Lectio 1 (August 2021): 17-38
Conference Articles

Pagsantigwar sa Banwaan
Social Healing for a "People Who have Nothing"[1]

Victor John M. Loquias, Ph.D. Cand.
Philosophy Department, Ateneo de Naga University

Abstract: In this paper, the famous Bikolano folk way of healing called *Santigwar* is reconstructed as a procedure of social critique which was ideationally made possible by Kristian Cordero's metaphorical configuration of its practice from healing a sick body to a poetics of social diagnosis. The legitimacy of this effort is grounded on the normative significance of the practice of santigwar to Bikolanos in the present and its historical background of conversion and resistance in Bikol. It is argued that while santigwar, in Cordero, is a literary piece for social healing, it could likewise serve as a local concept for social critique refurbished with the conceptual tools borrowed from the recognitive theory of Axel Honneth. Santigwar captures in literary imagination the brand of social criticism called immanent critique geared for freedom yet grounded in normativity. Hence pagsantigwar sa banwaan becomes a philosophical praxis of social healing performed for social emancipation—using Fenella Cannell's terminology of the ethnographic value of santigwar to Bikolanos—for a "people who have nothing."

Keywords: *Santigwar*, Conversion, Resistance, Immanent Critique, Social Emancipation

Kristian Cordero's description of the tendency among Bikolanos when afflicted with a physical malady is popular knowledge: the cheaper and immediate recourse is to approach a *parasantigwar* (folk-healer) but for others, particularly the more affluent in the urban centers, it is the last resort when hope for medical prognosis rans out.[2] *Santigwar* is a folk healing practice in the Bikol region that blends indigenous

[1] The author wishes to thank the anonymous reviewers of this paper originally entitled "Translating the Religio-Cultural Significance of *Santigwar* into a Philosophical Language of Critique" presented during the on-line "Christianity and the Philippine Intellectual Landscape Conference" held last April 2021.

[2] Kristian Cordero, "Metapora asin Memorya sa Santigwar: Hurop-Hurop asin Diskurso," *Pagpukaw: An Invitation to Philosophize* 4 (2008): 21.

animistic[3] folk ways with elements from Christian repertoire. And based on available studies, a coalescence of economic, socio-cultural, historical, and religious backgrounds could be traced behind its normative practice.

In Fenella Cannell's ethnographic accounts, popular belief in *santigwar* is claimed by its practitioners and believers as an alternative healing for the sick people "who have nothing."[4] She reports that the process of becoming a healer starts from the experience of oppression. Then one is "chosen" by the *tawo* or "spirit guide" to become a healer and undertakes the intimate process of "getting used to" it that eventually wins her worthiness. Healing is a gift and vocation assumed by an individual to serve the poor people. Thus, it is not a commercial enterprise. And healing for profit is believed to undermine her power. The gift of healing could be handed down to one's kin, but the latter has to make herself worthy of it through the same process. The religious, Christian, element evidently manifests in that the ultimate ground or legitimacy of the power of healing is gleaned from and sustained through the healer's imitation of the life of Christ particularly performed during the Lenten season. That *santigwar* could serve as a bastion of hope even, or perhaps more importantly, to a financially able person, manifests a cultural embeddedness of a social value attached to the peoples' history and present normative orientations behind its presence.

Cordero's poetry book *Santigwar* made a different ripple of signification inaugurating further ideational possibilities for this local practice. In Cordero's poetics a writer assumes the role of the healer (*parasantigwar*) in identifying the causes of the present maladies of society. Furthermore, his metaphorical employment of *pagsantigwar* and the images that he uses in his poetry restore the memory of the region embedded in both myth and history. *Pagsantigwar sa banwaan* then recreates the healer's performance of healing a sick body into a social healing for the people who is struck by social maladies. From Cannell's ethnography to Cordero's poetry, the *parasantigwar* (healer) refers now to a writer that performs *pagsantigwar* (diagnosis) to facilitate healing for a "people who have nothing."

Cordero's poetics provides a "semantic bridge"[5] where a locally normative practice is employed as a resource for emancipative orientation. This paper performs that remainder of articulating *santigwar* as a local concept of social critique launching from Cordero's metaphorical reconfiguration of its cultural significance. This is

---

[3] I follow Rodney L Henry's description of animism contextualized in the Philippine experience as "based on a central belief in spirits whose power can be manipulated through formulas, rituals, or words." *Filipino Spirit World: A Challenge to the Church* (Manila, Philippines: OMF Literature, Inc. 2001), 13.

[4] "Healing (*pagbulong*) is said by healers (*parabulong*) and their patients to be the 'help' which is given to the poor, to 'those who have nothing'." Fenella Cannell, *Power and Intimacy in the Christian Philippines* (Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University Press, 1999), 80.

[5] Axel Honneth, *The Struggle for Recognition: The Moral Grammar of Social Conflicts*, trans. Joel Anderson (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1995), 163.

commenced by presenting *pagsantigwar* not only as a local and folk way of healing but as a cultural artifact of conversion and resistance based on ethnographical and historiographical accounts. The legitimacy of its being relocated to a language of critique is thus founded within its normative grip within the cultural and social milieu among Bikolanos. The second part articulates Cordero's poetics of diagnosis and prognosis in *pagsantigwar* applied to social reality. It shows how Cordero's metaphor translates the original practice of identifying causes of corporal maladies and giving therapeutic prescription into a task of the writer in general towards his ailing society. The religio-cultural value of *santigwar* assumes thus a new intellectual significance realigned towards a project of social emancipation. Finally, the last part enunciates *santigwar* as "immanent critique" in its new landscape of philosophical signification. This is a term borrowed from Axel Honneth's social theory that grounds itself on the socio-ontological framework of recognition. Emancipation is a project that cannot be uprooted from the social and cultural orientations of individuals in the society. Cordero's service is to have expanded *santigwar's* possibilities granting esteem of its indigenous value in poetic form. What *santigwar* embodies in its reconfiguration is a mode of doing social critique that gears itself up for emancipation employing the arsenals of one's own culture. This paper is one such opening of the local experience to further discursive avenues which Cordero's poetry has just mediated.

Santigwar as a Cultural Artifact of Conversion and Resistance

The crucifix, icons of the Trinity, Virgin Mary and saints, orations in pamphlets, essential oil, herbal roots contained in a bottle, candle, and quasi porcelain plate are common spectacles in a healer's "clinic." Then in the performance of *santigwar*, one witnesses the sign of the cross, the incantation with Latin sounding oration, and communicative gestures of mediatorship resembling a priest's privilege between the divine and the human. All these call to mind materials and practices from the Christian repertoire but surrounded with ambiguity as regards its legitimacy or conformity with Christian ideology. Whereas folk healing has been generally associated with Animism, Folk Catholicism, Folk Christianity, or Hybrid Christianity, this part of the paper expounds a way of looking at healing, specifically *santigwar*, as a cultural artifact of conversion and resistance.

