

# **Self-Identity and Its Social Metaphysical Underpinnings**

## **in the field of Education**

(The Philosophical Grounding of Education Starting from the Philosophy of Self-Identity and Its Social Metaphysical Underpinnings: Literature, Language and Class Culture, Discourse and Ideological Communities, Autonomy of Citizens and Women)

### **Abstract**

Education fundamentally focuses on 'individuals', whose human value is rooted in the expression of 'self-identity'. This process is influenced by their social rank and linguistic culture, and within varied discourses and ideological communities, different 'self-identity values' emerge. This applies to all individuals, whether they are citizens or women, and encompasses complex social metaphysical questions. For instance, how do we define social identities such as poverty, disability, privilege, or femininity? 'Intuition' and 'common sense' often fail in such definitions, especially in recognizing exceptions like gender identification, which challenges the distinctions between biological sex and gender identity. The paper analyzes 'Social Historical Structuralism' and 'Performative Theory' to see if they address the challenges of 'Essentialism'. It assesses both pluralism and monism and the autonomy of the 'true self' in educational philosophy's core concepts, grounded in the philosophy of self-identity. This study starts from female community perspectives, addressing women's disadvantaged status in social and linguistic structures and the impact of individualism on gender mainstreaming. This paper concludes by re-evaluating monistic approaches and considering the equitable recognition of community members' autonomy, underscoring the importance of self-identity in educational philosophy amidst the growing influence of identity politics in Western education.

**Keywords:** Self-Identity and Educational Philosophy, Social Metaphysics, Class and Identity, Ideology and Autonomy

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My humble and heartfelt thanks to Dr. Axel Barceló Aspeitia for his generous support and keen interest in my draft paper titled “Self-Identity and Its Social Metaphysical Underpinnings in the field of Education,” presented at the 2024 Annual Conference on Philosophy of Education and Educational Policy. This work has been profoundly inspired by my extensive reading of Dr. Barceló’s insightful and groundbreaking discussions on acculturation and self-identity, particularly in his works: Barceló, A. (2019). *Falibilidad y normatividad: Un análisis filosófico de la suerte*. Cátedra, and Barceló, A. (2021). *Open Questions in the Metaphysics of Habitable Categories*. *EurAmerica*, 50(4). I am deeply grateful for his contributions to the field, which have significantly shaped my research.

My humble regards,  
JR Lian (Lian, J. J.)

## Reference

- Ásta (eds.), 2012, *Speech and Harm: Controversies Over Free Speech*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Ásta, A. (2013). 'The Social Construction of Human Kinds.' *Hypatia* 28 (4):716–732.
- Ásta, A. (2018). *Categories We Live By*. OUP.
- Anderson, L., Haslanger, S., & Langton, R. (2012). Language and race. In G. Russell & D. G. Fara (Eds.), *The Routledge Companion to the Philosophy of Language* (pp. 753–67). London: Routledge.
- Antony, Louise, 2012, "Is There a 'Feminist' Philosophy of Language?" in Crasnow and Superson 2012: 245–285.
- Báez-Jorge, F. (2002). Los indios, los nacos, los otros . . . (apuntes sobre el prejuicio racial y la discriminación en México). *La Palabra y el Hombre*, 121: 21-40.
- Bailey, A. (2007). Strategic ignorance. In S. Sullivan & N. Tuana (Eds.), *Race and epistemologies of ignorance* (pp. 77-94). SUNY.
- Barceló, A. (2019). Falibilidad y normatividad: Un análisis filosófico de la suerte. Cátedra.
- Barceló, A. (2021). Open Questions in the Metaphysics of Habitable Categories. *EurAmerica*, 50(4).
- Barnes, E. 2020 *Gender and Gender Terms* *NOÛS* 54:3:704–730.
- Baumeister, R. F., & Muraven, M. (1996). Identity as adaptation to social, cultural, and historical context. *Journal of Adolescence*, 19, 5: 405-416. <https://doi.org/10.1006/jado.1996.0039>

