References


Bresnan (ed.) The Mental Representation of Grammatical Relations, Cambridge, MIT Press.


SOME THEORETICAL IMPLICATIONS OF THE STUDY OF NP-MOVEMENT IN SOME SCANDINAVIAN LANGUAGES

Pica Pierre (C.N.R.S Paris)

The purpose of this paper is to discuss the notion of NP-movement and in particular to analyze the passive structure of some Scandinavian and non-Swedish languages within the framework of the so-called "Extended Standard Theory" of generative grammar. We particularly want to argue that, contrary to Wosow (1980), a) there exist two kinds of passive structures, one generated in the base and b) the other transformationally derived by the structure-preserving rule of move-NP as formulated, for English, in Wasow (1977).

Assuming a case theory along the lines of Chomsky (1978), we want to argue a) that oblique cases are assigned in the base and moved in the derivation and b) that the rule of move-NP can move a case assigned in the base, as first stipulated in Chomsky (78) and denied by Kayne (1979) and Lightfoot (1980); c) that a strong version of Chomsky's (1978) following which NP-movement must occur from a non-case-marked position is wrong as noted by Berer (1981) and Aoun (1981) and that there is no case-mandated movement of the hypothesis of Chomsky (78) and conflict device contrary to the hypothesis of Chomsky (78) and d) that movement should not be defined in terms of case but in terms of the Empty Category Principle of Chomsky (1981) should be extended to phonetically realized NPs.

We assume Wosow's theory of 1977, we can account for the dynamic interpretation of French sentences of type (1) illustrated by the following entailment (b) by a transformational derivation and can account for the entailed sentence (c) by the same underlying structure (by a base-derivation):

(1) La porte était fermée.
   (The door was closed)
   a. = La porte avait été fermée (The door had been closed)
   b. = La porte était fermée (par quelqu'un) (The door was being closed by somebody)

We can account for the fact that the same entailments are not valid when the same passive structures contain a durative verb, as illustrated in (2) by the general principle (3) which applies as a rule at the level of semantic interpretation:

(2) La gare était surveillée.
   (The station was watched)
   a. = La gare avait été surveillée (The station had been watched)
   b. = La gare était surveillée (par quelqu'un) (The station was being watched by somebody)

(3) A durative event cannot be said to be a base-generated since we find such examples as (3):

(4) C'est un homme très surveillé + admis
   (He is a very watched + admired man)
The effect of the application of our principle (3) is that the stative reading of a base-generated passive structure whose past-participle is derived from a durative verb is not interpreted as in (16) but as a kind of non-finite state (process). The same analysis which is a reminiscence of the observations of Wilson (1960) leads us to the hypothesis that the Danish structures (5) and (6) that correspond to (1) and (2) are base-generated since they do not have a dynamic interpretation:

(5) Døren er lukket
(The door has been closed)

(6) Døren er beboet
(The city is inhabited)

We account for the non-stative reading of (6) by the application of principle (3) at the level of semantic interpretation.

It is interesting to note that, while the stative reading of sentences like (1) and (2) generally disappears with the presence of an agent in French, as illustrated by (7), the stative reading is still the only possible interpretation of Danish sentences like (8):

(7) La porte était fermée par la police
(The door was being closed by the police)

(8) Døren er lukket af politiet
(The door was closed by the police)

We want to argue that French sentences like (7) are transformationally derived while apparently equivalent Danish sentences like (8) are derived in the base.

We want to claim that Danish sentences like (8) represent a marked phenomenon since it seems generally to be the case that the presence of a "by phrase" is associated with a dynamic reading.

We self-associate with a transformational derivation as illustrated by the Icelandic sentence (45) below and the following English examples from Kayne (1981:6):

(9) The enemy's destruction of the city
(10) The city's destruction by the enemy
(11) This book is read by a ten-year old
(12) Mary is reliable by a ten-year old
(13) Mary is reliable by a ten-year old
(14) Mary is reliable
(15) Mary's presence to t by the lecturer shocked everyone

Note that the presence of a "by phrase" seems to imply a transformational derivation as illustrated by the contrast between (12), (13) and (14) where (12) is excluded by the Empty Category Principle which also applies to (15), (13) lacks the preposition "on" associated with the verb "rely on" and is ungrammatical as opposed to (14) which is base-generated and associated with a lexical redundancy rule which deletes the preposition.