The initial images conjured and involved in the practice already enunciate a religious, specifically Christian, elements that imply the colonial history of the region. The etymology is likewise unmistakable: Czarina Labayo traces the term from the Latin *sanctificare* and the practice in "old times…commonly known in Spanish…as making the sign of the cross while uttering words of prayer specially when one needs

to be protected from evil."[6] While Cordero identifies the term as a juxtaposition of the two Spanish terms, *santo* and *agua* or holy water, and the practice on the other hand as signifying the giving of blessing and healing.[7]

Santigwar is usually classified as "folk healing". But not all folk healing can be identified with the need for *santigwar*. It is a specific procedure that a healer *parabulong* or *albularyo* (who becomes a *parasantigwar* in its performance) does in cases when it is needed. In Calyd Cerio's table of folk illnesses, symptoms, causes, diagnostic processes, and treatments, *santigwar* consistently functions as a diagnostic procedure for peculiar maladies. These are the illnesses which are suspected and believed to be supernaturally caused. There appears to be a variety of supernatural entities behind illnesses.[8] One usual cause which is also identified in other studies is the "aggrieved person"[9] or *tawong lipod*,[10] (unseen person) which a sick person is deemed to have had a disruptive "contact"[11] with.

The exorcism-like procedure of *santigwar* comes from this interplay between the natural (physical sickness) and the supernatural (cause). But it is not the same as exorcism because the supernatural cause of the malady is neither a devil nor treated as such by both the healer and the sick but recognized instead as coexisting in the world. Their locus or space is believed to have been disrupted, the signs of which, manifests corporeally in the person's illness. Rodney Henry's description of the Filipino animistic worldview is helpful here in putting in place the cosmology implied in the belief. The supernatural world consists of an other-worldly and this-worldly dimension. The other-worldly supernatural world is the realm of "ultimate concerns" taught in the Christian doctrine such as death, salvation in God, and the afterlife while the supernatural this-worldly dimension is the realm of unseen spirits. The natural world in turn is the realm of the visible everyday experience governed by natural laws. But both the supernatural this-worldly dimension and the natural world continue to influence everyday life.[12] The healer can navigate both worlds hence, she could negotiate this event of disruption, redeem (*bawi*) or heal (*bulong*) the sick, and restore

---

[6] Czarina C. Labayo. "Living in danger: Exploring the culture of disaster of the Ati peoples in Bohol, Philippines," *Journal of International Development of Cooperation* 28:1-2 (2019): 8.

[7] Cordero, "Metapora asin Memorya sa Santigwar: Hurop-Hurop asin Diskurso." 21.

[8] Calyd T. Cerio, "Albularyo Folk Healing: Cultural Beliefs on Healthcare Management in Partido District, Camarines Sur, Philippines," *Journal of Southeast Asian Studies* 25:1 (June 2020): 219-220.

[9] Maria Sharon Ariola, "Spirituality among the Bikolanos: a perspective in contemporary practices" in *2011 International Conference on Humanities, Society and Culture IPEDR Vol.20* (Singapore: IACSIT Press. 2011).

[10] Camille Ann A. Loza et. al., "Metonymies of Tawong Lipod in Cagliliog, Tinambac, Camarines Sur: Counter-memory to Christian Hegemony in Bikol, Philippines," *Advanced Science Letters* 22:5 (May 2016).

[11] *Ibid*., 4.

[12] Henry, *Filipino Spirit World: A Challenge to the Church*.

harmony between the supernatural and natural worlds. Thus, unlike a doctor the *parantigwar* is a "séance," a position of power[13] which could only be displaced by non-belief in the supernatural itself or the negation of its agency and influence in everyday experience.

The Christian elements in *santigwar* confirm foremost the presence or embeddedness of Christianity[14] in the region. But it also depicts how the Christian belief have been received and transformed by the people in both the rural and urban areas. As F. Landa Jocano puts it, "the touch of magic" has always been a recurrent theme in both provincial and urban rites.[15] The term "magic" is used to describe the folk belief system deviating from the original Christian position yet tolerated in the light of the same "faith" practiced. Jesus Conde's ethnographic studies on folk narratives and botanical medicines also mirror this in his description of the people's belief as "hybrid Christianity" or the fusion between indigenous and Christian elements.[16]

While *santigwar* could be identified as a cultural artifact of conversion in the sense of Christianity's presence through time in the region, it is likewise an artifact of the particular kind of resistance exhibited by the natives in the region that could be traced in relation to, and compared with, other modes of resistance in the wider history of the nation. Danilo Gerona for instance provides a historiographical account for the appropriation of foreign terms in the healer's orations. The technique of conversion employed in the early colonial period is the translation and teaching of the gospel in the native tongue. However,

its limited vocabulary did not include the words needed for an adequate teaching of the principles of faith. Such concepts and corresponding words for *Dios*, *gracia*, *salvacion*, *Espiritu santo*, *cruz*, *santos*, and others were foreign to the natives and consequently not found in their language…the untranslatability of these concepts into native terms gave the natives an impression of the intrinsic superiority of the Latin and Castillan languages over the local ones…The use of Latin as a standard ritual language of the Catholic Church endowed this language with almost magical and supernatural characteristics. This explains why native healers appropriated this language into their pagan rituals in the form of mutilated Latin incantations.[17]

We are reminded of Vicente Rafael's perspective of "fishing" that problematized the technique of translation in the process of conversion. Confronted

---

[13] Cannell, *Power and Intimacy in the Christian Philippines*, 87.

[14] Like Henry, Christianity is preferred here to cover all Christian religions in the region aside from Catholicism.

[15] F. Landa Jocano, "Filipino Catholicism: A Case Study in Religious Change (1967)," *Asian Studies: Journal of Critical Perspectives on Asia* 55:1-2 (2019): 94.

[16] Jesus Cyril M. Conde, "Hybrid Christianity in the Oral Literature and Ethno-botany of the Agtas of Mount Asog in the Bikol Region of the Philippines." *FILOCRACIA* 1:1 (February 2014).

[17] Danilo M. Gerona, "Text and Politics: Transactions of Power in the Early Provincial Philippines," *Asian Studies* 34 (1998): 16.

with the almost incomprehensible language of the foreign, the natives hook out onto the words of the friars and reconfigures it in their own terms. As Rafael writes, "the idiom of religious conversion was crucial" in that "it shaped the terms of native surrender just as it lent to the articulation of popular resistance to a colonizing power. Conceived dialectically, conversion requires one's submission to and incorporation of the language and logic of Christianity as the condition of possibility for defining and subsequently overcoming one's prior state of subordination, whether to a pagan past, a colonial overlord, or the local elite."[18] The Christian elements in *santigwar* could be viewed similarly as a localization of the foreign but at the same time its subversion as it becomes part of the natives' vocabulary in their own "terms" or in their agentive reconfiguration.

Gerona speaks of an "everyday resistance" of the natives in the persistence of their indigenous practices during colonial times such as "ritual (social) drinking and ritual crying *pagarang* that forged solidarity among the natives behind the backs of the friars."[19] They were forms of silent resistance in its embeddedness in the culture. Apparently, *santigwar* was another form of silent resistance in its continuing presence in the people's worldview even up to this time where their animistic cosmology manifests to merge if not problematize Christianity and modern conceptions of reality.

