

A REVIEW OF ETHNIC IDENTITY IN ADVERTISING

Jeremy J. Sierra
Texas State University – San Marcos
San Marcos, TX, USA

Michael R. Hyman
New Mexico State University
Las Cruces, NM, USA

Robert S. Heiser
University of Southern Maine
Portland, ME, USA

File name: Sierra_Hyman_Heiser_Encyclopedia.docx

Please send all correspondence regarding this manuscript to Michael R. Hyman, Stan Fulton Chair of Marketing, New Mexico State University, College of Business, Box 30001, Dept. 5280, Las Cruces, NM 88003-8001, e-mail: mhyman@nmsu.edu, Phone: 575-646-5238, Fax: 575-646-1498

© 2009 by Jeremy J. Sierra, Michael R. Hyman, and Robert S. Heiser

A REVIEW OF ETHNIC IDENTITY IN ADVERTISING

ABSTRACT

Published research on *ethnic identity in advertising* differs by underlying theoretical framework, measurement type (i.e., single-item measure versus multi-item scale), study design (i.e., experiment versus survey), and diversity of respondent sample. A meta-analysis indicates that ethnic identity effects are higher for atheoretical studies that relied on single-item measures, experimental designs, and less diverse samples. For ethnically resonant ads, attitudes toward both actor(s)/model(s) and the ad moderate brand attitudes. Overall, ethnic identity influences several commonly studied attitudinal and purchase-intention outcomes.

Key words: attitudes; advertising; ethnic identity; meta-analysis; purchase intentions

WHAT IS ETHNIC IDENTITY AND HOW DOES IT RELATE TO ADVERTISING?

Ethnic identity entails self-identification as an ethnic group member, a sense of belonging to this group, and favorable attitudes toward this group (Phinney, 1992); it can be used as a way to overcome ad clutter and influence viewer responses to the traditional hierarchy-of-effects model in advertising. As ad impressions continue to mount, advertisers' difficulty in reaching their targeted consumers increases. One approach that may help overcome this difficulty entails the inclusion of ethnically resonant cues in ads, which may lead viewers to ethnically identify with such stimuli (Green, 1999); such methods have been shown to generate favorable viewer responses toward the ad and advertised brand (Sierra, Hyman, and Torres, 2009). Also, ads that depict ethnic characters, images, and values may lead ethnically resonant consumers to identify with the featured brand (Koslow, Shamdasani, and Touchstone, 1994).

MEASURING ETHNIC IDENTITY IN ADVERTISING STUDIES

Ethnic identity is an enduring, underlying sense of connection to a social group (Tajfel, 1978). Strength of ethnic identity (i.e., strength of identity with one's ethnic origin [Deshpandé, Hoyer, and Donthu, 1986] or enduring association between one's ethnicity and sense of self [Forehand and Deshpandé, 2001]) can affect consumers' responses to marketing activities, shopping orientations, and product/service choices (Green, 1999).

Adolescents are more likely to believe and identify with ads laced with ethnically resonant cues (Appiah, 2001a). Relative to Blacks with weaker ethnic identities, Blacks with stronger ethnic identities see themselves as more similar to, and identify more strongly with, Black characters in ads (Appiah, 2001a; Whittler, 1989); the same is true of Hispanics and Asians (Appiah, 2001b). For example, Blacks with strong ethnic self-identities more strongly identify with ads that use Black actors than ads that use Hispanic actors. Also, strong Hispanic identifiers prefer media that use Spanish verbiage (Deshpandé, Hoyer, and Donthu, 1986), which suggests that strength of ethnic identity relates positively with tendencies to notice and identify with ethnically resonant ads.

Although careful in-depth questioning could reveal respondents' ethnic identity, expense and time issues preclude such questioning for large-sample empirical ad studies. Hence, researchers typically rely on standardized measures of ethnic identity. Specifically, researchers assess ethnicity in two ways: self-designated ethnicity—identifying oneself as belonging to an ethnic group—and felt ethnicity—how strongly one identifies with an ethnic group. Self-designated ethnicity is measured with a single, closed-ended question that asks respondents to indicate if they are Hispanic, Black, White, Asian, or Other. Felt ethnicity or strength of ethnic identity often is measured with the Multi-group Measure of Ethnic Identification (Phinney, 1992). This measure, which applies to diverse samples and has proven reliable in previous studies, consists of five statements about ethnic attachment, feelings about ethnic background, happiness with ethnicity, ethnic pride, and sense of ethnic belonging. Responses to each statement are captured by a seven-point Likert scale anchored by *strongly disagree* to *strongly agree*.

REVIEW OF PREVIOUS EMPIRICAL STUDIES ON ETHNICITY AND ADVERTISING

Studies that qualified for review examined advertising-related effects of ethnic identification. In most studies, ethnicity was manipulated as an independent variable. Typically, respondents first read a magazine with filler and test ads. The test ads were identical in all regards but model ethnicity. Then respondents indicated their attitudes and/or purchase intentions toward

the target ads and brands. Many studies assessed ethnic identification with an ethnic-identity or perceived-similarity measure.

