceful interaction among students.<sup>46</sup> Because of this intention, "Having a Ball" is a twenty-week ballroom dance course that occurs three times a week in fifteen Chicago public elementary schools. Dances taught include the cha-cha, waltz, paso doble, the tango, and jive. (Finances may cause the program to end, as the article indicates.) Dance educators who adhere to this intention of dance implement dance pedagogy that focuses on cultivating the social graces of the dance students. While dance is not used in this instance as a means to achieve an academic end, it is used as a means to cultivate the socialization skills of students.

Evidently, the purpose of dance is seen in this instance as a form of social grace where the dancer is expected to perfect a routine. This sends a message regarding class systems to the public sphere about what constitutes "real" dance and "real" dance education. The media construct dance to seem as if it is an activity performed by people who have the etiquette of social grace and poise. Thus, in this case, some will consider ballet as a "real" form of dance but will not consider square dancing as a "real" form of dance that promotes social grace and poise. The media send an underlying message that some forms of dance, such as square dancing, are dances for the working class that does not seek to cultivate social grace and poise. This shows that dance education is an educational issue for the public sphere to think about while considering the purpose of the dance and whether the class backgrounds of the students will determine the type of dance education that they receive.

To elaborate on this point further, the article "Ballet: Auspicious Debut," speaks to the issue of "real dance." The article provokes this question: "Is talent just in the eye of the beholder?" There is an underlying problem based on the following quote:

Petite and perfectly proportioned, with supple back, beautiful turnout and classical body placement, Miss Raffa has been coached by Mrs. Taub-Darvash to use her head, her shoulders, her arms in a ballerina phrasing that carries her far beyond textbook correctness. The joy of dancing is in her. Her one flaw is occasionally weak toe work, which can still be corrected. Yet, as she proved in her solos and her pas de deux with Fernando Bujones, this does not mean she has weak technique. Her finishes were perfect, her pirouettes strong and she went through her many fouettes with flying colors.<sup>48</sup>

The issue deals with what counts as "real" dance and why it counts as "real" dance. The media present dance as a sport for perfectly proportioned individuals who are expected to act with grace and poise. This is because "real" dance is based on the notion that dancers have perfect bodies and move

gracefully with ease through flawless movements. However, this is not what dance should be. Dance is more than this need for bodily perfection. At this point, I urge the public sphere to think about the consequences for this meaning of dance. It seems that the need for bodily perfection can lead to serious psychological issues for dancers, such as eating disorders or other psychological trauma due to the need to be perfect. Dance educators need to consider the psychological effects that the pressure of perfection has on dance students. This presentation of dance in the media sparks a need for research about the psychological issues that dancers may need to deal with based on how these dancers define dance.

Rather than strive for perfection, many dancers practice equanimity, which is a mental composure of serenity and calmness. Equanimity causes dancers to be mentally agile, physically agile, and in many instances, long lived. According to the article "Dance View: Why Laughter Is Often a Dancer's Partner," "By recognizing the importance of each moment and by using all moments well, dancers may transcend mere temporality." This indicates that the purpose of dance is to move beyond the body. In this sense, dance is more than a physical activity. Dance seeks to transcend the physical aspects of the body and move into a spiritual realm. Dance educators may benefit greatly from implementing a contemplative pedagogy that focuses on mindfulness, equanimity, and transcendence as a type of dance pedagogy. Contemplative pedagogy is a type of pedagogy that the Center for Contemplative Mind in Higher Education implements in an interdisciplinary form.<sup>50</sup>

Six of the fourteen articles focus on access to dance education. The article "Rite of Spring as a Rite of Passage" quotes the dancer Maldoom Young: "People who are traditionally denied access to the 'high arts' have extraordinary potential and can act as a catalyst for meaningful development within the community at large." Some families have access to dance education at a YMCA, whereas others have access to pricey ballet classes. The parents of the Hackensack school system want their children to have access to a cultured type of civilized dance. As a result, the Center for Modern Dance Education collaborates with Hackensack schools to teach dance. Scholarships and grants are available to help parents financially access dance education for their children.

The issue of class is evident as parents of the Hackensack school system believe that the elite dance classes help the students of their community become civilized. How will dance accomplish this task? It seems as though the parents think of dance as a means of developing social grace. As a result, they seek access to dance education because they feel it helps their children become cultured, like the elite, in society. The underlying issue here deals with dance for the elite and dance for the working class. It seems that dance

for the elite, in the eyes of the media, is used to develop social grace and etiquette, whereas dance for the working class has a different purpose. As mentioned before, dance for the working class may have the purpose of promoting social and political agendas as opposed to developing social grace and etiquette.