Henry highlights that animism has its strength "on the everyday concerns of the people."[20] Health is one among these concerns, a disruption of which *santigwar* serves as a viable alternative for people other than medical care. This alternative has always been cheaper in as much as the healer does not profit from her service although she could accept any offering that the patient can give.[21] Moreover, the presence of free governmental or private health services did not undermine and efface *santigwar*. The continuing preference for both alternatives however could only arise from *santigwar's* normative bite on the socio-cultural background of the people other than the economic. It is a manifestation of the people's unproblematic merging of the native and foreign belief systems which now constitutes the local. Folk Catholicism, or more generally, folk Christianity is "the coexistence of two religions in the same person without inconsistencies."[22] Henry provides a convincing explanation for this:

> The Roman Catholic aspect of folk Catholicism deals with higher or ultimate concerns, while the animistic aspect deals with the concerns of everyday living. These are two separate thought and behavior systems, each dealing with different areas of life. Roman

[18] Vicente Rafael, *Contracting Colonialism: Translation and Christian Conversion in Tagalog Society under Early Spanish Rule* (Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University Press, 1988), 7.

[19] Gerona, "Text and Politics: Transactions of Power in the Early Provincial Philippines," 35.

[20] Henry, *Filipino Spirit World: A Challenge to the Church*, 8.

[21] Cannell, *Power and Intimacy in the Christian Philippines*, 101.

[22] Henry, *Filipino Spirit World: A Challenge to the Church*, 19.

> Catholicism had little or nothing to say about the everyday concerns of the Filipino. There was no theology of weather, fishing, hunting, where to build a house or how to cure a spirit-caused sickness. The Filipino assumed that this was the domain of his own spirit religion. The Spanish clergy and nobility passed judgement on the everyday animistic religion of the Filipino as superstitious and sometimes even demonic. But because the church gave no substitute for these practical, everyday concerns of the common *tao* (people), the belief in the power of the spirit world continues until today as the everyday religion of the Filipino.[23]

The combination of the native and foreign prefigures in the healer's being able to negotiate between the supernatural and the natural. Cannell captures this well in her description of the process how the healer assumes and renews her power through the performance of the Christian *pasyon.* She writes, "a healer's replication of Christ's death and resurrection endows her with power in relation to the *tawo* but is also a 'shamanic' journey undertaken in the company of her *saro* or spirit-companion."[24] This is a similar process mirroring Reynaldo Ileto's description of how the *anting-anting* (amulets) is invested with power through the *pasyon* which likewise renders the worthiness of its bearer who led mass revolts. Ileto revealed that "the masses' experience of the Holy Week fundamentally shaped the style of peasant brotherhoods and uprisings during the Spanish and early American colonial periods."[25] The passion play or the *sinakulo* which the Spanish colonizers utilized for conversion evolved into something which provided lowland Philippine society with "a language for articulating its own values, ideals, and even hopes of liberation."[26]

Cerio glimpses on a well-founded insight after documenting the traditional healthcare systems in rural areas that today's healers "are the modern day *balian* or *babaylan* in digesting the way how they discover and practice folk healing."[27] William Henry Scott have actually written that in the sixteenth century Bikolandia "religious practitioners were female shamans called *baliyan*, or male transvestites called *asog*. They wore gold ornaments on their forehead, took ritual baths, spoke with the voice of departed spirits, and delivered prayers in song…healing ceremonies included chicken sacrifices or smearing the patient's forehead with masticated betel nut."[28]

---

[23] *Ibid*., 19-20.

[24] Fenella Cannell, "The Imitation of Christ in Bikol, Philippines," *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 1:2 (June 1995): 388.

[25] Reynaldo C. Ileto, *Pasyon and Revolution: Popular Movements in the Philippines, 1840-1910* (Quezon City, Philippines: Ateneo de Manila University, 1979), 11.

[26] *Ibid*., 12.

[27] Cerio, "Albularyo Folk Healing: Cultural Beliefs on Healthcare Management in Partido District, Camarines Sur, Philippines," 230.

[28] William Henry Scott, *Barangay: Sixteenth Century Philippine Culture and Society* (Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University Press, 1994), 185.

Another reinforcement, and a further historical basis for connecting Cannell's studies with other parts of the country, could be gleaned from Alfred Mccoy's account of animism and Visayan peasant revolts. In precolonial times, the *baylan* is originally a woman whose socio-political status ranked with that of the *datu* because of her exclusive capacity to "contact the relevant spirits and propitiate them with offerings of blood and food made acceptable with arcane chants and magic words"[29] for worldly concerns such as agriculture, health,[30] and war. The powers and capacities of the *baylan* however became less exclusive to women through time and were utilized for both secular and religious purposes. In colonial times it became the source of political prowess and charisma in mobilizing disparate religious and political opposition in the colony. And the function of healing occupied no minor place:

> In leading peasant revolts from the 17th to 19th centuries the *babaylan* brought certain tangible skills to the service of their followers. Perhaps most importantly, a high-ranking *babaylan* was an established leader with a wide reputation gained in travelling from village to village *healing* his fellowman.[31]

The difference however between the Tagalog and Visayan peasant revolts was that while the former as Ileto presented was nurtured by folk Christianity the latter was fueled by a religion that fundamentally remained animist and pre-Hispanic.[32] Cannell on her part would affirm the possibility of the connection between political activism, combining magical power with sharing with Christ's life, and healing—"that the florescence of organized forms of healing which tightly combine the power of the spirits and intimacy with Christ are characteristic of periods of popular political activity."[33]

The preceding considerations have stitched *santigwar* into the literature of Philippine ethnography and history. Whether linked to the movements in the north with folk Christianity or the still dominant animist historical backgrounds of insurgencies in the south, both conversion and resistance have been shown to form part of the fabric of *santigwar's* practice. Hence, it could be argued that the requisite grounds needed for the reconfiguration of *santigwar* performed by Cordero was already available in these normative foundations.

---

[29] Alfred W. McCoy, "*Baylan*: Animist Religion and Philippine Peasant Ideology" in *Moral Order and the Question of Change: Essays on Southeast Asian Thought,* ed. David K. Wyatt and Alexander Woodside (New Haven, Connecticut: Yale University Southeast Asia Studies, 1982), 341.

[30] The healer as a seance described by Cannell rehearses in the present almost the same feature of being or becoming a *baylan* as a "divine calling, often a hereditary one, and [are] frequently guided in their work by a familiar spirit who serves as their interpreter with the malign immanence." *Ibid.*, 343.

[31] *Ibid.*, 371-372. Italics is mine.

[32] *Ibid.*, 392.

[33] Cannell, *Power and Intimacy in the Christian Philippines,* 199-200.

Cordero's Poetics of Social Diagnosis

The book *Santigwar* is Kristian Cordero's second collection of poetry which won for him the Tomas Arejola Award for Bicol Literature. The cover page image of the book already shows a telling narrative of his poetics. It is a photo of the hands of his grandmother who was a *parasantigwar* in their locality in Nabua, Camarines Sur. The work intends to honor her, but it depicts at the same time the transfiguration of *santigwar* in the hands of a poet and writer. In Cordero's words:

> In this collection, I called for a new *pagsantigwar*, a new *haliya* (a moon ritual to drive away the moon swallowing *Bakunawa*), which is symbolically represented as the ills and omens that afflict our community, particularly the Bikol region, which remains to be the second poorest region in the country today because of our traditional political system, militarization, low regard for education and cultural programs that would develop critical citizenry among others...I decided to become a poet, considering the healing value that poetry may render to us as a people.[34]

Cordero's poetry, it will be argued, is a poetics of diagnosis where *pagsantigwar* is employed as a metaphor translating the original practice of identifying causes of corporal maladies and giving therapeutic prescription into a task of the writer in general towards his ailing society. The cultural value of *santigwar* assumes thus a new intellectual significance realigned towards social emancipation.