- Bell, D. (2020). Communitarianism. In E. N. Zalta (Ed.), *The Stanford encyclopedia of philosophy* (summer 2020 ed.). <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/sum2020/entries/communitarianism>
- Berthold, D. (2010). Tidy whiteness: A genealogy of race, purity, and hygiene. *Ethics & The Environment*, 15, 1: 1-26. <https://doi.org/10.2979/ete.2010.15.1.1>
- Bettcher, T. M. (2009). Trans identities and first-person authority.
- Bettcher, T. M. (2018, May 30). When tables speak: On the existence of trans philosophy. *Daily Nous*. <http://dailynous.com/2018/05/30/tables-speak-existence-trans-philosophy-guest-talia-maebettcher>
- Bianchi, Claudia, 2008, "Indexicals, Speech Acts and Pornography", *Analysis*, 68(4): 310–316.
- Born, G., & Hesmondhalgh, D. (2000). Introduction: On difference, representation, and appropriation in music. In G. Born & D. Hesmondhalgh (Eds.), *Western music and its others: Difference, representation, and appropriation in music* (pp. 158). University of California Press.
- Bourgois, P. (1995). *In search of respect: Selling crack in El Barrio*. Cambridge University Press.
- Brody, J. D. (1992). Clare Kendry's "true" colors: Race and class conflict in Nella Larsen's passing. *Callaloo*, 15, 4: 1053-1065. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2931920>
- Bürki, Y. (2014). Prácticas discursivas y estereotipos: La figura del naco en la sociedad mexicana actual. In M. Kunz, C. Mondragón, & D. Phillips-López (Eds.), *Nuevas narrativas mexicanas II* (pp. 399-427). Linkgua.
- Burt, S. (2012). My life as a girl. *The Virginia Quarterly Review*, 88, 4: 202-211.
- Butler, J. (1990). *Gender trouble: Feminism and the subversion of identity*. Routledge.
- Carbonell, V. (2019). Social constraints on moral address. *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, 98, 1: 167-189. <https://doi.org/10.1111/phpr.12450>

- Casey, C. (1995). *Work, self and society: After industrialism*. Routledge.
- Chance, J. K. (1979). On the Mexican mestizo. *Latin American Research Review*, 14, 3: 153-168.
- Cimpian, A., & Salomon, E. (2014). The inherence heuristic: An intuitive means of making sense of the world, and a potential precursor to psychological essentialism. *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, 37, 5: 461-480. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0140525X13002197>
- Clarke, V. C., & Turner, K. (2007). Clothes maketh the queer?
- Daly, C., & Liggins, D. (2010). In defence of error theory.
- Dress, appearance and the construction of lesbian, gay and bisexual identities. *Feminism & Psychology*, 17, 2: 267-276. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0959353507076561>
- Cole, N. L. (2019). What is social class, and why does it matter?
- Dworkin, G. (2015). The nature of autonomy. *Nordic Journal of Studies in Educational Policy*, 2015(2), 28479.
- Dworkin, R. (2002). *Sovereign virtue*. Harvard university press.
- Dworkin, R. (2002). *Sovereign virtue*. Harvard university press.
- Dworkin, R. (2011). *Justice for hedgehogs*. Harvard University Press.
- Gilbert, E. (2009). *Committed: A skeptic makes peace with marriage*.
- Guerrero McManus, S. F. (2018). Naturalezas, culturas y arquitecturas disciplinarias. *La infrapolítica de un debate (necesariamente) interminable*. *Metatheoria*, 8, 2: 77-85.
- Guerrero McManus, S. F. (2019). Transgeneridad y transracialidad: Contrastes ontológicos entre género y raza. *Diánoia*, 64, 82: 3-30. <https://doi.org/10.22201/iifs.18704913e.2019.82.1633>
- Gupta, A. (2006).

Empiricism and experience. Oxford University Press.

<https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780195189582.001.0001>

Halperin, D. M. (2002). How to do the history of homosexuality.

Haslanger, Sally (2012): *Resisting Reality*. Oxford: OUP.