Studies were identified through (1) a keyword search of journal aggregator databases in business, communications, education, and psychology (e.g., ABI/Inform, EBSCO, ERIC, PsycInfo), (2) a search for conference proceedings in Papers First and marketing society web sites (e.g., AMA, SMA), (3) an online search for articles using keywords from uncovered articles, and (4) listserv requests to business and psychology researchers for copies of published or unpublished manuscripts. Excluded studies examined effects of ethnic identification on non-advertising outcomes, such as political affiliation, psychological assessments, and educational outcomes. Because few studies examined brand-related outcomes—such as brand prestige, brand loyalty, and brand awareness—those constructs were ignored.

Ultimately, 25 empirical articles—all published since 1971—were identified for review. In terms of studies per decade, the 2000s (11) and 1990s (8) are most prolific. The most common publication outlets were *Journal of Advertising*, *Journal of Advertising Research*, *Journal of Marketing Research*, and *Psychology & Marketing*, with four articles each, respectively; and, the most prolific authors were Deshpandé (6 articles), Whittler (3 articles), and several researchers with 2 articles (e.g., Appiah, Brumbaugh). The Table summarizes the 25 articles.

<Table near here>

Ethnicities Studied

The most common ethnic cues in test ads portray Whites (75% of studies), Blacks (57% of studies), Hispanics (21% of studies), and Asians (14% of studies). These four ethnic groups are biggest spenders and represent the largest population subgroups in the United State (*U.S. Census Bureau*, 2001).

Theoretical Frameworks Applied

Nine theoretical frameworks have been used to explain the effects of ethnic identity in advertising. Each framework, which offers unique explanatory power, may be encapsulated as follows.

- *Accommodation Theory* proposes that people generally like other people who share similar traits, which suggests, for example, that Black viewers will respond favorably to ads that use Black actors.
- *Cultural Script Theory* emphasizes the portrayal of cultural themes and values, distinct to an ethnic group, through social communication, which suggests that the use of Spanish or *Spanglish* verbiage in ads may resonant favorably with Hispanic viewers.
- *Distinctiveness Theory* posits that a person's distinctive or unique characteristics are more important to him/her than other local peoples' common traits. This theory suggests why Hispanics living in a Hispanic-minority-White-majority region are more likely to trust a Hispanic rather than White actor in an ad.
- The *Elaboration Likelihood Model* suggests that attitudinal responses stem from central route (i.e., high elaboration) or peripheral route (i.e., low elaboration) processes. As a result, Hispanic viewers may peripherally assess an ad for a Hispanic product when a Hispanic actor is used, and may centrally assess an ad for a Hispanic product when a White actor is used.

- The *Heuristic-Systematic Persuasion Model* posits that message credence is evaluated either heuristically (i.e., casual evaluation) or systematically (i.e., scrutinized evaluation). For example, Asian viewers may systematically evaluate ads embedded with Asian cues because they trust an ethnically resonant source.
- *Identification Theory* suggests that people examine their similarity with environmental sources and then make similarity judgments, which may lead to Black viewers identifying more with ads that use Black actors rather than White actors.
- *In-Group Bias Theory* proposes that people favor in-group members, based on some characteristic, more than out-group members. As a result, Whites should evaluate White actors more favorably in ads with White and Asian actors.
- *Polarized Appraisal Theory* suggests that in-group members will evaluate in-group stimuli less extremely than out-group stimuli. This theory implies that Hispanics will evaluate an ad with a Black spokesperson more thoroughly than an otherwise identical ad with a Hispanic spokesperson of comparable character.
- *Social Identity Theory* posits that people's self-concept stems from their social and self identities, which in turn contribute to self image and satisfaction. Hence, ads with embedded ethnic cues allow viewers in the targeted ethnic group to differentiate themselves from others, which reinforces their self-identity and uniqueness.

Collectively, these theoretical frameworks suggest that favorable advertising effects may ensue from ethnic identification with ads. They offer insights about greater responsiveness to ads that reflect resonant cultural values, increased trustworthiness of actors of similar ethnicity, and enhanced attitudes toward ads that imply cultural sensitivity to ethnic minorities; yet, researchers' reliance on these various frameworks does not explain the inconsistent findings on ethnic-identity effects in advertising. The frameworks most often applied to ethnic identity studies are Distinctiveness Theory (10 studies) and two studies each relied on Identification Theory, In-Group Bias Theory, Accommodation Theory, and the Heuristic-Systematic Persuasion Model. They can account for some effects of advertising on consumers, such as greater responsiveness to ads that reflect analogous cultural values, increased trustworthiness of actors of similar ethnicity, and enhanced attitudes toward ads that imply advertisers' cultural sensitivity to ethnic minorities.

Standard Study Procedures

The most recurrent research question was response differences among ethnic groups—Blacks, Whites, Hispanics, and Asians—to ads with various ethnic cues. At least one ethnic cue appears in the test ads for all but two studies. Test ads depicted only two ethnic groups in 80% of studies, which may inhibit the generalizability of reported findings (Brumbaugh and Grier, 2006). Print or television ads were assessed in 92% of studies. The most common ethnic cues in test ads suggest Whites (77% of studies), Blacks (54% of studies), and Hispanics (22% of studies).