The last three of the fourteen articles focus on dance as a form of entertainment. There is a debate about how dance should be socially and politically portrayed in the media. Some dancers portray themes related to class during the dances. Gender is also an issue in entertainment because males and females are conditioned to fulfill certain roles in society due to issues related to gender identity. In this sense, dance might be defined differently according to gender. Furthermore, dance might serve a different purpose for males compared to females. This implies that dance educators need to consider the individual identity of students, which includes gender, when implementing dance pedagogy.

# Self-Development: Dance in Society

The next theme deals with dance as means of self-development and epistemology. Out of eight articles, five focus on dance for the purpose of self-development. According to the data set, dance builds self-esteem and self-confidence. Three of the eight articles discuss the need to use dance as a way to explore meaning within the world and determine how we know what is known. To accomplish this task, the data say that thinking and discussing are parts of dance. Moreover, dance teachers should not transfer choreography to the students but rather seek to open students' minds through creative choreography. All three articles advocate for a creative type of dance pedagogy.

Despite the attempt of dance educators to engage in creative dance pedagogy, Jack Anderson uses the term "non-dancers" to describe some who dance. This seems to indicate that "non-dancers" are not "real dancers." The underlying issue deals with what dance is for dancers and "non-dancers." Anderson writes in "Dance View; Extraordinary Dances for Non-dancers,"

Other choreographers who continued to work with non-dancers concentrated on devising rituals that may have had spiritual or psychotherapeutic value for the participants, but which were not intended for theatrical presentation.<sup>53</sup>

The findings of the media indicate that "non-dancers" who dance for psychotherapeutic reasons are not "real" dancers. Thus, it seems that the media leans toward defining dance as a robotic form of bodily movement that is used to develop etiquette as opposed to defining dance as a physical activity that helps the dancer's self-development through psychotherapeutic elements.

# Religious Dance in Society

Aside from dance as a means of self-development, the next theme focuses on religious dance as an educational issue in the public sphere. Out of nine articles, three articles discuss dance as a part of religious tradition. Thus, dance educators are embedded in a history of the religious traditions of dance. For this reason, it is vital for dance educators to learn about this. One article on Tibetan dance states that Buddhist monks plan to make an effort to reestablish traditional Buddhist dances because these dances are an important part of the tradition as opposed to solely an aesthetic art. In this case, the Buddhist monks are the dance educators who implement dance pedagogy from a religious perspective. The reporter writes,

The general aim of the dances is a seeking of enlightenment and wisdom. The concept of impermanence in the phenomenal world was embodied in the first dance, subsequent to a magnificent if small scale introduction by the musicians on their drums, cymbals and their astounding long horns.<sup>54</sup>

Similarly, one dancer discusses Yemenite dances inspired by the Bible as a source of learning about Yemenite traditions.<sup>55</sup> In addition to this, dance ministries seek to help dancers connect the mind and body. Michael Edwards Ronnings, a pastor and leader of an evangelical dance company, is described in the following way by reporter Cathy L. Grossman:

He answers with Psalms that swirl with joy. He cites Miriam in Exodus and King David dancing before the ark. He delves into church history, explaining that Christmas and Easter "carols" were choreography for entire villages of worshippers, like pre-medieval line dancing. As Western religions became more hierarchical and women were pushed into the background, dancing faded away.<sup>56</sup>

The terms "praise dance," "liturgical dance," and "religious dance" are used to discuss dance in the religious sphere. Negative portrayals of dance in the religious sphere use the term "sinful." There seems to be an underlying distinction between the terms "religious" and "spiritual." The articles that use the term "religious" discuss dance in connection to a cosmic being. The term "spiritual" is used in the media to portray dance as a way to self-develop, as well as gain an epistemological understanding of the world.

Four of the nine articles discuss dance as a modern art form within the public sphere as opposed to a traditional art form within the religious sphere. Dance, in this sense, is seen as an alternative form of worship. Two articles discuss the controversy between what defines dance. Glen Tetley's choreography does not see where the line between the sensual and the spiritual is, as discussed in "Dances Born of Vision, Not a Set of Rules." Similarly, in another article, the dance company Pilobolus says that there is a fine

line between religious and erotic dance.<sup>58</sup> In addition, there is a distinction between exotic and nude dance. Exotic dance is portrayed in the media as dance with "pasties" and "g-strings," whereas nude dance is dance done in the nude.<sup>59</sup>

Based on the analysis, for some, dance is a sinless art of worship that has ancient roots, whereas, for others, dance is a modern form of religious worship that does not have ancient roots. Furthermore, for some, dance is a sinful art that fulfills sensual purposes through the exposure of the human body. Depending on the views of dance educators, the pedagogy of teachers vary based on their philosophy of dance.