We can interpret the relation between the "by phrase" and a transformational derivation as a reflection of a semantic principle associating the presence of an agent with a dynamic interpretation, but this move would be doubting since we do find some "by phrase"

In passive sentences which do not undergo movement as illustrated in (16):

(16) Il fait manger la pomme par Paul
(He has the apple eaten by Paul)

Sentences like (16) clearly indicate that it is not to the movement that the "by phrase" is related but rather, as suggested in Kayne (1981:6), that the presence of the "by phrase" strengthens the requirement for an object to be represented (in logical form) as "of (of) NP" (see Kayne's analysis of "The Iranian baccelmdment by Russia").

We see, as expected, that the object may be represented by a trace as in (7), (10) or (11) or, phonetically realized as in (16).

Our analysis of Danish sentences like (8) as marked can also be supported by the following paradigm point out to us by Jan Katlev:

(17) ?? Bilen er købt af Jensen
(The car has been bought by Jensen)

(18) ?? Bilen er hentet af politiet
(The car has been taken up by the police)

(19) ?? Bilen er repareret af Roed-Sørensen
(The car has been repaired by Roed-Sørensen)

(20) ?? Bilen er sprøjtelseret af A/S Painter
(The car has been painted by A/S Painter)

(21) Bilen er bygget af Ford
(The car has been constructed by Ford)

(22) Bilen er designet af Isigogis
(The car has been designed by Isigogis)

Katlev (personal communication) suggests that our analysis of Danish sentences like (8) is wrong and that Danish sentences like the ones illustrated in (17)-(22) show that their grammatical statute is unclear but this is exactly what is predicted by our analysis of this kind of sentences as marked.

The unclear statute of (17)-(19) is also predicted by our analysis following which they are derived in the base and can then be subject to lexical restrictions. //speech

Note at last that the fact that sentences (17)-(20) are not accepted by a certain amount of people is also predicted by our principle of interpretation (3) following which basic passive sentences must be interpreted as stative on if they contain a past-participle derived from a durative verb, as a non-finite state (process), since this last interpretation seems to be more natural if an agent is expressed as illustrated by the contrast between (17)-(18) and (21)-(22)...

2. Some arguments against a transformation of auxiliary deletion

In Danish and some other Germanic languages, Danish grammarians (cf. For instance Diderichsen (1946) give a totally different analysis of these phenomena since they consider that sentences like (8) derive from sentence like (23) by the deletion of the auxiliary "blivet":

(23) Døren er blevet lukket af politiet
(The door is become closed by the police)

The same type of analysis is proposed, within the framework of
transformational grammar, by Den Besten (op. cit.) to account for Dutch and German sentences as, for German, (24) where the auxiliary "worden" can be omitted:

(24) Der Tür ist geschlossen (worden)
(Make the door is closed (became))
It is nevertheless worth noting that the presence of an agent in the passive construction blocks the deletion of the auxiliary in Dutch and German as illustrated, for German, by (25) which we would like to contrast with the Danish sentence (23):

(25) Die Tür ist von der Polizei geschlossen * (worden)
(The door is by the police closed)

Unfortunately, the arguments given by Den Besten for his analysis of Dutch sentences equivalent to (8) as being derived by auxiliary deletion (based on verb raising before the auxiliary and some preposition standing phenomena) cannot be applied to German or Danish.

It is clear however, that this operation could not be a transformation since this rule cannot apply to passive sentences containing a past participle derived from a durative verb, as illustrated by Danish sentences (26) and (27) which are semantically very different:

(26) Byen er blevet heboet af drengen
(The city is inhabited by boys)
(27) Byen er heboet af drengen
(The city is inhabited by boys)

We believe that we can account for the difference of interpretation between (26) and (27) by our principle (3) which can apply to (27) is a passive structure derived in the base.

The hypothesis of a lexical rule of auxiliary deletion does not hold either if we consider that Danish passive with "blive" like (26) and Dutch and German equivalent with "geworden" and "worden" are transformationally derived (cf. Den Besten op. cit. & Pico 1979) since it is generally assumed that no transformations may be followed by lexical rules.