The mean sample size, which ranges from 62 to 648 (excluding an ethnographic study with 13,443 observations), is 239 people. The samples represent much of the U.S.: eight are Western, five are Southwestern, and three are Midwestern and Southern. Eleven studies rely on student samples—seven of undergraduate students, two of MBA students, and two of high school students—and eleven studies rely on adult samples. Thus, reported findings reflect responses of a roughly even mix of students and adults located throughout the U.S.

In terms of the methods employed, typically respondents first were exposed to advertising stimuli, including filler and test ads. For the most part, test ads were identical in all regards but model ethnicity. Subsequently, responses were gathered about the ad, advertised brand, and/or

model. Data pertaining to ethnic identity or perceived similarity with the model were often collected. Regarding the theoretical constructs examined, all studies assess some consumer attitudes (e.g., attitude toward the ad, attitude toward the brand), but only ten studies measure intention to buy the advertised brand and only three studies measure ethnic identification with the ad. Only one study examines ethnic identification with the ad and its effect on purchase intentions of the advertised brand.

The most frequently used statistical method is ANOVA, which appears thirteen times; in use order, the other methods are regression analysis (seven times), MANOVA (four times), discriminant analysis (twice), and path analysis (twice). Although 15 studies were published recently—1994 or later—structural equation modeling is used only once.

Findings

The findings generally suggest that non-White consumers, relative to White consumers, are aware of and respond more favorably to ads with ethnic cues. In five studies that contrast weak versus strong ethnic identifiers, same-ethnicity actors in ads are more favored by the latter group. The four studies on the effect of ads with ethnic language (e.g., ads with Spanish words embedded) on same-ethnicity consumers suggest that Hispanics are more likely (1) to use Spanish-language media, (2) to have more positive attitudes towards ads with Spanish verbiage, and (3) to buy a product advertised with Spanish verbiage.

In-group members of an ethnic group evaluate ad stimuli more favorably when the actors/models are from the in-group rather than an out-group (Qualls and Moore, 1990). For example, relative to Whites, Blacks develop more positive affect toward ads with Black actors (Pitts et al., 1989). Whites (Blacks) identify more with White (Black) actors than Black (White) actors, respond more favorably to ads with White (Black) actors, and are more likely to buy the advertised brand when White (Black) actors are featured (Whittler, 1989). Hence, ethnic consumers should identify with and respond more favorably to ads that target their ethnicity. However, such assumptions are not always supported. Research shows that Whites respond similarly to point-of-purchase displays with all Black models, all White models, or an amalgamation of White and Black models (Bush, Gwinner, and Solomon, 1974). Using Asian models in ads favorably affects attitudes and purchase intentions toward the featured brand for both Asian and White consumers (Martin, Lee, and Yang, 2004). Asians, Blacks, and Hispanics identify most with ads that use Black actors, and Asians, Blacks, Hispanics, and Whites evaluate ads that use Black actors more positively than ads featuring White actors (Appiah, 2001b). These inconsistent findings cloud the role of ethnic identification in advertising and complicate decisions about ad design.

Are Study Results Artifactual?

Although most ethnic identification studies relied on test ads evaluated by subjects in experimental or quasi-experimental settings, differences in method and research context may affect variance homogeneity across studies. Four possible sources of artifactual results are measurement type (i.e., single-item measure versus multi-item scale), study type (i.e., survey-based versus experiment-based), sample type (e.g., student or random adult), and media type (i.e., print versus TV).

In many cases, single-item measures can provide good assessments of concrete and well-accepted constructs, such as immediate purchase intention. However, single-item measures tend to reflect attitudinal and complex constructs less reliably, and lower reliability may cause less stable correlations. Conversely, typically more reliable and valid multi-item scales should yield more stable correlations.

Relative to surveys, experiments—by permitted control of extraneous factors that otherwise would interact with studied constructs—can generate larger effect sizes and imply inter-construct relationships that ultimately prove artifactual. Although the potentially interactive extraneous factors are infinite, many of them become known as a research stream matures.

Heterogeneous samples tend to attenuate effect size, especially in experimental studies (Fern and Monroe, 1996). Conversely, homogeneous samples may produce restricted responses due to similar respondent backgrounds, incomplete self-identity, strong need for approval, and unstable group relationships. Although some marketing scholars have found that students respond more homogeneously, and other social scientists have found limited evidence that student samples yield larger effect sizes, a recent comprehensive meta-analysis suggests otherwise (Peterson, 2001).

Although previous research showed that television ads are more effective than print ads, recent studies suggest that television ads only may dominate print ads on ad awareness (Hansen, Olsen, and Lundsteen, 2006). Perhaps ethnic-identity effects are larger for television ads than print ads because television's multi-channel visual and auditory cues induce higher-quality thoughts and feelings for ethnically resonant ads.

The large number of theoretical frameworks and small number of published studies limited framework comparisons to no-stated framework, distinctiveness theory, and in-group bias theory. Studies with no-stated framework reported significantly higher effect sizes than in-group bias studies, which in turn reported higher effect sizes than distinctiveness theory studies. Type of measurement (single versus multi-item outcome scale) and study design (experiment versus survey) help to explain some heterogeneity in attitude toward the: ad, model, brand, and purchase intentions of the advertised brand. As expected, ethnic identity effect sizes were larger in experiment-based than survey-based studies. Studies with respondents from only two ethnic groups (e.g., Hispanic and Caucasian or Black and Caucasian) produced lower effect sizes than studies with more diverse samples of three or more ethnic groups. Surprisingly, single-item measures yielded larger correlations than multi-item scales, perhaps due to the larger variety of multi-item scales used in ethnic identity studies.