Becoming a *parasantigwar* entails an intense consciousness of the experience of oppression which is behind the vocation to accept the power of healing not as a commercial enterprise but as a gift[35] for individuals "who have nothing." Cordero's becoming a poet rehearses the healer's acceptance of the vocation of healing now reconfigured as a writer's task at diagnosing the society. *Santigwar* assumes more articulately in this process of metaphorical configuration what it only always had implicitly—a social and political significance and value. The personal and social converge in Cordero's poetics. He would describe his resolve in becoming a poet as "an act of mourning" for the loss of his grandmother and as a search for the

[34] Kristian Cordero, "Writing a Novena: Poetics, Pilgrimages and Performances in Bikol, Philippines" (Accessed April 10, 2021), https://corderokanbikol.tumblr.com/page/4 .

[35] The patient however must not devaluate the service of the healer which could be done in two extremes: the excess of lavishly giving that would appear to be a mere pay-off for her service, or the deliberate omission of offering anything in one's capacity that shows a hurtful lack of gratitude. "The efficacy of a good healer is demonstrated by the unforced flow of both thanks *and* gifts, as inseparable signs of gratitude and tribute to her ability." Cannell, *Power and Intimacy in the Christian Philippines*, 102-103.

"contradictions within the tenets" of his faith and history, "which are painfully determined by our long history of colonization."[36] The act of mourning is a revolutionary technique that Rafael has identified to have been employed by Rizal and the other *illustrados* in imagining the nation and fueling patriotism.[37] Cordero apparently attaches the memory of his grandmother with his advocacy for regional identity in a similar fashion with Rizal's reciprocal personal longing for his mother while in Europe and his mourning for the image of a motherland lost through colonization, and now handed over to the present as something to be retrieved. Becoming a poet may be perceived as an act of revolt. And the choice of the metaphor to embody the newfound vocation after giving up the vow to his parents to become a priest expresses the act of memorializing not only his grandmother who first touched him[38] but the role of healers in the history of the region and nation which have been replaced by priests. *Santigwar* therefore restores the memory of the region embedded in both myth and history.

Cordero is rooted in the tradition but not as mere acquiescence of what has been handed down, for his poetry becomes likewise a shedding off tradition's old skin. *Santigwar* is imbedded in the normative experience of the region as it occupies the ambivalent places of cosmology and mythology, Christianity and its anomaly. But it is also a reconfiguration into an aesthetic piece that recreates and infuses it with new life. Cordero reproduces the original use value of *santigwar* into a work of art. As Walter Benjamin has emphasized "the uniqueness of a work of art is inseparable from its being imbedded in the fabric of tradition," a tradition that is "thoroughly alive and extremely changeable."[39] *Santigwar* is originally both a ritualistic and diagnostic procedure which has already been elaborated in the first part as an amalgamation of indigenous and foreign elements. Cordero maintains in *santigwar* its ritual character which is the "basis" and the "location of the original use value"[40] of the authentic work of art. But Cordero's metaphorical reconfiguration can also be perceived already as a "distortion of the truth" which has previously defined *santigwar* in the social relations of Bikolanos. Drawing inspiration from the early Frankfurt School's perspective of literature, Virgilio Almario explains that every "metaphor or figurative in literature is a mechanism for distorting the truth,...every metaphor in literature is a product of the intense and acute experiencing of the reality of the world so that it comes to us in the

---

[36] Kristian Cordero, "Writing a Novena: Poetics, Pilgrimages and Performances in Bikol, Philippines."

[37] Vicente Rafael, "Nationalism, Imagery, and the Filipino Intelligentsia in the Nineteenth Century," *Critical Inquiry* 16:3 (Spring, 1990).

[38] His grandmother is also a trained midwife hence her hand was his "first human contact."

[39] Walter Benjamin, "The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction" in *Illuminations,* edited by Hannah Arendt and translated by Harry Zohn (New York: Schocken Books, 1969), 6.

[40] *Ibid*.

reading as not-ordinary, puzzling, and often unbelievable."[41] The writer's composition of the language is the locus of this "distortion."

Hali(y)a is one poem in the collection that strongly embodies both this embeddedness and distortion of tradition and truth. The poem *Hali(y)a* rehearses the precolonial ritual called *Halya* which is "a ritual offered to the *Gugurang* (god of goodness). The ritual is held on the nights of the full moon to frighten off the *Bakunawa*, who would swallow the moon if not scared away."[42] *Halia* on the other hand is a term that literally means "remove" or "to dispel." Joined, *Hali(y)a*, becomes either or both a ritual (past) and a prayer (present) resembling the *Oratio Imperata* recited to ward off catastrophes. As the chorus and one part reads:

Halia an mga Yawa!	Dispel the Demons!
Halia si Bakunawa!	Dispel Bakunawa!
Ibalik an Bulan!	Return the Moon!
Iligtas an Banwaan!	Redeem the People!
Sa pakilaban ki Bakunawa	In the battle against Bakunawa
Magkuang liwanag sa saldang	Take light from the sun
asin mga bitoon na nakakorona	and stars crowned
sa itum na babayi, an nagbabanaag	on the black woman, the dawning
na kaagahan, magayon siring sa bulan	morning, beautiful as the moon
asin mangirhat siring sa hukbo	and ferocious like legion
na andam makilaban.	geared for war.

Cordero reconfigures the image of this ritual and conjures the "*itum na babayi*"[43] or the virgin of Penafrancia instead of the mythological *Gugurang.* Like the old *parasantigwar* Cordero, in his new mode of *pagsantigwar*, liberally brews elements into his poetry that come from the people's experience of the forgotten past and the present popular devotion to the virgin apparently rehearsing the unproblematic merging of the Christian faith and the old animistic worldview. Yet the diagnostic function of *santigwar* is maintained by Cordero only this time it becomes a diagnosis of a society seemingly unaware of its maladies in the present.

Cordero therefore creates a ripple of difference in *santigwar's* signification that both speaks its normative language and shows a different way of viewing reality that has always been in the ambit of social experience. Cordero's poetics therefore transcends in a way what Benjamin in his time would caution at entanglement of the

---

[41] Virgilio Almario, *Seven Mountains of the Imagination,* ed., and trans., Marne Kilates (Manila, Philippines: UST Publishing House, 2011), 162.

[42] Malcolm Mintz, *Bikol Dictionary* (Honolulu: University of Hawaii, 1971), 154.

