

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-83843-6 - Seeing Wittgenstein Anew  
Edited by William Day and Victor J. Krebs  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## Seeing Wittgenstein Anew

*Seeing Wittgenstein Anew* is the first collection to examine Ludwig Wittgenstein's remarks on the concept of aspect-seeing. These essays show that aspect-seeing was not simply one more topic of investigation in Wittgenstein's later writings, but, rather, that it was a pervasive and guiding concept in his efforts to turn philosophy's attention to the actual conditions of our common life in language. Arranged in sections that highlight the pertinence of the aspect-seeing remarks to aesthetic and moral perception, self-knowledge, mind and consciousness, linguistic agreement, philosophical therapy, and "seeing connections," the sixteen essays, which were specially commissioned for this volume, demonstrate the unity of not only *Philosophical Investigations* but also Wittgenstein's later thought as a whole. They open up novel paths across familiar fields of thought: the objectivity of interpretation, the fixity of the past, the acquisition of language, and the nature of human consciousness. Significantly, they exemplify how continuing consideration of the interrelated phenomena and concepts surrounding aspect-seeing might produce a fruitful way of doing philosophy.

William Day is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Le Moyne College. A recipient of fellowships from the National Endowment for the Humanities, he has written articles on aesthetics and moral perfectionist thought, with particular focus on the work of Wittgenstein, Cavell, Emerson, and Confucian thinkers.

Victor J. Krebs is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the Pontificia Universidad Católica del Perú. He is the author of several publications on the philosophy of psychology, mind, and language. His most recent publication is *La recuperación del sentido: Wittgenstein, la filosofía y lo trascendente*.

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-83843-6 - Seeing Wittgenstein Anew  
Edited by William Day and Victor J. Krebs  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

# Seeing Wittgenstein Anew

Edited by

WILLIAM DAY

*Le Moyne College*

VICTOR J. KREBS

*Pontificia Universidad Católica del Perú*



Cambridge University Press  
 978-0-521-83843-6 - Seeing Wittgenstein Anew  
 Edited by William Day and Victor J. Krebs  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
 Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,  
 São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

Cambridge University Press  
 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA  
[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
 Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521547321](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521547321)

© Cambridge University Press 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
 no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
 permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United States of America

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data*

Seeing Wittgenstein anew / edited by William Day, Victor J. Krebs.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references (p. ) and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-83843-6 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-54732-1 (pbk.)

1. Wittgenstein, Ludwig, 1889–1951. Philosophische  
 Untersuchungen. 2. Perception (Philosophy) I. Day, William,  
 1954– II. Krebs, Victor J., 1957– III. Title.

B3376.w563P53274 2009

192–dc22 2009016985

ISBN 978-0-521-83843-6 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-54732-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or  
 accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in  
 this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is,  
 or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press  
 978-0-521-83843-6 - Seeing Wittgenstein Anew  
 Edited by William Day and Victor J. Krebs  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

## Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
<i>Abbreviations of Wittgenstein's Works</i>	xv
Introduction: Seeing Aspects in Wittgenstein <i>William Day and Victor J. Krebs</i>	1
I ASPECTS OF "SEEING-AS"	
1 Aesthetic Analogies <i>Norton Batkin</i>	23
2 Aspects, Sense, and Perception <i>Sandra Laugier</i>	40
3 An Allegory of Affinities: On Seeing a World of Aspects in a Universe of Things <i>Timothy Gould</i>	61
4 The Touch of Words <i>Stanley Cavell</i>	81
II ASPECTS AND THE SELF	
<i>II.1 Self-Knowledge</i>	
5 In a New Light: Wittgenstein, Aspect-Perception, and Retrospective Change in Self-Understanding <i>Garry L. Hagberg</i>	101
6 The Bodily Root: Seeing Aspects and Inner Experience <i>Victor J. Krebs</i>	120

