

Plato's Conception of Justice and the Question of Human Dignity

PHILOSOPHY AND CULTURAL STUDIES
REVISITED/HISTORISCH GENETISCHE STUDIEN
ZUR PHILOSOPHIE UND KULTURGESCHICHTE

Edited by/herausgegeben von
Seweryn Blandzi

Advisory Board / Wissenschaftlicher Beirat

Manfred Frank (University of Tübingen)

Kamila Najdek (University of Warsaw)

Marek Otisk (University of Ostrava, Czech Academy of Sciences in Prague)

Wojciech Starzyński (Polish Academy of Sciences)

VOL. 4



PETER LANG

Marek Piechowiak

Plato's Conception of Justice
and the Question
of Human Dignity



PETER LANG

Bibliographic Information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data is available on the internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

A CIP catalog record for this book has been applied for at the Library of Congress.

This project was financed with funds from the National Science Centre (Poland) under grant number DEC-2013/09/B/HS5/04232.



Cover Design: © Olaf Gloeckler, Atelier Platen, Friedberg
Cover Image: © Marek Piechowiak

Printed by CPI books GmbH, Leck

ISSN 2510-5353
ISBN 978-3-631-65970-0 (Print)
E-ISBN 978-3-653-05425-5 (E-PDF)
E-ISBN 978-3-631-71090-6 (EPUB)
E-ISBN 978-3-631-71091-3 (MOBI)
DOI 10.3726/978-3-653-05425-5

© Peter Lang GmbH
Internationaler Verlag der Wissenschaften
Berlin 2019
All rights reserved.

Peter Lang – Berlin · Bern · Bruxelles · New York ·
Oxford · Warszawa · Wien

All parts of this publication are protected by copyright. Any utilisation outside the strict limits of the copyright law, without the permission of the publisher, is forbidden and liable to prosecution. This applies in particular to reproductions, translations, microfilming, and storage and processing in electronic retrieval systems.

This publication has been peer reviewed
by Krzysztof Wroczyński and Wojciech Żelaniec.

www.peterlang.com

Contents

Preface	15
1 Introduction	17
1.1 What this book is about	17
1.2 Dignity as a fundamental value in law	17
1.3 Why Plato?	19
1.4 Objectives	22
1.5 Interpreting Plato	28
1.6 The structure of this book	31
2 The <i>Timaeus</i> on dignity: the Demiurge’s speech	35
2.1 The <i>Timaeus</i> as a dialogue on justice	35
2.2 Formal aspects of the text	39
2.3 The complexity and mortality of the soul	40
2.4 Dignity as existential perfection	41
2.5 Prohibition on instrumental treatment	43
2.6 Human beings and the gods	46
2.7 The human being in relation to the whole	47
3 Justice as a virtue	53
3.1 Introductory remarks	53
3.2 Some terminological issues	54
3.3 Justice and happiness—justice as the most important of all matters	58
3.3.1 Justice as the subject of the best possible art	58
3.3.2 The greatest evil and the greatest good	59
3.3.3 Utility as the foundation of one’s good	62

3.4	Traditional formulae describing just actions	64
3.5	The <i>Republic</i> as a dialogue on the individual	67
3.6	The model of the state and the teaching of virtues	69
3.6.1	Improvement of man	69
3.6.1.1	Socratic questions	69
3.6.1.2	Is the soul simple or complex?	75
3.6.1.3	How to find justice in the state	79
3.6.2	Wisdom	80
3.6.3	Courage	83
3.6.3.1	Common understanding of courage	83
3.6.3.2	The specificity of Plato's approach	84
3.6.3.3	'What things are to be feared' and human freedom	86
3.6.4	Moderation	89
3.6.5	Justice in the model of the state	91
3.6.5.1	Introduction	91
3.6.5.2	What justice in the state is	92
3.6.5.3	Weakness of the evidence	94
3.6.5.4	Beyond triviality	95
3.6.5.5	Happiness of the state or happiness of the individual?	96
3.7	What in truth is justice?	97
3.7.1	Description of justice	97
3.7.2	Justice in the model of the state as εἶδωλον—a phantom of justice	100
3.7.3	The <i>Phaedrus</i> and the model of the state in the <i>Republic</i>	104
3.7.3.1	Discourse in ink and discourse in the soul	104
3.7.3.2	The subject of inner discourse and the aim of knowledge	107
3.7.4	Justice as the internal unity and health of the soul	108
3.7.5	Versatility of the just man	110
3.7.6	Unity of virtues in just actions	116