# 5. Sociological Perspective

Based on this analysis, "functionalists," as described by Alan Sadovnik, explain dance in terms of how dance functions in society. The data show dances ranging from square dancing in schools to schools that teach students ballet. There is a social inequality that exists in dance education in schools and in society. The working class has access to "working-class" dance styles such as square dancing, whereas the upper class has access to "upper-class" dance styles such as ballet. Functionalists may agree that dance serves the purpose of maintaining class structures in schools and in society. These class structures are present because of an unequal distribution of resources. This system of inequality will not end unless a meritocratic system allows all individuals to have access to the dance education that they desire.

Unlike functionalists, "conflict theorists" see the social and political class struggles of dance in the media as an important reason for the unequal distribution of dance education in society. One major issue deals with financial access to dance education. Schools that have financial resources from grants, charitable donations, and so forth have the opportunity to host dance education programs, whereas many schools do not have financial resources to use for dance education programs. Likewise, unlike families of the elite, working-class families cannot afford the expensive dance classes that independent dance studios offer. Thus, conflict theorists would agree that financial access creates a social and political struggle for access to dance education.

Nevertheless, conflict theorists may believe that we can overcome this inequality in dance by working toward social change. In a society where some dancers are viewed as exploited and oppressed, the public can work toward defining the purpose of dance despite the media's portrayal of dance. In this sense, the public sphere contributes to each other's knowledge construction of dance, and the media build around this. There might be a need to oppress sinful dance and exotic dance, but this is a decision that needs to be made based on the status quo. In turn, this will determine

how dance is presented in the future in the media. Before this can occur, there needs to be more discourse about what dance education is and how it should be portrayed in the media.

#### 6. Conclusion

There are a few limitations with this critical discourse analysis of the portrayal of dance in the media. I would like to gather more data to explore each theme in depth as a separate project. To illustrate, a study of dance in the elementary schools may focus on the debate of the purpose of dance. Should dance be used to teach academic-content areas, used as a part of physical fitness programs, or taught as a separate subject? Moreover, what types of dance should be taught, if any, in working-class districts as opposed to upper-class districts?

In addition to the exploration of dance in academia, it would be interesting to analyze in detail the debate in the religious sphere about dance. Is dance sinful or religious? Dance is an educational issue in the religious sphere because some believe dance has ancient religious roots, whereas others believe it does not. Here, a historical analysis of dance will help find the answer to this educational question. Furthermore, it would be helpful to determine how exotic dance helps build the public sphere's knowledge of what dance is. It seems as if the public sphere may have more access to exotic dance than religious dance, and this, in turn, may influence the public sphere's knowledge construction of dance. Thus, this would be a great question to explore during further discourse.

In conclusion, this research opens several avenues for further research about dance as an educational issue within the media. Evidently, the public sphere's knowledge construction of dance is based on the portrayal of dance in the media. Based on this research, dance in the media presents social and political struggles, which urge society to determine what dance is, what the goals of dance are, and how to build knowledge of dance. Moreover, the media needs to portray dance in its rightful place in the world of education.

#### Notes

- Linda Greenhouse, "Supreme Court Lets Stand a Missouri Town's Ban on School Dances," The New York Times, April 17, 1990, sec. A, 22.
- 2. John E. Richardson, *Analysing Newspapers: An Approach from Critical Discourse Analysis* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007).
- 3. Sheryle Bergmann, "Creative Dance in the Education Curriculum: Justifying the Umabiguous," *Canadian Journal of Education* 20, no. 2 (1995): 156–65.
- 4. Ibid.; Colla J. MacDonald, "Creative Dance in Elementary Schools: A Theoretical and Practical Justification," Canadian Journal of Education / Revue canadienne de l'éducation 16, no. 4 (1991): 434–41.