The sample-weighted estimates of ethnic identity's influence on all advertising outcomes were medium-sized effects with composite r ranging from 0.18 to 0.30. Five studies reported small effect sizes ($r < 0.10$) and none reported large effect sizes ($r > 0.50$). All correlations between ethnic identity and attitude toward the ad, attitude toward the model, attitude toward the brand, and brand purchase intention were significant ($p < 0.05$).

Although methodological heterogeneity accounts for some unexplained variance in ethnic identity research, the relatively few studies with significant findings makes this result tenuous. Although researchers continue to debate the merits of student samples, we found no differences in studies with student versus non-student respondents. In the many experiment-based studies, researchers were able to maintain high internal validity and boost statistical power. As expected, questionnaire-based studies produced lower ethnic identity effect sizes. Although it does not account for response differences among ethnic groups, our analysis confirms that ethnic identity effects are activated in ethnic groups other than portrayed in test ads. Thus, generalizability concerns about ethnic identity studies in advertising may include both the limited range of test stimuli (Brumbaugh and Grier, 2006) and respondent samples.

DISCUSSION

Consumers relate to ethnically resonant ads by developing, maintaining, and enhancing their social identification and attachments to the featured brands. The results from our review of the literature indicate that ethnic identity influences all elements of the advertising hierarchy-of-effects, producing the largest effect on attitude toward the brand. The regression analysis of unique variances shows a direct linkage between attitude toward the model and attitude toward the brand. The moderation analysis suggests methodological artifacts; for example, ethnic identity effects are larger in experiment-based than survey-based studies. In addition, three studies with single-item measures produced higher correlations than studies with multi-item scales, especially with attitude toward the ad. Two of these studies examined attitude toward the ad only, and thus may have captured overall attitudes within a single-item attitude toward the ad measure.

Managerial Implications

Research shows that consumers are more likely to notice and respond favorably to an ad if it contains ethnically resonant cues (e.g., Qualls and Moore, 1990; Whittler, 1989); thus, advertisers should benefit from developing ads with such cues. Advertisers could accentuate same-ethnicity models' skin color, facial features, demeanor, verbal expression, and apparel styles, like McDonald's did with its successful Hip Hop *i'm lovin' it* ad campaign targeted at Hispanic and Black customers. With their growing popularity and efficacy, the physical traits of animated spokescharacters (e.g., skin color, hairstyles, facial features) could be adapted to targeted ethnic viewers. Ethnic identity expands beyond actors; hence, durable goods producers can foster ethnic identification via ads that focus on country of origin. For example, ads targeting Asians can stress that some product components were produced and/or the product was assembled in China. Moreover, firms can appeal to Hispanics with ads that combine Spanish and English (i.e., Spanglish) without fear of backlash from Whites (Koslow, Shamdasani, and Touchstone, 1994).

Service providers can foster ethnic identification within targeted groups via ads that celebrate annual ethnic-related occasions, such as Saint Patrick's Day (e.g., Bennigan's Grill & Tavern offering green lagers), Cinco de Mayo (e.g., Chili's Bar & Grill promoting Mexican beer), and Black History Month (e.g., Barnes & Noble bundling Black literature). To appeal to Hispanics, firms could place ads with Hispanic actors in magazines read predominantly by Whites. Although firms may believe that Hispanic actors in ads can induce negative attitude toward the ad and brand in White readers (Qualls and Moore, 1990), previous research shows that this belief is false (Whittler, 1989). Hence, ads with Hispanic actors will gain the attention of Hispanic readers without alienating White readers.

Future Research

Because ethnic identity significantly influences all stages of the hierarchy-of-effects model, future studies should explore the indirect and mediation pathways between advertising and ethnic identity, particularly within different advertising contexts and products. Also, the relative efficacy of different types of ad cues (e.g., slogans, argot) to induce ethnic identification is unknown. Although our meta-analysis uncovered moderating factors that explain some variance in ethnic identity effects, further research is needed to answer questions like "Does the tagline or actor's appearance in an ad creates stronger ethnic identity effects?"

REFERENCES

Aaker, J. L., Brumbaugh, A. M., and Grier, S. A. (2000) Nontarget markets and viewer distinctiveness: The impact of target marketing on advertising attitudes. *Journal of Consumer Psychology*, **9** (3), 127-140.

Appiah, O. (2001a) Black, White, Hispanic, and Asian American adolescents' responses to culturally embedded ads. *Howard Journal of Communications*, **12** (1), 29-48.

Appiah, O. (2001b) Ethnic identification on adolescents' evaluations of advertisements. *Journal of Advertising Research*, **41** (5), 7-22.

Brumbaugh, A. M., and Grier, S. A. (2006) Insights from a 'failed' experiment: Directions for pluralistic, multiethnic advertising research. *Journal of Advertising*, **35** (3), 35-46.