We shall consequently consider that Danish sentences like (8) and (27) are generated in the base contrary to sentences like (23) and (26) for German which are transformationally derived.

Note that, as pointed out to us by Kjell-Ake Gunnarson, our analysis can be supported by a look at Swedish where sentences equivalent to Danish sentences (8) are grammatical as illustrated in (28) but where the equivalent form with "bliva" is absolutely impossible with the same auxiliary as illustrated in (29). A transformational derivation of (28) from (29) is very implausible in that language since it would involve a variation of auxiliary!

(26) Stadgan er fastbold av myngåterna
(The prescription is established by the authorities)
(27) Stadgan er blevet fastbold av myngåterna
(The prescription has been established by the authorities)

We feel that our hypothesis, which permits us to predict the semantic interpretation of aspect in the sentences considered, is supported by the analysis of passive sentences with oblique cases which is developed in the next section.

3. Some Implications of the Analysis of NP-Movement in Icelandic

It has generally been assumed that contrary to Chomsky (1978), NP-movement cannot move case and particularly cannot move an oblique case which would have been assigned in the base. That principle is supposed to account for the lack of preposition standing with NP-movement in a language which has retained an oblique case such as French (as opposed to English) (cf. Lightfoot (op. cit.)).

This phenomenon is illustrated in (30):

(30) *Jean (Nom) est parlé de t (Oblique)
(John is talked about)

Lightfoot argues that, since cases cannot be moved by NP-movement, the traces of the moved NP bears the oblique case which has been assigned in the base, in French sentences as (30).

Since traces bearing a case are variable (cf. Chomsky 1981) the trace of the moved NP is a variable in (30) and should thus (cf. Bibel) be bound by a quantifier.

That analysis is supposed to account for the ungrammaticality of French sentences as (30) and can be carried over to German since we only find moved NP’s bearing an oblique case with impersonal passives as illustrated in (33) and (32) as opposed to (34):

(31) Ich (Nom) harre seiner (Gen.)
(I wait him)
(32) Es wird heiner (Gen.) geharrt
(There is him waited)
(33) Seiner (Gen.) wird geharrt
(He is waited)
(34) *Er (Nom.) wird geharrt
(He is waited)

It follows from this analysis that German sentences as (33) are not derived by NP-movement from sentences like (31) but rather derive from impersonal passives like (32) by topicalisation (see however Den Besten (1980) for a different analysis).

This kind of analysis cannot, however, be carried over to Icelandic to deal with similar cases in that language (see (35) and (36) as argued by Andrews (1976))

(35) Mér (Dat.) var bjargad
(I was saved)
(36) Mín (Gen.) var bedjð
(I was waited)

We do not indeed find the corresponding impersonal passives (37) and (38) (for some reason that are still unclear to us), although impersonal passives are frequent in Icelandic, as in other Scandinavian languages, as illustrated by (39):

(37) *þad var bjargad mér (Dat.)
(There was saved me)
(38) *þad var bedjð mín (Gen.)
(There was waited me)
(39) þad var lokjö við kirkjuna
(There was finished at the church)

We are then forced to consider the hypothesis that the dative and
genitive of (35) and (36) have been moved by NP-movement from object position.

We consider that this analysis can also be supported by the study of aspect in Icelandic passive structures as illustrated by the following paradigm from Benediktsson (1980) where sentences (40) and (42) are interpreted as dynamic while (41) and (43) are interpreted as static:

(40) Dyrnum (Bat.) var lokad t (The doors were closed)
(41) Dyrnar (Nom.) voru lokáðar (The doors had been closed)
(42) Úrín (Dat.), sem hann seldi mér, var stóll í t (The watch, which he sold me, was stolen)
(43) Úrín (Nom.), sem hann seldi mér, var stóll í (The watch, which he sold me, had been stolen)

These respective interpretations follow from our analysis of sentences like (40) and (42) as transformationally derived (see the analysis of (35) and (36) above) while we would like to say that (41) and (43) are generated in the base and do not undergo movement of an oblique object moved in that position by NP-movement. It is interesting to note that the strong tendency noted above for French and English not to use a "by phrase" if an object is not represented (in logical form) is borne out in Icelandic as illustrated by the following sentences confirmed to us by Jördansson:

(44) Budini (Dat.) er lokad í af logreglumni (The shop is closed by the policeman)
(45) Budin (Nom.) er lokak (*af logreglumni) (The shop is closed by the policeman)

Our analysis of (40) and (42) as being transformationally derived but (41) and (43) as being base-generated can be supported by the following paradigm from Benediktsson (op. cit.).