4 The content of just actions	121
4.1 Socrates talks to himself about justice	121
4.1.1 Preliminary remarks	121
4.1.2 The form of the argument	123
4.1.3 Detailed analyses	127
4.1.4 The ‘head’ of Socrates’ conversation about justice	131
4.1.5 A difficult step in the argument and Plato’s teaching on the Good	133
4.1.5.1 From justice in the soul to the justice of actions	133
4.1.5.2 Shadows and statues of justice	134
4.1.5.3 The Good	135
4.1.5.4 Education	138
4.1.5.5 Reconsidering the difficulties in the argumentation in the <i>Gorgias</i>	142
4.1.6 Further applications	144
4.2 Negative and positive characteristics of just actions	145
4.2.1 The harm principle	145
4.2.2 Just actions as something beneficial for others	148
5 Justice of the law and justice of the state	153
5.1 Foundations	153
5.2 The wisdom and freedom to shape one’s life and Plato’s alleged totalitarianism	157
5.2.1 Converging arguments against Plato’s totalitarianism	157
5.2.2 Wisdom as the knowledge that oversees just actions	161
5.2.3 The failure of Isaiah Berlin’s argument	162
5.2.4 Freedom to shape one’s own life	167
5.2.4.1 Short-term life planning	167
5.2.4.2 Long-term life planning	168
5.2.5 Concluding remarks	173

5.3 Punitive justice	173
5.3.1 Preliminary remarks	173
5.3.2 Rhetoric as a counterfeit of punitive justice	174
5.3.3 The principal aims of punishment	177
5.3.4 The health of the soul as the foundation of justice	179
5.3.5 Equality of proportions as a basis for the determination of punishment	180
5.3.6 Injustice which punishment cannot repair	182
5.3.7 The inevitability of punishment by the gods and two aims of the law	185
5.3.8 Civil law aspects of punishment	186
5.3.9 Concluding remarks	187
6 Equality	189
6.1 Initial remarks	189
6.2 Equality in dignity	189
6.3 Proportionate equality as a basis for shaping actions	191
6.3.1 Preliminary remarks	191
6.3.2 Arithmetic equality	192
6.3.3 Geometric equality as the foundation of true justice	193
6.3.4 Aristotle's continuation of Plato's teaching on geometric proportion	197
6.3.5 Concluding remarks	200
6.4 Justice and friendship	201
6.4.1 Preliminary remarks	201
6.4.2 Friendship with oneself	201
6.4.3 Equality as the foundation of friendship	202
6.4.4 Friendship as an aim of laws	203
6.4.5 Non-violence in implementing justice	207
6.4.6 Justice in giving and receiving	208
6.4.7 Concluding remarks	211

7 Some key issues in Plato's conception of justice	213
7.1 What is more excellent—justice of the soul or justice of action?	213
7.2 Which activity is best and what is its best object?	219
7.2.1 Preliminary remarks	219
7.2.2 What is a proper object of love? What is a proper object of just actions?	220
7.2.2.1 Abstract form or concrete individual—challenging Gregory Vlastos	220
7.2.2.2 Engendering and birth as an aim of love	222
7.2.2.3 Loving imperfect creatures	223
7.2.2.4 Loving an individual	223
7.2.3 Just actions over contemplation	225
7.2.3.1 Back home from the top of the heavens—what are souls free of mortal deficiency doing?	225
7.2.3.2 Back to the cave from the light of the sun—what is the use of abstract forms?	228
7.2.3.3 What does the Good—the Demiurge—do?	231
7.2.4 The <i>Timaeus</i> and Plato's teaching on justice	233
7.2.5 The elderly Cephalus on justice: foreword as epilogue	238
7.2.6 Closing remarks	240
7.3 The sharing of wives: testing the interpretation on a 'hard case'	240
7.3.1 Preliminary remarks	240
7.3.2 The dolphin of Arion—an introduction by Plato's Socrates	242
7.3.3 Non-geometrical but erotic necessities	243
7.3.4 Some instructions on how to read Plato	247
7.3.5 What can be gained from the discussion about women?	248
7.3.5.1 Fundamental equality of the sexes	248
7.3.5.2 No justification for subordinating weaker minds to stronger ones	250
7.3.5.3 The highest standards of friendship	251
7.3.5.4 How to establish friendship in the soul	252
7.3.6 Closing remarks	252

8 Conclusions	255
8.1 Dignity	255
8.2 Justice of the soul	257
8.3 Justice of actions	259
8.4 Justice of laws and the state	261
BIBLIOGRAPHY	265
I Works of Plato	265
a Collections	265
b Dialogues	265
II References	267
Indexes	279
Index Locorum	281
General Index	289