Bush, R. R., Gwinner, R. F., and Solomon, P. J. (1974) White consumer sales response to Black models. *Journal of Marketing*, **38** (2), 25-29.

Deshpandé, R., Hoyer, W. D., and Donthu, N. (1986) The intensity of ethnic affiliation: A study of sociology of ethnic consumption. *Journal of Consumer Research*, **13** (2), 214-220.

Deshpandé, R., and Stayman, D. M. (1994) A tale of two cities: Distinctiveness theory and advertising effectiveness. *Journal of Marketing Research*, **31** (1), 57-64.

Dimofte, C. V., Forehand, M. R., and Deshpandé, R. (2004) Ad schema incongruity as elicitor of ethnic self-awareness and differential advertising response. *Journal of Advertising*, **32** (4), 7-17.

Fern, E. F., and Monroe, K. B. (1996) Effect-size estimates: Issues and problems in interpretation. *Journal of Consumer Research*, **23** (2), 89-105.

Forehand, M. R., and Deshpandé, R. (2001) What we see makes us who we are: Priming ethnic self-awareness and advertising response. *Journal of Marketing Research*, **38** (3), 336-348.

Forehand, M. R., Deshpandé, R., and Reed, A. II (2002) Identity salience and the influence of differential activation of the social self-schema on advertising response. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, **87** (6), 1086-1099.

Green, C. L. (1999) Ethnic evaluations of advertising: Interaction effects of strength of ethnic identification, media placement, and degree of racial composition. *Journal of Advertising*, **28** (1), 49-64.

Grier, S. A., and Brumbaugh, A. M. (1999) Noticing cultural differences: Ad meanings created by target and non-target markets. *Journal of Advertising*, **28** (1), 79-93.

Grier, S. A., and Deshpandé, R. (2001) Social dimensions of consumer distinctiveness: The influence of social status of group identity and advertising persuasion. *Journal of Marketing Research*, **38** (2), 216-224.

- Hansen, F., Olsen, J. K., and Lundsteen, S. (2006) The effects of TV vs. print advertising, documented using STAS measures. *International Journal of Advertising*, **25** (4), 431-446.
- Koslow, S., Shamdasani, P. N., and Touchstone, E. E. (1994) Exploring language effects in ethnic advertising: A sociolinguistic perspective. *Journal of Consumer Research*, **20** (4), 575-585.
- Lee, C. K.-C., Fernandez, N., and Martin, B. A. S. (2002) Using self-referencing to explain the effectiveness of ethnic minority models in advertising. *International Journal of Advertising*, **21** (3), 367-379.
- Martin, B. A. S., Kwai-Choi Lee, C., and Yang, F. (2004) The influence of ad model ethnicity and self-referencing on attitudes. *Journal of Advertising*, **33** (4), 27-37.
- Muse, W. V. (1971) Product-related response to use of Black models in advertising. *Journal of Marketing Research*, **8** (1), 107-109.
- Peterson, R. A. (2001) On the use of college students in social science research: Insights from a second order meta-analysis. *Journal of Consumer Research*, **28** (3), 450-461.
- Phinney, J. S. (1992) The multigroup ethnic identity measure—A new scale for use with diverse groups. *Journal of Adolescent Research*, **7** (2), 156-176.
- Pitts, R. E., Whalen, J. D., O’Keefe, R., and Murray, V. (1989) Black and White response to culturally targeted television commercials: A value-based approach. *Psychology & Marketing*, **6** (4), 311-328.
- Qualls, W. J., and Moore, D. J. (1990) Stereotyping effects on consumers’ evaluation of advertising: Impact of racial differences between actors and viewers. *Psychology & Marketing*, **7** (2), 135-151.
- Roslow, P., and Nicholls, J. A. F. (1996) Targeting the Hispanic market: Comparative persuasion of TV commercials in Spanish and English. *Journal of Advertising Research*, **36** (3), 67-77.
- Sierra, J. J., Hyman, M. R., and Torres, I. M. (2009) Using a model’s apparent ethnicity to influence viewer responses to print ads: A social identity theory perspective. Forthcoming in *Journal of Current Issues and Research in Advertising*.
- Tajfel, H. (1978) *The Social Psychology of Minorities*, New York, NY: Minority Rights Group.
- U.S. Census Bureau (2001) National Population Estimates. June, 18.
- Webster, C. (1992) The effects of Hispanic subcultural identification on information search behavior. *Journal of Advertising Research*, **32** (5), 54-62.
- Whittler, T. E. (1989) Viewers’ processing of actor’s race and message claims in advertising stimuli. *Psychology & Marketing*, **6** (4), 287-309.
- Whittler, T. E., and DiMeo, J. (1991) Viewers’ reactions to racial cues in advertising stimuli. *Journal of Advertising Research*, **31** (6), 37-46.

Whittler, T. E., and Spira, J. S. (2002) Model's race: A peripheral cue in advertising messages? *Journal of Consumer Psychology*, **12** (4), 291-301.

Williams, J. D., and Qualls, W. J. (1989) Middle-class Black consumers and intensity of ethnic identification. *Psychology and Marketing*, **6** (4), 263-286.