These sentences show that no dative subject can be found in sentences like (47), that we would like to consider as generated in the base since they contain an adjectival element "dókak" (unclosed) which we wish to relate to a verbal element in the lexicon in the lines of Wasow (1977):

(46) * Dyrnum (Dat.) var dókak (The doors were unclosed)
(47) Dyrnar (Nom.) voru dókakar (The doors were unclosed)

Note that the contrast between (46) and (47) alliterates also against Lightfoot's hypothesis in Lightfoot (1980) following which all past participles are adjectives if we adopt an analysis following which it is the past participle that assigns the oblique case to the NP in object position in sentences like (40) and (42).

Adjectives cannot generally assign case as illustrated, for Icelandic by (46) and, for French, by the following paradigm if an analysis in the lines of Pollock (1983) is right:

(48) Il est embrassé un grand nombre de filles à la partie (There is kissed a great number of girls at the party)
(49) Il est insatisfait un grand nombre de filles à la partie (There is unsatisfied a great number of girls at the party)

Conformably to our analysis following which the oblique cases of (35) and (36) have been moved from object position by NP-movement, we feel that Lightfoot's analysis of French sentences like (30) should be dropped and that this kind of sentences should be analysed in an alternative way as the one proposed in Kayne (1981a) which makes use of the Empty Category Principle.
55) A man (Nom.) was at the door
56) Who came in the room

The natural conclusion of this analysis is that there exist some NP-movement from case marked position to case marked position in Icelandic. Therefore, this hypothesis is borne out in Icelandic as illustrated by the following sentences borrowed from Andrews which makes use of them for a different purpose.

We want to argue that the accusative case is assigned by the verb 'tefla' (to believe) to the subject of the embedded sentence in (57) through the device of $ deletion but that no such case can be assigned to the subject NP in (58) since it already bears the dative case moved from the object position by NP-movement:

57) Eg tel $ strökk (*hafa séf troll) (I believe the lad has seen the troll)
58) Eg tel $ leflsun (*hafa verið bjarðag t) (I believe her to have been saved)

This analysis strongly suggests that case assignment and government should not be as connected as they are in the actual theory of Chomsky (1981) and that NP-movement should not be defined in terms of case as a movement to a case marked position but in terms of government as a movement to a position that is governed (and to a position that is not marked with a thematic role).

This hypothesis predicts that the embedded sentences of (57) and (58) would not be grammatical if they were fronted in a position where the embedded subject would not be governed by the verb of the matrix sentence.

This hypothesis which permits us to define $-movement as a move- ment to an unmarked position is very closely related to our analysis of active constructions with oblique subjects in Icelandic illustrated by the marked sentences (59) and (60) which shows that there exist some oblique accusatives in Icelandic as supported by the fact that some prepositions do assign accusative in that language.

59) Barninu (Dat.) batnaf velkin (Nom.) (The child recovered from the disease)
60) Drengina (Acc.) vantar peninga (Acc.) (The boys lack money)

We want to argue that the oblique subjects of active sentences like (59) and (60) are moved by NP-movement from a post-verbal position. This analysis is a reminiscence of the analysis of "ergative verbs" by Burzio (1981) following which the subject of verbs that take the auxiliary corresponding to "be" are derived from a post-verbal position and moved to the subject position which lacks a thematic role in Italian.