- 5. Bergmann, "Creative Dance in the Education Curriculum," 159.
- 6. Seth Schiesel, "Video Game Revolutionizing Physical Education," *The New York Times*, May 1, 2007.
- 7. Irene Chien, "This Is Not a Dance," Film Quarterly 59, no. 3 (2006): 22–34.
- 8. Ibid., 22.
- 9. Jay A. Seitz, "Mind, Dance, and Pedagogy," *The Journal of Aesthetic Education* 36, no. 4 (2002): 37–42.
- 10. Ibid., 39.
- 11. Tyson E. Lewis, "Philosophy—Aesthetics—Education: Reflections on Dance," *The Journal of Aesthetic Education* 41, no. 4 (2007): 53–66.
- 12. Walter Feinberg and Jonas F. Soltis, *School and Society* (New York: Teachers College Press, 2009).
- 13. Samuel Bowles and Herbert Gintis, "Broken Promises," in *Sociology of Education: A Critical Reader*, ed. Alan R. Sadovnik (New York: Routledge, 2011), 62.
- 14. Stacey Prickett, "Dance and the Workers' Struggle," *The Journal of the Society for Dance Research* 8, no. 1 (1990): 47–61.
- 15. Ibid., 52.
- 16. Ibid., 60.
- 17. Janet O'Shea, "'Traditional' Indian Dance and the Making of Interpretive Communities," *Asian Theatre Journal* 15, no. 1 (1998): 47.
- 18. Ibid
- 19. Ananya Chatterjea, "Training in Indian Classical Dance: A Case Study," *Asian Theatre Journal* 13, no. 1 (1996): 68–91.
- 20. Ibid., 69.
- 21. Ibid., 71.
- 22. Ibid., 83.
- 23. O'Shea, "'Traditional' Indian Dance," 49.
- 24. Ibid., 50.
- 25. Ibid.
- 26. Sharada Srinivasan, "Shiva as a 'Cosmic Dancer': On Pallava Origins for the Nataraja Bronze," *World Archaeology* 36, no. 3 (2004): 446.
- 27. Robert M. Entman, "Framing Bias: Media in the Distribution of Power," *Journal of Communication* 57, no. 1 (2007): 164.
- 28. Roberta Hershenson, "Ballet Theatre and SUNY Team Up," *The New York Times*, September 25, 1994, A4.
- 29. "Teaching Teachers to Put Arts Back in Classroom," *The New York Times*, September 8, 1993, E1.
- 30. Abby Goodnough, "Helping City Schools Bring a Taste of the Arts to Students," *The New York Times*, November 10, 1999, sec. B15, 2.
- 31. Laurie Johnston and Susan Heller Anderson, "New York Day by Day," *The New York Times*, July 11, 1983, B3.
- 32. Abby Goodnough, "Tapping Into the Many Ways Children Think and Learn," *The New York Times*, May 12, 1996.
- 33. "Education; Curriculum Changes: A Sampler on Science and the Arts," *The New York Times*, February 11, 1996.
- 34. "Dancing through Life," The New York Times, January 16, 2005, sec. 4A, 46.
- 35. Jennifer Dunning, "Critic's Notebook: Some Esthetic Problems in Reviving Old Dances," *The New York Times*, July 22, 1982, sec. C, 22.
- 36. Greenhouse, "Supreme Court Lets Stand a Missouri Town's Ban on School Dances," C16.
- 37. Ibid.
- 38. Erika Kinetz, "Practice, Practice, Practice. Go to College? Maybe," *The New York Times*, December 21, 2005, sec. E1.
- 39. Ibid.
- 40. Ibid.

- 41. Ibid.
- 42. Clauda L. Rocco, "Mind and Body at Yale," *The New York Times*, September 23, 2007, "Dance."
- 43. Ibid.
- 44. Roberta Hershenson, "Ballet Theatre and SUNY Team Up," *The New York Times*, September 25, 1994.
- 45. Leslie Kaufman, "Ballroom Dance Resurgence Reaches Classrooms," *The New York Times*, April 21, 2005.
- Jessica Reaves, "Money Woes May Imperil Dance Program," The New York Times, May 27, 2010.
- 47. Anna Kisselgoff, "Ballet: Auspicious Debut," *The New York Times*, October 20, 1980.
- 48. Ibid.
- 49. Jack Anderson, "Dance View: Why Laughter Is Often a Dancer's Partner," *The New York Times*, August 27, 1989.
- 50. Arthur Zajonc, "Contemplative and Transformative Pedagogy," Kosmos Journal 5, no. 1 (2006): 1–3.
- 51. Christopher Atamian, "'Rite of Spring' as Rite of Passage," *The New York Times*, November 11, 2007.
- 52. Jack Anderson, "Dance View: Extraordinary Dancers for Non-dancers," *The New York Times*, August 23, 1981, sec. A, 12.
- 53. Ibid.
- 54. Anna Kisselgoff, "Dance View: Tibetan Dances Blend Spirituality and Expressivity," *The New York Times*, August 9, 1981, sec. A, 6.
- 55. Jack Anderson, "Yemenite Traditions Inspired Inbal Dancers," *The New York Times*, September 19, 1986.
- 56. Cathy L. Grossman, "Setting Devotion in Motion Spiritual Dance Troupes Lift Minds, Bodies at Religious Services," *USA Today*, April 4, 2000, D9.
- 57. Anna Kisselgoff, "Dances Born of Vision, Not a Set of Rules," *The New York Times*, September 6, 2006, sec. E, 1.
- 58. Anna Kisselgoff, "Dance: Pilobolus Opens at the Joyce," *The New York Times*, February 6, 1985, sec. C, 19.
- 59. Judith L. Hanna, "Wrapping Nudity in a Cloak of Law," *The New York Times*, July 29, 2001.
- Alan R. Sadovnik, "Theory and Research in the Sociology of Education," in Sociology of Education: A Critical Reader, ed. Alan R. Sadovnik (New York: Routledge, 2011), 1–22.
- 61. Ibid.