Table
Summary of Ethnicity and Advertising Literature

Article	Research Question	Overall Theory	Ethnicity	n; Subjects	Stimuli	Data Collected	Findings
Muse (1971) (<i>JMR</i>)	How are ads with only Black models perceived by White audiences?	No framework used	Blacks, Whites	233; college students	Print ads for cigarettes, vodka, napkins, beer	Personal interviews; ads ranked on effectiveness and overall appeal	Ads with only Black models do not affect White consumers' perceptions of ad effectiveness or appeal
Bush, Gwinner, and Solomon (1974) (<i>JM</i>)	How do White consumers respond to Black models in in-store promotional materials?	No framework used	Blacks, Whites	13443; White adults from SW US	End-of-aisle, POP displays with either all Black, all White, or mix of Black and White models	Observers recorded shopping behavior in supermarket	Whites respond similarly to point-of-purchase (POP) displays with all Black models, all White models, or a mix of Black and White models
Deshpandé, Hoyer, and Donthu (1986) (<i>JCR</i>)	Do different groups of Hispanics differ in their ethnic identification?	No framework used	Hispanics	425; Registered TX voters, 278 Whites, 147 Hispanics	None; mail questionnaire	Ethnicity; attitude toward institutions; A _{AD} ; brand loyalty; purchase influences	Relative to weak Hispanic identifiers, strong Hispanic identifiers more likely (1) to use Spanish language media, (2) to have more positive attitudes toward advertising, and (3) to purchase products advertised to Hispanics
Pitts, Whalen, O'Keefe, and Murray (1989) (<i>P&M</i>)	How do Blacks and Whites respond to TV ads with cultural/ethnic cues?	No framework used	Blacks	271; undergrads from W. and S. US; 82 Blacks, 189 Whites	Four 60-second TV ads targeted at Blacks	Personal values; ad rating; product usage rate	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relative to Whites, Blacks respond more favorably to TV ads with Black actors • Compared to Blacks, Whites fail to notice some cultural values (e.g., belonging, self-fulfillment, accomplishment) depicted in commercials

Article	Research Question	Overall Theory	Ethnicity	n; Subjects	Stimuli	Data Collected	Findings
Whittler (1989) (<i>P&M</i>)	Do race of ad actor and viewers' racial attitudes affect ad evaluations?	No framework used	Blacks, Whites	340; undergrads from US Midwest; 180 White, 160 Black	Full-color storyboard ads with a Black actor and a White actor	Message comprehension; racial attitudes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Whites (Blacks) identify more with White (Black) actors than Black (White) actors • Blacks (Whites) report more likely to buy advertised brand and evaluate ads with a Black (White) actor more favorably • Whites do not react negatively to Black actors in ads
Webster (1992) (<i>JAR</i>)	Do Hispanic groups categorized by sub-cultural ethnic identification search differently for ad information?	No framework used	n/a	180; women from San Antonio, TX	None; administered questionnaire	Extent of information search in various media (e.g., ads, yellow pages)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hispanics more willing to search media with which they ethnically identify • Relative to non-Spanish-speaking Hispanics, Spanish-speaking Hispanics influenced less by brochure ads and magazine ads
Roslow and Nicholls (1996) (<i>JAR</i>)	Are Hispanics more persuaded by Spanish- or English-language TV ads?	No framework used	Hispanics	648; adult Hispanics from NYC, Miami, Houston, and LA	Spanish-language and English language TV ads	Ad persuasiveness	Hispanics more persuaded by Spanish-language TV ads embedded in Spanish-language TV programs than by analogous English-language TV ads embedded in English-language TV programs
Dimofte, Forehand, and Deshpandé (2004) (<i>JA</i>)	Can ad targeting incongruent with existing identity cues affect the salience of self-identification	No framework used	Hispanics, Whites	82; employees of major California university	Two TV ads with a Hispanic actor; one ad with English voice-over, and one ad	Ethnicity; ad schema congruity; A _{AD} ; attitudes toward spokesperson; cognitive	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Unusual voice-over/subtitling augments ethnic self-awareness and increases ad recall • Ad schema congruity moderates the effect of target market affiliation on A_{AD} and attitude toward spokesperson

Article	Research Question	Overall Theory	Ethnicity	n; Subjects	Stimuli	Data Collected	Findings
	and responses of target consumers?				with Spanish voice-over and English subtitles	responses	
Williams and Qualls (1989) (<i>P&M</i>)	Do middle class Blacks and Whites respond differently to ads featuring celebrity endorsers?	Cultural Script	Blacks	160; adults from Denver CO, 80 Blacks 80, Whites	TV ads featuring celebrity endorsers	Attitudes toward the spokesperson and product; A _{AD}	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Strong and weak Black identifiers respond similarly to ads with celebrity endorsers • Strong Black identifiers and Whites hold similar favorable attitudes toward ads with celebrity endorsers
Deshpandé and Stayman (1994) (<i>JMR</i>)	Do majority and minority group members respond differently to radio ads with White or Hispanic-named spokespersons?	Distinctiveness	Hispanics; Whites	205; adults from San Antonio and Austin, TX	Radio-script ads with either a White or Hispanic-named spokesperson	Ethnic salience; spokesperson trustworthiness; brand attitudes	Relative to majority group members, minority group members more likely (1) to deem their ethnicity important, and (2) to trust spokespersons of similar ethnicity, which induces more positive A _B
Grier and Brumbaugh (1999) (<i>JA</i>)	What meanings do targeted and non-targeted groups derive from ads?	Distinctiveness	Blacks, Whites, gay/lesbian	62; MBAs; 35 White, 20 Black, 7 unknown; 40 straight, 22 other	Ad brochure that mimics magazine ads	Thoughts and feelings about the ad	Relative to non-targeted groups, targeted groups (1) view ads more positively, and (2) better understand cultural cues in ads
Aaker, Brumbaugh, and Grier (2000) (<i>JCP</i>)	What effect do ads targeted at one audience have on non-	Distinctiveness	Blacks, Whites, gay/lesbian	63; MBAs from US Midwest; 123;	Pamphlet of color print ads targeting Blacks,	A _{AD} ; felt targetedness	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relative to targeted group, non-targeted groups' view ads less positively • When targeting cues absent, viewer