[43] The black color of the statue of the Virgin of Peñafrancia is said to have been due to the blood of a dog sacrificed and painted on its surface. The dog however miraculously came to life and was seen by the people swimming on the Naga River. This is one of the miracles attributed to the virgin which popularized the devotion every September.

artistic function—the practice of politics instead of ritual. In Cordero, ritual and politics are brewed in pretty much the same way as the native healers' unproblematic fusion of elements from different religious worldviews. What is meant by politics here however is attached to the recognitive identification with culture from which normative orientations are grounded. The political agenda in it would be the articulation of social experience itself that could gain political voice for emancipation employing one's normative resources for articulation.

Cordero's poetics of diagnosis charges local language and metaphors with social and political consciousness of concrete experiences in the region. The metaphor *Pulang Signos* (Red Omens) for example depicts the concrete signs of a society plagued with maladies, a local condition akin to the "wrong state of things"[44] pronounced by Theodor Adorno. These visible signs are everyday sights in which the people have gotten used to and thus, perceived already as *normal* part of their everyday lives such as "the red lights planted near the top of the mountain" referring to cell cites symbolically referring to the technological alteration of the communicative interaction among people, "the towers with red lights guarding persons of power" referring to radio stations normalizing patronage politics through everyday broadcasting of biased information, and the "the red ideology being fought for by those who went to the mountains"[45] symbolizing the political conflict for decades that occasionally bursts into violence. The appearance of these red lights is identified by Cordero as the new transfiguration of the *yawa* or demons.

Like in physical sickness where the symptoms foretell a deeper malady, Cordero metaphorically identifies the ultimate cause of social malaise—the *Bakunawa* which digs deeper into the memory of the region and connects it to the translocal histories of the country and to wider Asian culture in which this mythical creature is found endemic.[46] But in the social experience of Bikolanos in which the form of the Bakunawa take shape in Cordero's poetry, the serpent incarnates in the figure of a person far from its original hideous face. In his first poetry collection, the Bakunawa is depicted in a very familiar image showing that the serpent has already descended into the everyday lives of the people with politics as is his game:[47]

---

[44] Theodor W. Adorno, *Negative Dialectics* (New York: Routledge, 1973), 11.

[45] Kristian Cordero, *Santigwar: Mga Rawitdawit sa Bikol asin Filipino*, (Goldprint Publishing House: Naga City, 2006), 5.

[46] See McCoy's "*Baylan*: Animist Religion and Philippine Peasant Ideology."

[47] Kristian Cordero, *Mga Tulang Tulala: Mga Piling Tula sa Filipino, Bikol at Rinconada* (Naga, Pilipinas: Goldprint Publishing House, 2007), 52. All translations are mine.

Mangingenotan siya sa pag-inom nin lambanog, Mapakawat sa gabos na kalalakihan sa salog.	He will lead the drinking of coconut wine, He will sponsor the boys' game in the river
Makikisumaro sa mga daragang nagbabarayle, Mapamibi kasabay an mga madre asin prayle.	He will join the dancing ladies, He will pray with the nuns and friars.
Mapagurit nin saiyang gira sa gabos na tinampo Asin sa gabos na aki saiyang magiging makuapo.	He will mark his name on all concrete roads, And all children will be his grandchildren.
Mapatugdok siya nin mga gripo sa hrarayong baryo Asin magiging katood niya an duktor asin albularyo.	He will install faucets in faraway barrios, And all doctors and healers will be his friends.
An saiyang pangaran magiging bantugan Sa bilog na rona na saiyang nasasakupan.	His name will be popular Throughout the region under his power
Alagad dai aram kan banwaan na binalingaw Na si Bakunawa daing untok pa man sa pag-ringgaw:	But the town was unaware of the warning That *Bakunawa* never ceased messing.
Mayo nang yaman sa kadagatan, an kabukidan kinalbo, An kultura dai magiromdoman. asin gobyerno kinakalburo	Sea resources depleted, mountains deforested The culture in amnesia and government manipulated.
Asin luhay-luhay na si Bakunawa magiging bundat giraray. Magaraba an saiyang mga pinagibong tulay.	And slowly *Bakunawa* shall again be full, The bridges he built will fall.
Dangan pag-abot kan kadikloman, mahihiling kan banwaan Na mayo na sindang magayon na bulan sa kalangitan	Then as night comes, the town shall know That their moon in the sky is no more.

Then in *Santigwar*, Bakunawa's birth is welcomed by the people themselves like rejoicing for the Messiah who came to save mankind and promised heaven to the faithful.

Nag-ogma an banwaan ta bako daang totoo an sumpa dawa ngani aram ninda na sa uwak ipinangidam an aking mapadagos kan dinastiya sa probinsya	The town rejoiced for they thought the curse was naught despite knowing that a relish for crow filled the appetite of its mother who conceived the heir of dynasty in the province.

In one metaphor, Cordero captures in a single streak the entrenched and interconnected social problems plaguing the region—political dynasty, complicity and passivity of the people, poverty, and environmental degradation. What is worse

is that these have been normalized, it has become part of the everyday lives of Bikolanos to the extent that they could no longer recognize the enemy in their midst. The solution therefore is the procedure which has always been available, only that it has not been conceived necessary by the masses. They could not *see* it as needed, in the same way an affluent individual would do, as a last resort after having gone through all medical measures. The poet and writer ought to perform thus *Pagsantigwar sa Banwaan*—the ritual needed to identify the causes of social malaise:[48]

Santigwaron niyato an banwaan.	Let us diagnose our land.
Kumu'a nin dakulang daso	Get a big torch
na dai napapara an liwanag	with a light that won't quench.
Gamiton an kalayo kan bulkan	Use the volcano's fire
na minapakusog kan satuyang mga kalag	That strengthens our souls.
Asin kun mangaranan asin mabidbiran	And once we have recognized and
Na nyato an mga yawang ini	named these demons
siring sa mga bagyo asin iba pang	like the typhoons and other misfortunes,
kadimalasan, saka lamang maoomayan	Only then shall our land
an mga helang kan satuyang banwaan	be healed from its maladies

While typhoons that strike and ravage the region year after year have been given names, the agents of social devastation have remained anonymous. Not that they are unidentifiable for these demons or serpent incarnate live visibly among the people. But naming it is taboo because doing so would perturb the society, a society which has learned to derive pleasure and tranquility from being underneath their power. *Pagsantigwar* as the poet's task henceforth demands a valiant act of naming the unnamable bolstered by the "volcano's fire." While the poem targets big names in politics the metaphor may stand for any dominant power that hinder autonomous flourishing of the society such as estranged labor, education for profit, and cultural neglect. In other words, *Santigwar* in Cordero's poetics is social criticism in literary imagination—a semantic bridge for *Santigwar's* relocation into the terrain of philosophical ideation.

Santigwar as Immanent Critique: From Metaphor to Philosophical Praxis

Whereas Axel Honneth (and Seyla Benhabib) found in Ralph Elison's novel *The Inivisible Man* the literary piece for the philosophical deployment of the epistemology of recognition (*Anerkennung*), and the absence thereof, in the concept of

[48] Cordero, *Santigwar: Mga Rawitdawit sa Bikol asin Filipino,* 11.