Our hypothesis seems to be supported by the fact that (59) and (60) cannot undergo passive as noted by Andrews (1981). Illustrated by (61) and (62) and predicted by our analysis following which the ungrammaticality of (61) and (62) is related to the ungrammaticality of (63) in French if we admit the hypothesis that the morphological process of passive (which absorbs the thematic role of the subject) cannot apply in these languages if there is no thematic role to absorb:

61) *Velkin var báðnun (The disease was recovered from)
62) *Peninga er vantað (Money is lacked)
63) *Il a été arrivé (There has been arrived)

The contrast between (63), whose active form lacks a thematic role in subject position if we apply Burzio's analysis to French, and (64) whose active form receives a thematic role in subject position if we follow the same analysis, shows that it is the presence or absence of a thematic role in subject position that determines the realization of the morphological process of passivization as not, as supposed by traditional grammar, the concept of transitivity:

64) ? Il a été dansé (There has been danced)

We are now able where to derive sentences like (60) from structures like (65) which lacks a thematic role in subject position but which is grammatical in Icelandic (as noted by Finarsson (1945)) in a narrative style because of the possibility to violate the verb second constraint of Hailing and Zaenen (1978) in this particular use of Icelandic:

65) Vantar drengina (Acc.) peninga (Acc.) (Lack the boys money)

The natural implication of this analysis is that there is an empirical category locally controlled by an element of Inflexion (see Chomsky (1981)) in the pre-verbal position of (65) just as in (66) from Jollivet (1954)

66) Var skáldin...

(Has been decided...)

We are now able to formulate the hypothesis that Inflexion governs the oblique subjects of (59) and (60) and in fact these sentences would be ungrammatical if no finite tense would be used but that the element of Inflexion cannot assign a non-massive case to these NPs since they already bear an oblique case moved from object position.

If our analysis is right, we can now add the filter (67) to the category filter of Vergeend cited in Chomsky (1978) at least remains valid for languages which do have an overt morphological case system:

67) *NP if not governed

We are now able to express the Empty Category Principle of Chomsky (1981) and our filter (67) by a common principle expressed as in (68):

68) Empty Category Principle:

*NP or Its trace if not governed

Note that (68) will apply to NPs or traces whether they are marked for case or not, but not to non phonetically realized pronouns (PRD) and that it is worth to investigate, as suggested to me by Kayne, whether (68) could replace the case filter of Vergeend in languages that do not have an overt case system.

We will develop this matter elsewhere.
ADJECTIVES WITH NOUN PHRASE COMPLEMENTS IN SWEDISH

Christian Platzner, Lund University

1. Usually, Swedish adjectives take PP complements; some examples with different prepositions are listed in (1):

   a. Tidningen var gul och älter.
      'The paper was yellow and old'
   b. Han var rätt för sjön.
      'He was right of the sea'
   c. Han var medveten om riskerna.
      'He was aware of the risks'
   d. Jag är användare på John.
      'I am envious of John'
   e. Jag är stark över henne.
      'I was proud of her'

   With some adjectives, the preposition may be optionally absent:

   (2) Han var trogen lögnar sin hustru.
      'He was faithful to his wife'

Furthermore, there are some adjectives that cannot take a PP complement, only a NP complement:

   (3a) Han var hängiven religionen.
      'He was devoted [to] the religion'
   b. Han är en sin makt.
      'She is like her mother'
   c. Hundan var tillgiven sin hustru.
      'The dog was attached [to] its master'
   d. Han var underlitet/overlitet sin motskönare.
      'He was inferior [to]/superior [to] his opponent'
   e. Han är vidit och belysning.
      'He is worthy [of] a reward'

Notice that the "transitive" adjectives in (2) and (3) cannot be reclassified as propositions, along the lines suggested for like and worth in English by Melang (1989). A Swedish adjective in predicative position agrees with the subject in number and gender. Consider for instance the following examples:

   (4) Han var lika henne. De var lika vattslit.
      'He was like her' 'They were like each other'

The occurrence of adjectives with NP complements in Swedish, illustrated in (2) and (3) above, is of considerable interest for the theory of abstract Case, developed as one of the subtheories of the Extended Standard Theory of Generative Transformational Grammar by Chomsky (1981). According to this theory, every lexical NP must be marked for abstract Case. Chomsky assumes a filler like (5) to be present in UG (Universal Grammar, the language faculty of human beings):

   (5) *[NP Phonetic Matrix], where NP has no Case

Chomsky (1981, 170) gives the following rules for the assignment of abstract Case: