Studies in the History of Philosophy of Mind 26

David Bennett
Juhana Toivanen *Editors*

Philosophical Problems in Sense Perception: Testing the Limits of Aristotelianism

Springer

Studies in the History of Philosophy of Mind

Volume 26

Series Editors
Prof. Henrik Lagerlund, Department of Philosophy, Stockholm University, Stockholm, Sweden
Prof. Mikko Yrjönsuuri, University of Jyväskylä, Academy of Finland and University of Jyväskylä, Jyväskylä, Finland

Editorial Board Members
Emeritus Prof. Lilli Alanen, Uppsala University, Uppsala, Sweden
Joël Biard, Professor of Philosophy, University of Tours, Paris, France
Michael Della Rocca, Departement of Philosophy, Yale University, New Haven, CT, USA
Eyjolfur Emilsson, Professor of Philosophy, University of Oslo, Oslo, Norway
Patricia Kitcher, Professor of Philosophy, Columbia University, New York, USA
Simo Knuuttila, Emeritus Professor, Helsinki University, Helsinki, Finland
Béatrice M. Longuenesse, Emerita Professor, New York University, New York, USA
Calvin Normore, Professor of Philosophy, University of California, Los Angeles, CA, USA

The aim of the series *Studies in the History of Philosophy of Mind* is to foster historical research into the nature of thinking and the workings of the mind. The volumes address topics of intellectual history that would nowadays fall into different disciplines like philosophy of mind, philosophical psychology, artificial intelligence, cognitive science, etc. The monographs and collections of articles in the series are historically reliable as well as congenial to the contemporary reader. They provide original insights into central contemporary problems by looking at them in historical contexts, addressing issues like consciousness, representation and intentionality, mind and body, the self and the emotions. In this way, the books open up new perspectives for research on these topics.

More information about this series at http://www.springer.com/series/6539

David Bennett • Juhana Toivanen
Editors

Philosophical Problems in Sense Perception: Testing the Limits of Aristotelianism

Springer

Editors
David Bennett
Department of Philosophy, Linguistics, and Theory of Science
University of Gothenburg
Göteborg, Sweden

Juhana Toivanen
Department of Social Sciences and Philosophy
University of Jyväskylä
Jyväskylä, Finland

ISSN 1573-5834 ISSN 2542-9922 (electronic)
Studies in the History of Philosophy of Mind
ISBN 978-3-030-56945-7 ISBN 978-3-030-56946-4 (eBook)
https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-56946-4

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s), under exclusive license to Springer Nature Switzerland AG 2020
This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.
The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.
The publisher, the authors, and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, expressed or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

This Springer imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG
The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

Acknowledgements

The editors would like to thank Riksbankens Jubileumsfond, whose generous financial support of the research programme "Representation and Reality: Historical and Contemporary Perspectives on the Aristotelian Tradition" enabled this work. We are also grateful to the Academy of Finland for funding the final stages of the editorial work.

Many colleagues were exceedingly generous with their time, reading and reviewing contributions, responding to our frequent requests for advice without hesitation: thanks especially to Pavel Gregorić, Mika Perälä, Miira Tuominen, Börje Bydén and Jakob Fink. Our colleagues at Representation and Reality were always forthcoming and supportive: special thanks are due to the director of the programme, Christina Thomsen Thörnqvist, and to Ana María Mora-Márquez, who was instrumental in launching this project. Nothing at all would have been accomplished if it weren't for the tireless work of Andreas Ott behind the scenes.

Most of all, we would like to thank our contributors, some of whom have had to wait a long time to see this volume come to fruition. The germ of this collection emerged during a conference in 2015, in which several of our authors participated. Other scholars were approached and asked to direct their efforts to the theme of a conference they did not attend, and we were gratified and delighted by their enthusiasm for the project and their contributions, which have allowed us to produce a more inclusive volume. In addition to the normal obligations of academic life, our contributors made heroic efforts during the global Coronavirus pandemic to ensure that the volume was submitted on time.

Finally, we are grateful to Christi Lue, Rathika Ramkumar, and Deepthi Vasudevan, our patient minders at Springer. They put up with all manner of confusion from us, but they were always able to bring us back on the right track.

We dedicate this volume to Dionysus, the greatest among ancient and living gods.

Contents

1 Introduction 1
David Bennett and Juhana Toivanen

2 Aristotle on the Transmission of Information: Receiving Form Without the Matter 15
Victor Caston

3 Aristotle on Perception as Representation 57
Todd Ganson

4 Reply to Ganson 69
Mark Eli Kalderon

5 The Case of Red-Stained Mirrors: Perception, Strange Phenomena, and the Role of Exemplification in Aristotle 77
Filip Radovic

6 Alexander of Aphrodisias on Simultaneous Perception 91
Attila Hangai

7 Common Sense in Themistius and Its Reception in the pseudo-Philoponus and Avicenna 125
Elisa Coda

8 On Common Sense, Estimation, and the Soul's Unity in Avicenna 151
Jari Kaukua

9 Sense Perception in Sayf al-Dīn al-Āmidī: A Theologian's Encounter with Avicennan Psychology 161
Laura Hassan

10 Setting One's Sights on Sight: Observations on Sense Perception in Sayf al-Dīn al-Āmidī 185
Jon McGinnis

11 John of Jandun on Sense Perception and Instantaneous Change 193
Aurélien Robert

12 Alexander of Aphrodisias, Brito and Jandun: Comments on Aurélien Robert's Paper 213
Sten Ebbesen

13 Attention, Recognition, and Error in Nicole Oresme's Psychology 223
Christophe Grellard

14 Activity, Judgment, and Recognition in Nicole Oresme's Philosophy of Perception 239
José Filipe Silva

Index 255

Abbreviations of Aristotle's Works

APo.	*Analytica Posteriora*
Cat.	*Categoriae*
de An.	*de Anima*
Div.Somn	*de Divinatione per Somnia*
EN	*Ethica Nicomachea*
GA	*de Generatione Animalium*
GC	*de Generatione et Corruptione*
HA	*Historia Animalium*
Insomn.	*de Insomniis*
Int.	*de Interpretatione*
MA	*de Motu Animalium*
Mem.	*de Memoria*
Metaph.	*Metaphysica*
Mete.	*Meteorologica*
PA	*de Partibus Animalium*
Ph.	*Physica*
Rh.	*Rhetorica*
Sens.	*de Sensu et Sensato*
Somn.Vig.	*de Somno et Vigilia*
Top.	*Topica*

About the Authors

David Bennett was until recently a Research Associate in Representation and Reality research programme at the University of Gothenburg (2014–2019). He specializes in the philosophical and theological controversies of the ninth to tenth century Islamicate world, particularly the early development of Muʿtazilite thought. He has written on pre-Avicennan accounts of sense perception, veridical dreams, and conceptualization, and he is currently working on a monograph about atoms.

Victor Caston is a Professor of philosophy of Classical Studies at the University of Michigan. His work focuses on the philosophy of mind and metaphysics in ancient Greek philosophy, especially Aristotle and the Peripatetic tradition, as well as the Stoics, with articles on the mind-body problem, mental causation, consciousness, and intentionality. He is currently working on a monograph, *The Stoics on Content and Mental Representation*, as well as finishing the second volume of his translation and commentary of Alexander's *On the Soul.*

Elisa Coda is a Marie Sklodowska-Curie Fellow at the Centre national de la recherche scientifique in Paris (Project Acronym: THEIA), 2020–2022. She is a member of the Research Centre "Learning Roads" (University of Pisa, Italy). She has published on the Arabic, Hebrew, and Latin traditions of the Greek commentaries on Aristotle's *De Caelo*, in particular Themistius' paraphrase.