"invisibility,"[49] I see in Kristian Cordero's *Santigwar* a local piece of literature that captures what is called in Honneth's social theory as an immanent critique of society. This mode of critique launches from the fundamental principle of recognition which serves as the socio-ontological foundation for the coming to be of persons in the society. Social critique in this context should always be grounded on the moral claims of persons which inform their normative orientations as individual persons, as entitled with rights, and as members of distinct cultural groups.

The metaphor of invisibility depicts the reality of moral affronts to identity claims in the experience of having been deliberately denied of recognition. As Honneth writes, "for the affected persons in particular, their 'invisibility' has in each case a real core: they actually *feel* themselves not to be perceived"[50] (Italics mine). These feelings presuppose the moral grammar of struggles for recognition which facilitates the flourishing and autonomy of agents in the society but have nonetheless been suspended due to experiences of disrespect. Disrespect (*Mißachtung*) is identified by Honneth as the "normative foundation of social critique."[51] Its German term, as Joel Anderson explains, "refers not merely to a failure to show proper deference but rather to a broad class of cases, including humiliation, degradation, insult, disenfranchisement, and even physical abuse."[52] Social critique is the philosophical enterprise of providing a "semantic bridge" where these experiences of misrecognition could be brought into the threshold of articulation to effect both individual and collective identity formation. Honneth explains well that:

> the need for such semantics is met by the moral doctrines or ideas that are able normatively to enrich our notions of social community. Along with the prospect of broadened recognition relations, these languages open up an interpretive perspective for identifying the social causes of individual injuries. Thus, as soon as ideas of this sort have gained influence within a society, they generate a subcultural horizon of interpretation within which experiences of disrespect that, previously, had been fragmented and had been coped with privately can then become the moral motives for a collective 'struggle for recognition'.[53]

Various forms of misrecognition are concrete signs of social pathologies. Honneth uses the clinical term "pathology" to describe "misdevelopments" in social

---

[49] Axel Honneth and Avishai Margalit, "Invisibility: On the Epistemology of Recognition," *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society 75* (2001).

[50] *Ibid*., 113.

[51] Axel Honneth, *Disrespect: The Normative Foundation of Critical Theory,* trans. John Farell (Cambridge: Polity Press, 2007).

[52] Joel Anderson, "Translator's Note" in *The Struggle for Recognition: The Moral Grammar of Social Conflicts* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1995), viii.

[53] *Ibid*., 164.

relations aimed at by criticism.[54] In medical language the term refers to an unhealthy physical condition but, metaphorically it denotes a society which has taken a wrong turn in the formation of autonomous identities. Thus, philosophizing today assumes the task of social diagnosis, "a therapeutic self-critique"[55] performed not "from the outside" but within the very context of the "well-established constellation of practical norms and beliefs"[56] of the society. From Michael Walzer, Honneth assumes the position that a social critic cannot be too distant from the hermeneutic contexts of the local culture otherwise "become a 'dispassionate stranger' or an 'estranged native' who is no longer able to decipher the normative force and moral richness of local understandings."[57] If, however, the critic:

> follows the procedure of radical interpretation by linking up immanently with the local stock of moral norms in order to apply it critically to the individual case by means of creative interpretations, he or she will come to embody the figure of a 'local judge', i.e., a person sufficiently familiar with his or her social life-world to be able to credibly assume the role of a loyal critic 'who, angrily and insistently, sometimes at considerable personal risk..., objects, protests, and remonstrates.[58]

Honneth returns to Adorno and Horkheimer's *Dialectic of Enlightenment* to show what a diagnosis of pathology would be like in a form of what he calls a "disclosing critique of society." Honneth perceives in this work a philosophizing that does not proceed argumentatively in driving home ideas but rather, incites new ways of looking at life in presenting a picture of social reality that challenges present day values. In that work Adorno and Horkheimer showed that contrary to the popular belief in the enlightenment as a triumph of man's freedom and flourishing, humanity in fact "was sinking into a new kind of barbarism."[59] Through their reinterpretation of the *Odyssey* the authors were able to depict figuratively the elimination of human freedom in concepts such as sacrifice and renunciation which were already contained in the myth while the enlightenment was unveiled as a relapse into myth in the subjection of the truth to the sovereign will of the subject.[60] The rise of modern science and totalitarian systems are the historical events captured by this representation under the fundamental philosophical thesis of the domination of nature whereas the concept of

---

[54] Honneth, *Disrespect: The Normative Foundation of Critical Theory,* 56.
[55] *Ibid*., 57.
[56] *Ibid*., 53.
[57] *Ibid*.
[58] *Ibid*.
[59] Max Horkheimer and Theodor Adorno, *Dialectic of Enlightenment: Philosophical Fragments,* ed. Gunzelin Schmid Noerr, trans. Edmund Jephcott (Stanford, California: Stanford University Press, 2002), xiv.
[60] *Ibid*., xviii.

the culture industry was introduced to expose the final threat to everything that is left in being human—art—which most of the first generation of critical theorists have felt as the last resource for social emancipation.

As exemplified by Adorno and Horkheimer, a disclosing critique of society attempts to "change our value beliefs by evoking new ways of seeing" drawing on "linguistic resources that, by condensing or shifting meaning, reveal facts hitherto unperceived in social reality. Narrative presentation and the formation of suggestive metaphors are among the rhetorical figures that can serve to open up a new context of meaning."[61] Honneth clearly perceives the value of literary imagination in the conduct of social diagnosis where experiences of suffering in the various forms of misrecognition are provided with the means for articulation. In one interview he affirms that novels give empirical basis to his writing which empirical research in sociology could not render because "it is very often too quantitative and not sensitive enough to the nuances in everyday life."[62] In another instance he confers in literature or "the experience of art in general" the strengthening of "our capacity to perceive situations and events from the point of view of the [individual] other, and to include this unique viewpoint in evaluating moral conflicts."[63] Ellison's novel is a good example of this that extends one's ambit of vision to the experience of suffering of black Americans as well as of other marginalized "others."

The difference however between a work of art and social diagnosis is that: "whereas in aesthetic representation the opening of new contexts of meaning can transpire without bounds, so to speak, in social criticism it remains bound to the limits set by the actual constraints of social reproduction."[64] This is why the philosopher-critic cannot assume the "view from nowhere"[65] in his articulation of various forms of moral affronts otherwise miss out its local social contexts. Pathologies presuppose moral conceptions, norms which are culturally defined thus, as Honneth writes, "it is only by hermeneutic reference to a society's self-understanding that social functions or their disorders can be determined."[66] Borrowing Gottfried Schweiger's reading: "the normative benchmark of the recognition approach is the universal value of undistorted self-realization which can only be realized in contingent historical, social or otherwise relative forms."[67] This

---

[61] Honneth, *Disrespect: The Normative Foundation of Critical Theory*, 57.

[62] Goncalo Marcelo, "Recognition and Critical Theory Today: An Interview with Axel Honneth," *Philosophy and Social Criticism* 39:2 (2013): 215.

[63] Axel Honneth, "Literary Imagination and Morality: A Modest Query of an Immodest Proposal," *Philosophy & Social Criticism* 24:41 (1998), 45.

[64] Honneth, *Disrespect: The Normative Foundation of Critical Theory,* 58.

[65] *Ibid*., 53.