Article	Research Question	Overall Theory	Ethnicity	n; Subjects	Stimuli	Data Collected	Findings
	targeted audiences?			students, 39 Black, 84 White	Whites, or gay/lesbians		distinctiveness alone unrelated to A_{AD} <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Felt similarity and felt targetedness mediate A_{AD} for intended targets
Forehand and Deshpandé (2001) (<i>JMR</i>)	Does ethnic self-awareness affect consumers' responses to targeted ads?	Distinctiveness	Asians, Whites	109 and 175; Asian and White undergrads from W. US	Series of TV and print ads	Attitude toward spokesperson; A_{AD} ; strength of ethnic identity;	When ethnic cues are analogous to one's self-concept, they increase the rate at which people mention their ethnicity in self-descriptions, leading to more favorable responses to a same-ethnicity spokesperson and ads targeting their ethnicity
Grier and Deshpandé (2001) (<i>JMR</i>)	Does social and numeric status of consumers affect ad effectiveness?	Distinctiveness	Blacks, Whites	176; S. African women	One print ad with either a Black or White spokesperson	Racial/ethnic salience and brand attitude	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Using social dimensions to target ads may be effective even when targeted group is a numeric majority Social status predicts ethnic salience Greater (lesser) ethnic salience due to minority (majority) status leads to more (less) positive A_B
Forehand, Deshpandé, and Reed (2002) (<i>Journal of Applied Psychology</i>)	How do ethnic primes and social distinctiveness affect identity salience and responses to targeted ads?	Distinctiveness	Whites, Asians	284 and 384; Asian and White undergrads from W. US	Experiment 1: Four TV ads, 1 for Nokia and 3 filler ads Experiment 2: 2 print ads for Northwest Airlines	Spokesperson liking; cognitive responses; A_{AD}	Across both experiments, Asians (Whites) responded more favorably (negatively) to an Asian spokesperson and Asian-related ads when they were both primed and socially distinctive (i.e., numeric minority group in a social environment)
Lee, Fernandez, and Martin (2002) (<i>Inter-</i>	How do ethnic minority models in ads affect the evaluations of	Distinctiveness	Asians, Whites	178; college students	Full-color print ads for watches and facial tissue with either	Self-referencing; ethnic identity; cognitive	Consumers exposed to ads consistent with their ethnicity, spontaneously self-reference the ad, which leads to (a) more positive attitudes towards the ad and the model depicted in the ad, (b)

Article	Research Question	Overall Theory	Ethnicity	n; Subjects	Stimuli	Data Collected	Findings
<i>national Journal of Advertising</i>)	ethnic minority and ethnic majority consumers?				Asian or White models	responses; A_{AD} ; A_B ; A_M	stronger intentions to buy the advertised brand, and (c) more favorable impressions of the advertised brand
Martin, Lee, and Yang (2004) (<i>JA</i>)	Does consumer self-referencing mediate the effect of ethnicity on ad/brand-related attitudes and intentions to buy the advertised brand?	Distinctiveness	Asians, Whites	122 college students; 66 Whites, 56 Asians	Tea and shampoo print ads with White and Asian female models	Self-referencing; A_{AD} ; A_B ; A_M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Self-referencing mediates ethnicity effects on (a) ad-related attitudes, and (b) PI_B • For Asians, self-referencing relates positively to A_{AD} and PI_B • For Asians and Whites, Asian models in ads for atypical products boosted (a) self-referencing, (b) ad-related attitudes, and (c) PI_B • Relative to Whites, Asians exhibit greater self referencing of Asian models in ads
Appiah (2001a) (<i>Howard Journal of Communications</i>)	Does strength of ethnic identity affect Black and White adolescents' responses to print ads with models of different races?	Distinctiveness/ Identification	Blacks, Whites	173; HS students from CA, 81 Blacks, 92 Whites	Three full-color print ads, with race of characters and cultural cues digitally manipulated	Perceived similarity with actors; belief ad intended for subject; identification with actors; A_{AD}	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relative to weak Black identifiers, strong Black identifiers see themselves as more similar to and identity more strongly with Black characters in ads • Whites' identification with characters or A_{AD} is unrelated to strength of ethnic identity
Appiah (2001b) (<i>JAR</i>)	How do adolescents of different races respond to ads with Black or	Distinctiveness/ Identification	Blacks, Whites	349; HS students from CA, 81 Blacks, 84 Asian,	Four full-color print ads, with Black or White	Perceived similarity and identification with characters;	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Blacks more influenced by race of ad actor than ethnic cues in ad • Identification with an ad by Hispanics, Blacks, and Asians influenced by ad actor'S RACE