Haslanger, Sally, 2000 “Gender and Race: (What) Are They? (What) Do We Want Them to Be?” *Noûs*, 34(1): 31–55.

Haslanger, Sally, 2011, “Ideology, Generics, and Common Ground”, in *Resisting Reality*. (2012). pp.446-478.

Hayes-Bautista, D. E. (1980). Identifying “hispanic” populations:

Heywood, C. (2018). A history of childhood. John Wiley & Sons. Hobsbawm, E. J. (1990). Nations and nationalism since 1780:

Hornsby, Jennifer and Langton, Rae, 1998, “Free Speech and Illocution”, *Legal Theory*, 4(1): 21–37.

In L. Shrage (Ed.), *You’ve changed: Sex reassignment and personal identity* (pp. 98-120). Oxford University Press.

Jenkins, Katharine, 2016, “Amelioration and Inclusion: Gender Identity and the Concept of *Woman*”, *Ethics*, 126(2): 394–421.

Kenny, M., & Müller, R. (2018). Of rats and women: Narratives of motherhood in environmental epigenetics. In M. Meloni, J. Cromby, D. Fitzgerald, & S. Lloyd (Eds.), *The palgrave handbook of biology and society* (pp. 799-830). Palgrave Macmillan. [https://doi.org/10.1057/978-1-137-52879-7\\_34](https://doi.org/10.1057/978-1-137-52879-7_34)

Kim, E. T. (2020, July 29). The perils of “people of color.” *The New Yorker*. <https://www.newyorker.com/news/annals-of-activism/the-perils-of-people-of-color>

Kingston, P. W. (2000). *The classless society*. Stanford University Press.

Lakoff, Robin, 1975, *Language and Women’s Place*, New York: Harper &

- Langton, Rae, 1993, "Speech Acts and Unspeakable Acts", *Philosophy and Public Affairs*, 22(4): 293–330.
- Maitra, Ishani and Mary Kate McGowan, 2010, "On Silencing, Rape, and Responsibility", *Australasian Journal of Philosophy*, 88(1): 167–172
- Mikkola, M. 2020 "Fixing pornography's illocutionary force: Which context matters?". *Philos Stud* 177, 3013–3032.
- Nozick, R., & Nagel, T. (1974). *Anarchy, state, and utopia* (Vol. 5038). New York: Basic books. Robert Nozick, *State of Nature Theory*, in *Anarchy, State, and Utopia* (1974). *Philosophical Studies*, 149, 2: 209-230. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11098-009-9346-1>
- Demolombe, R., & Louis, V. (2006). Norms, institutional power and roles: Towards a logical framework. In F. Esposito, Z. W. Raś, D. Malerba, & G. Semeraro (Eds.), *Foundations of intelligent systems. ISMIS 2006* (pp. 514-523). Springer. [https://doi.org/10.1007/11875604\\_58](https://doi.org/10.1007/11875604_58)
- Programme, myth, reality. Cambridge University Press. Hyppolite, J. (1969). *Studies on Marx and Hegel*. Basic Books.
- Saul Jennifer and Esa Diaz-Leon 2017 "Feminist Philosophy of Language" (Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy).
- Saul, Jennifer 2006 "Pornography, Speech Acts and Context", *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society*, 106(2): 61–80.
- Saul, Jennifer Mather 2003, "Feminism and Language Change", in *Feminism: Issues* & University Press. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 170–198.
- The influence of research methodology upon public policy. *American Journal of Public Health*, 70, 4: 353-356. <https://doi.org/10.2105/AJPH.70.4.353> Hernandez, X. (1994). *Wig wam bam. Fantagraphics*.

ThoughtCo. <https://www.thoughtco.com/what-is-social-classand-why-does-it-matter-3026375> Convery, A. (2011). Feminist theory and discursive intersections:Activating the code of ‘political correctness.’ Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Newcastle.

Tomas Bogardu 2020 “Some Internal Problems with Revisionary Gender Concepts”  
Philosophia (2020) 48:55–75