[66] *Ibid*., 34-35.

[67] Gottfried Schweiger, "Globalizing Recognition: Global Justice and the Dialectic of Recognition," *Public Reason* 4:1-2 (2012): 79.

relative aspect of recognition grounds therefore the trajectory that philosophy takes as immanent critique.

Paolo Bolaños' advocacy of appropriating Frankfurt Critical Theory in general for a more materialist-anthropological standpoint in doing philosophy in the Philippines is anchored in critical theory's potency as "theoretical practical tools in diagnosing societal ills in the Philippines."[68] He observes in truth that "the philosophical enterprise here in the Philippines, as we know it, suffers from a failure to reflect on factual realities that materially shape our psycho-socio-political behavior and ensuing pathological consequences therein."[69] Through Honneth's social theory, Bolaños enunciates then the fundamental task of a "critical reading of our normative life"[70] which I take as a strategic function of philosophers working in the regions. The archipelagic context of the Philippines implies a diversity of norms and practices that inform everyday self-understanding and therefore, pathologies too in unique local conditions. And the rich fund of local literary resources provides this mode of doing philosophy a greater sensitivity to the experience of others and the attunement to everyday life experience.

Cordero's poetry written in Bikol language and using images from the local culture to depict current experience in a different light has been shown to capture in metaphorical form this manner of doing philosophy. While there could be other hermeneutic possibilities for *santigwar*, keeping in mind the characteristic of aesthetic production cited by Honneth, the concept of diagnosis signified by the metaphor renders it as a model for a local concept of social criticism. From the medical sense of detection and definition of physical illnesses to the social significance of identifying social pathologies, the concept of diagnosis enunciated in *Santigwar* assumes a local, Bikolano version, of "philosophical praxis." Bolaños' articulation of the three moments of this process consistently reinforces the claims ushered in this paper: a critique grounded on the receptivity to the dynamics of our normative behavior, the critical assessment of normative resources, and the social emancipation right in the very locus of the normative practices and experiences of a given society.[71]

As in the language of both the healer and the poet, *santigwar* as philosophical praxis is an exigency issuing forth from the very facticity of the social body. This entails that *pagsantigwar* is no longer simply a task for "experts" in physical healing, or in writing as Cordero designates it among poets and writers. In so far as every individual is a member of society and partake of the suffering brought about by "invisible" and anonymous forces, *santigwar* becomes a task of critical thinking for

[68] Paolo A. Bolaños, "The Ethics of Recognition and the Normativity of Social Relations: Some Notes on Axel Honneth's Materialist Philosophical Anthropology," *Suri* 1:1 (2011): 16.

[69] *Ibid*.

[70] *Ibid*., 18.

[71] Bolaños, "The Ethics of Recognition and the Normativity of Social Relations: Some Notes on Axel Honneth's Materialist Philosophical Anthropology," 18-19.

everyone. This mode of thinking is marked by sensitivity to one's experiences and normative practices that enables one to question and therefore, resist the normalization of a pathological condition. Being able to identify the need for *pagsantigwar*—of critical thinking—in times and situations where it is most needed, but otherwise perceived or deliberately screened off by others, is the local significance highlighted and gleaned from its Bikol context. Yet social critique is a task for everyone across cultures which decentralizes therefore the critical potential and function of *santigwar* from its culture-specific origination. As Cordero has already performed in his poetics, *santigwar* could also serve as a local version of social critique of conditions plaguing the global village—that of Capitalism, the upsurge of populism, truth decay,[72] and looming environmental collapse which all need to rise into the conscious level of *crisis* among the people.

The Bikolano healer, the poet, and the philosopher as *parasantigwar* share then a parallel experience: an intense awareness of oppression and a vocation to diagnose illnesses which is the first step towards healing. And perhaps the most fundamental social diagnosis which *santigwar* proffers, as in Cordero's poetics, is the complicity with malignant forces that make the society sick in the normalization of suffering and refusal to "see" *santigwar* as a necessity for the society. As philosophical praxis, *pagsantigwar sa banwaan* is henceforth geared towards emancipation for "the people who have nothing"—a metonymy gleaned from Cannell for persons experiencing various forms of oppression in the society whose freedom for articulation and participation is hindered by disrespect and various forms of social pathologies. But social emancipation nonetheless could only be carried out by the people's agentive praxis themselves shaken from their complicity and refusal to *see*.

Concluding Remarks

The mode of philosophizing elaborated in this paper which is figuratively deployed as *Pagsantigwar sa Banwaan* is a localization of social critique reinforced by Honneth's recognitive theory. And as in the tradition of Frankfurt Critical Theory's engagement with other disciplines, it endeavored to explore the anthropological and historical normative bases for articulating *santigwar* as a local concept of critique which was already made possible by Kristian Cordero's poetics of diagnosis.

[72] According to Kavanaugh and Rich this phenomenon is defined by a set of four related trends namely "(1) increasing disagreement about facts and analytical interpretations of facts and data, (2) a blurring of the line between opinion and fact, (3) the increasing relative volume, and resulting influence, of opinion and personal experience over fact, (4) declining trust in formerly respected sources of factual information." Jennifer Kavanaugh and Michael D. Rich, *Truth Decay: An Initial Exploration of the Diminishing Role of Facts and Analysis in American Public Life* (Santa Monica, California: RAND Corporation, 2018), 3.

As an immanent critique, *santigwar* is now enunciated as a diagnostic enterprise, gleaned from Bikol experience, of articulating social maladies which hinders the flourishing and autonomous development of individuals and the society. It entails grounding criticism on the foothold of normative practices and values of the people and a rigorous discourse with other thought disciplines which encapsulate the normative experiences of the people. Critical assessment therefore cannot take a universalist standpoint uprooted from the local contexts and moral claims of subjects to avoid "free-floating interpretations of normative values."[73] And from *santigwar*'s original exigency of identifying and courageously naming the cause(s) of aberrations, no values and experience shall be left uncritically examined. Henceforth, even if Cordero has liberated the critical potential of *santigwar* from its culture-specific significance, the exigency of immanent critique in *santigwar* rebounds even to the writers themselves who are now the new agents of "healing" in Cordero's poetics as they too form part of the social with all its body of normative interests.

Furthermore, while maintaining its local foothold, the ambit of critical consciousness implied in *santigwar* extends even beyond, but not unrelated to, social recognition. Even from its use value and significance to the folk healer, *santigwar* has always posited the relation between the physical body and the objective world in as much the physical illnesses that the healer treats are caused by external entities in the world. The critical consciousness of *santigwar* in its new philosophical signification covers therefore all other contributors to the reification of human experience such as a distorted mode of relating with the environment. Even Honneth needed to rethink his concept of recognition in response to a deficit in the theoretical grounding for the relation between man and the objective world in his early works.[74] Honneth does this by reintroducing a renewed perspective of the old idea of reification as a forgetfulness of *empathetic engagement* or "the primordial form of relating with the world as 'recognition' in its most elementary form."[75] The world however within which the healer operates is both intersubjective and natural. But human activity causes disruption in this still active relation between man and the (disrespected) environment which the *parasantigwar* (healer) diagnoses and mediates to retrieve health for the individual, the efficacy of which is undermined when the service is rendered for profit instead of the purpose of healing itself. In parallelism, *santigwar* as

---

[73] Ronald D.S. Theuas Pada, *Axel Honneth's Social Philosophy of Recognition: Freedom, Normativity, and Identity* (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2017), 49.