Sten Ebbesen is an Emeritus Professor of Greek and Latin with special regard to the Aristotelian Tradition (University of Copenhagen, Denmark). He is the author of some 300 scholarly articles and books, most of them on late ancient and medieval philosophy, and many of them including editions or previously unpublished texts. He is a fellow of the Royal Danish Academy of Sciences and Letters and of Academia Europaea, as well as *doctor honoris causa* in the universities of Gothenburg and Bologna.

Todd Ganson is a Professor of philosophy at Oberlin College. His research is focused on perception and teleosemantics. He has published a number of articles in leading philosophy journals, including *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*,

Australasian Journal of Philosophy, *Philosophical Studies*, *Synthese*, and *Biology & Philosophy*.

Christophe Grellard is Professor at the Ecole Pratiques des Hautes Etudes (PSL University) where he teaches the history of medieval philosophy. He is the author of several articles and books including *De la certitude volontaire: Débats nominalistes sur la foi à la fin du Moyen Âge* (Paris 2014) and *La possibilità dell'errore: Pensare la tolleranza nel medieoevo* (Rome 2020).

Attila Hangai is a teaching fellow at Eötvös Loránd University, Budapest. He is working on projects concerning Ancient Greek psychology, especially in the Aristotelian tradition.

Laura Hassan has recently completed her first monograph, on the encounter with Avicennism witnessed in the works of the Ashʿarī theologian Sayf al-Dīn al-Āmidī (d. 631/1233). For this, she was awarded the 2018 Classical Islamic Book Prize by Gorgias Press. She is currently faculty associate of the Oriental Institute at the University of Oxford, where she teaches Islamic theology and philosophy.

Mark Eli Kalderon is a Professor of philosophy at University College London. He is a former editor of the Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society. His books include *Form Without Matter, Empedocles and Aristotle on Color Perception*, and *Sympathy in Perception*. He mainly works on philosophy of perception and its history.

Jari Kaukua is Professor of philosophy at the University of Jyväskylä. He is the author of *Self-Awareness in Islamic Philosophy* (CUP 2015) as well as a number of articles on classical and post-classical Islamic philosophy.

Jon McGinnis is a Professor of classical and medieval philosophy at the University of Missouri, St. Louis. He is the author of *Avicenna* in the Oxford University Press' Great Medieval Thinkers Series (2010), translator and editor of Avicenna's *Physics* (Brigham Young University Press 2009), and co-translator with David C. Reisman of *Classical Arabic Philosophy, An Anthology of Sources* (Hackett Publishing Co. 2007).

Filip Radovic is a Senior lecturer at Gothenburg University, Sweden. He has published work in Ancient and medieval philosophy as well as in contemporary philosophy. He has recently edited a volume together with Börje Bydén: *The Parva Naturalia in Greek, Arabic and Latin Aristotelianism. Supplementing the science of the soul*. *Studies in the History of Philosophy of Min* (Springer 2018).

Aurélien Robert is Senior Fellow at the CNRS. He has published many papers on the history of medieval philosophy, including studies on cognitive theories, philosophy of medicine, and atomism. His monograph on the reception of Epicureanism in the Middle Ages will be published in 2021 (Fayard). In 2019, he received the Bronze Medal of the CNRS for his work on medieval philosophy and science.

José Filipe Silva is a Professor of Medieval Philosophy at the University of Helsinki. He is the author of *Robert Kilwardby on the Human Soul: Plurality of Forms and Censorship in the Thirteenth Century* (Brill 2012) and *Robert Kilwardby* (Oxford University Press), and the co-editor of *Active Perception in the History of Philosophy* (Springer 2014) and *The Senses and the History of Philosophy* (Routledge 2019). He has published widely on medieval theories of perception, philosophy of mind and epistemology.

Juhana Toivanen is an Academy Research Fellow at the University of Jyväskylä, Finland, and an Adjunct Professor (Title of Docent) at the University of Gothenburg. He has published widely on medieval philosophy of mind and political philosophy, including monographs *Perception and the Internal Senses* (Brill 2013) and *The Political Animal in Medieval Philosophy* (Brill 2020).