Article	Research Question	Overall Theory	Ethnicity	n; Subjects	Stimuli	Data Collected	Findings
	White actors?			92 Hispanics, 92 Whites	characters, for consumer non-durables	belief ad intended for subject; ad rating	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Blacks, Whites, Hispanics, and Asians rate Black-actor ads more favorably than White-actor ads
Koslow, Shamdasani, and Touchstone (1994) (<i>JCR</i>)	How do Hispanics respond to ethnic language in ads?	Accommodation	Hispanics, Whites	367; Spanish speakers	Four print ads: 1 English only, 1 Spanish only, and 2 mixed English and Spanish	A _{AD} ; advertiser's sensitivity to Hispanic culture; ethnic identity	Spanish-language ads enhance Hispanics' beliefs about advertiser's sensitivity to Hispanic culture, which boosts Hispanics' A _{AD}
Green (1999) (<i>JA</i>)	Are ethnic identity, media placement, and race of ad actor(s) related to Blacks' A _{AD} and PI _B ?	Accommodation/ In-Group Bias	Blacks, Whites	313; Black American females	Full-color print ads, with either White or Black models, for a fictitious brand	Ethnic identity; A _{AD} ; PI _B	Relative to weak ethnic identifiers, strong ethnic identifiers (1) evaluate ads that feature Blacks more positively, and (2) have stronger purchase intentions for brands with ads that feature Blacks
Qualls and Moore (1990) (<i>P&M</i>)	Does race affect Blacks' and Whites' ad evaluations?	In-Group Bias/ Polarized Appraisal	Blacks, Whites	211; beer drinkers from Midwest town in US; 103 Blacks, 107 Whites	Experimental TV ad for a new beer	A _{AD} ; A _B ; A _M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Relative to Polarized Appraisal Theory, In-Group Bias Theory better explains effect of race on people's ad evaluations Product evaluations by Blacks (Whites) improve (worsen) for ads with Black actors and worsen (improve) for ads with White actors
Sierra, Hyman, and Torres (2009) (<i>Journal of</i>	What effect does ethnic identification with print ads, created by the	Social Identity	Whites, Blacks, Hispanics	207; undergrads from SW town in US; 93	Full-color print ads, with either White, Black, or Hispanic male	Ethnic identification with ad; A _{AD} ; A _B ; PI _B	Ethnically identifying with print ad, based on model's apparent ethnicity, results in positive direct and indirect (through A _{AD} and A _B) effect on PI _B

Article	Research Question	Overall Theory	Ethnicity	n; Subjects	Stimuli	Data Collected	Findings
<i>Current Issues and Research in Advertising</i>)	model's apparent ethnicity, have on A_{AD} , A_B , A_M , and PI_B ?			Whites, 62 Blacks, 52 Hispanics	models, for a fictitious athletic shoe brand		
Whittler and DiMeo (1991) (<i>JAR</i>)	What effect does viewer's prejudice have on simple decision rules when examining ad effectiveness?	Heuristic-Systematic Persuasion Model	Blacks, Whites	160; paid volunteers	Full-color story-board ads for a fur coat and laundry detergent	Brand awareness and PI_B ; ad recall and impression; likeability of, and perceived similarity with actor; racial attitudes; message claim validity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Low-prejudice Whites (a) believe equally similar to White and Black actors, and (b) identify equally with White and Black actors • High-prejudice Whites (a) believe less similar to Black than White actors, and (b) identify more strongly with White than Black actors • Regardless of their attitudes toward Blacks, Whites had lower PI_B and less favorable A_{AD} and A_B for ads featuring a Black actor
Whittler and Spira (2002) (<i>JCP</i>)	What effect does race in advertising have on viewer message processing and does it function as a peripheral cue?	Elaboration Likelihood Model	Blacks, Whites	160 Black adults from the SE US	Full-color story-board ads for cordless phone, garment bag, and laundry detergent	Same as Whittler and DiMeo (1991) plus message comprehension and identification with Black culture	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Identification with Black culture moderates Blacks' responses to ads • High-identification Blacks respond more favorably to ads, products, and models when the ad model is Black • Ad model's race influences Blacks' peripheral message processing • Blacks think more about products in ads with White rather than Black models • Blacks' better recall ads with Black models

Key:

Overall Theory	=	general theoretical framework that grounded study
Ethnicity	=	ethnicity depicted in the test ads
n	=	sample size for each study; note that some articles described more than one study
Subjects	=	study participants
Stimuli	=	ads or commercials that participants read or viewed

Note:

JA = Journal of Advertising; JAR = Journal of Advertising Research; JCP = Journal of Consumer Psychology; JCR = Journal of Consumer Research; JM = Journal of Marketing; JMR = Journal of Marketing Research; P&M = Psychology & Marketing; A_{AD} = attitude toward the ad; A_B = attitude toward the brand; A_M = attitude toward the model; PI_B = intentions to buy the advertised brand