[74] Jean Philippe Deranty points this out in his critique that Honneth's concept of recognition is too confined to the intersubjective that it has lost the critical resource for engaging man's relation with nature. "The Loss of Nature in Axel Honneth's Theory of Recognition: Rereading Mead with Merleau-Ponty," *Critical Horizons* 6 (2005): 153-181.

[75] Axel Honeth, *Reification: A New Look at an Old Idea* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), 37.

local philosophical praxis could only legitimately function as "social healing" if it is attuned to the project of emancipation itself "for the people who have nothing."

References

Adorno, Theodor W. *Negative Dialectics*. New York: Routledge, 1973.

Almario, Virgilio. *Seven Mountains of the Imagination*. Translated and edited by Marne Kilates. Manila, Philippines: UST Publishing House, 2011.

Ariola, Maria Sharon. "Spirituality among the Bikolanos: a perspective in contemporary practices." In *2011 International Conference on Humanities, Society and Culture IPEDR Vol.20*, 186-190. Singapore: IACSIT Press. 2011.

Benjamin, Walter. "The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction." In *Illuminations*. Edited by Hannah Arendt. Translated by Harry Zohn, 1-26. New York: Schocken Books, 1969

Bolaños, Paolo A. "The Ethics of Recognition and the Normativity of Social Relations: Some Notes on Axel Honneth's Materialist Philosophical Anthropology." *Suri* 1:1 (2011): 15-24.

Cannell, Fenella. *Power and Intimacy in the Christian Philippines*. Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University Press, 1999.

———. "The Imitation of Christ in Bikol, Philippines." *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 1:2 (June 1995): 377-394. http://www.jstor.org/stable/3034694

Cerio, Calyd T. "Albularyo Folk Healing: Cultural Beliefs on Healthcare Management in Partido District, Camarines Sur, Philippines." *Journal of Southeast Asian Studies* 25:1 (June 2020): 210-237. doi: https://doi.org/10.22452/jati.vol25no1.11

Conde, Jesus Cyril M. "Hybrid Christianity in the Oral Literature and Ethno-botany of the Agtas of Mount Asog in the Bikol Region of the Philippines." *FILOCRACIA* 1:1 (February 2014): 133-155.

Cordero, Kristian. "Metapora asin Memorya sa Santigwar: Hurop-Hurop asin Diskurso." *Pagpukaw: An Invitation to Philosophize* 4 (2008): 21–34.

———. *Mga Tulang Tulala: Mga Piling Tula sa Filipino, Bikol at Rinconada*. Naga, Pilipinas: Goldprint Publishing House, 2007.

———. *Santigwar: Mga Rawitdawit sa Bikol asin Filipino*. Goldprint Publishing House: Naga City, 2006.

———. "Writing a Novena: Poetics, Pilgrimages and Performances in Bikol, Philippines" (Accessed April 10, 2021), https://corderokanbikol.tumblr.com/page/4.

Derranty, Jean Philippe. "The Loss of Nature in Axel Honneth's Theory of Recognition: Rereading Mead with Merleau-Ponty." *Critical Horizons* 6 (2005): 153-181.

Gerona, Danilo M. "Text and Politics: Transactions of Power in the Early Provincial Philippines." *Asian Studies* 34 (1998): 15-49.

Henry, Rodney L. *Filipino Spirit World: A Challenge to the Church*. Manila, Philippines: OMF Literature, Inc., 2001.

Honneth, Axel. *Disrespect: The Normative Foundation of Critical Theory*, translated by John Farell. Cambridge: Polity Press, 2007.

Honneth, Axel and Margalit, Avishai. "Invisibility: On the Epistemology of Recognition." *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* 75 (2001): 111-139.

Honneth, Axel. "Literary Imagination and Morality: A Modest Query of an Immodest Proposal." *Philosophy & Social Criticism* 24:41 (1998): 41-47. Doi: https://doi.org/10.1177/019145379802400204

———. *Reification: A New Look at an Old Idea.* New York: Oxford University Press, 2008.

———. *The Struggle for Recognition: The Moral Grammar of Social Conflicts*. Translated by Joel Anderson. Cambridge: Polity Press, 1995.

Horkheimer, Max and Adorno, Theodor. *Dialectic of Enlightenment: Philosophical Fragments.* Edited by Gunzelin Schmid Noerr. Translated by Edmund Jephcott. Stanford, California: Stanford University Press, 2002.

Ileto, Reynaldo C. *Pasyon and Revolution: Popular Movements in the Philippines, 1840-1910*. Quezon City, Philippines: Ateneo de Manila University, 1979.

Jocano, F. Landa. "Filipino Catholicism: A Case Study in Religious Change (1967)." *Asian Studies: Journal of Critical Perspectives on Asia* 55:1-2 (2019): 69-101.

Kavanaugh, Jennifer and Rich, Michael D. *Truth Decay: An Initial Exploration of the Diminishing Role of Facts and Analysis in American Public Life.* Santa Monica, California: RAND Corporation, 2018.

Labayo, Czarina Ceballo. "Living in danger: Exploring the culture of disaster of the Ati peoples in Bohol, Philippines." *Journal of International Development of Cooperation* 28:1-2 (2019): 1-12.

Loza, Camille Ann A., et. al. "Metonymies of Tawong Lipod in Cagliliog, Tinambac, Camarines Sur: Counter-memory to Christian Hegemony in Bikol, Philippines." *Advanced Science Letters* 22:5 (May 2016): 1589-1592. Doi: 10.1166/asl.2016.6693

Marcelo, Goncalo. "Recognition and Critical Theory Today: An Interview with Axel Honneth." *Philosophy and Social Criticism* 39:2 (2013): 209-221.

Mintz, Malcolm. Bikol Dictionary. Honolulu: University of Hawaii, 1971.

McCoy, Alfred W. "Baylan: Animist Religion and Philippine Peasant Ideology." In *Moral Order and the Question of Change: Essays on Southeast Asian Thought*,. Edited by David K. Wyatt and Alexander Woodside. New Haven, Connecticut: Yale University Southeast Asia Studies, 1982.

Pada, Roland Theuas DS. *Axel Honneth's Social Philosophy of Recognition: Freedom, Normativity, and Identity.* Newcastle upon Tyne, UK: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2019

Rafael, Vicente. *Contracting Colonialism: Translation and Christian Conversion in Tagalog Society under Early Spanish Rule.* Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University Press, 1988.

Rafael, Vicente. "Nationalism, Imagery, and the Filipino Intelligentsia in the Nineteenth Century." *Critical Inquiry* 16:3 (Spring, 1990): 591-611.

Schweiger, Gottfried. "Globalizing Recognition: Global Justice and the Dialectic of Recognition." *Public Reason* 4:1-2 (2012): 78-91.

Scott, William Henry. *Barangay: Sixteenth Century Philippine Culture and Society*. Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University Press, 1994.