vi	<i>Contents</i>
<i>II.2 Problems of Mind</i>	
7 (Ef)acing the Soul: Wittgenstein and Materialism <i>David R. Cerbone</i>	143
8 Wittgenstein on Aspect-Seeing, the Nature of Discursive Consciousness, and the Experience of Agency <i>Richard Eldridge</i>	162
III ASPECTS AND LANGUAGE	
9 The Philosophical Significance of Meaning-Blindness <i>Edward Minar</i>	183
10 Wanting to Say Something: Aspect-Blindness and Language <i>William Day</i>	204
IV ASPECTS AND METHOD	
<i>IV.1 Therapy</i>	
11 On Learning from Wittgenstein, or What Does It Take to <i>See</i> the Grammar of Seeing Aspects? <i>Avner Baz</i>	227
12 The Work of Wittgenstein's Words: A Reply to Baz <i>Stephen Mulhall</i>	249
13 On the Difficulty of Seeing Aspects and the "Therapeutic" Reading of Wittgenstein <i>Steven G. Affeldt</i>	268
<i>IV.2 Seeing Connections</i>	
14 Overviews: What Are They of and What Are They For? <i>Frank Cioffi</i>	291
15 On Being Surprised: Wittgenstein on Aspect-Perception, Logic, and Mathematics <i>Juliet Floyd</i>	314
16 The Enormous Danger <i>Gordon C. F. Bearn</i>	338
Appendix: A Page Concordance for Unnumbered Remarks in <i>Philosophical Investigations</i> <i>William Day</i>	357
 <i>List of Works Cited</i>	 373
<i>Index</i>	385

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-83843-6 - Seeing Wittgenstein Anew  
Edited by William Day and Victor J. Krebs  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## Contributors

*Steven G. Affeldt* is Assistant Professor in the Program of Liberal Studies at the University of Notre Dame. He works in moral and political philosophy, American philosophy, nineteenth- and twentieth-century Continental philosophy, and Wittgenstein. His publications include “The Ground of Mutuality: Criteria, Judgment, and Intelligibility in Stephen Mulhall and Stanley Cavell” (*European Journal of Philosophy*); “Captivating Pictures and Liberating Language: Freedom as the Achievement of Speech in Wittgenstein’s *Philosophical Investigations*” (*Philosophical Topics*); and (forthcoming) “The Normativity of the Natural” (*Skepticism in Context*, ed. James Conant and Andrea Kern).

*Norton Batkin* is Dean of Graduate Studies and Associate Professor of Philosophy and Art History at Bard College. He was the first director of Bard’s Center for Curatorial Studies and Art in Contemporary Culture, and he directed its graduate program in curatorial studies from 1994 until 2008. He has written on photography, aesthetics, and Wittgenstein and is the author of *Photography and Philosophy* (1990).

*Avner Baz* is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Tufts University. He has written on ethics, aesthetics, epistemology (perception), Kant, and Wittgenstein. His publications include “What’s the Point of Seeing Aspects?” (*Philosophical Investigations*); “The Reaches of Words” (*International Journal of Philosophical Studies*);

and (forthcoming) “Seeing Aspects and Philosophical Difficulty” (*The Oxford Handbook of Wittgenstein*, ed. Marie McGinn and Oskari Kuusela). His forthcoming book from Harvard University Press is titled *When Words Are Called For*.

*Gordon C. F. Bearn* is Professor of Philosophy at Lehigh University. He has written articles on Nietzsche, Wittgenstein, Cavell, Derrida, and Deleuze. He is the author of *Waking to Wonder: Wittgenstein’s Existential Investigations* (1997). He is currently revising the manuscript of a book to be called *Life Drawing: An Aesthetics of Existence*.

*Stanley Cavell* is Walter M. Cabot Professor of Aesthetics and the General Theory of Value, Emeritus, at Harvard University. He has published widely on topics and crosscurrents in Wittgenstein and Austin, Emerson and Thoreau, music and opera, Shakespeare, film, psychoanalysis, and autobiography. His writings on Wittgenstein are included in *Must We Mean What We Say?* (1969, updated edition 2002), *The Claim of Reason* (1979), *This New Yet Unapproachable America* (1989), *Conditions Handsome and Unhandsome* (1990), *Philosophical Passages* (1995), and *Philosophy the Day After Tomorrow* (2005). He is a recipient of a MacArthur Fellowship and is Past President of the American Philosophical Association.

*David R. Cerbone* is Professor of Philosophy at West Virginia University. He is the author of *Understanding Phenomenology* (2006) and *Heidegger: A Guide for the Perplexed* (2008). His other publications include “How to Do Things with Wood: Wittgenstein, Frege, and the Problem of Illogical Thought” (*The New Wittgenstein*, ed. Alice Crary and Rupert Read); “The Limits of Conservatism: Wittgenstein on ‘Our Life’ and ‘Our Concepts’” (*The Grammar of Politics: Wittgenstein and Political Philosophy*, ed. Cressida Heyes); and (forthcoming) “Wittgenstein and Idealism” (*The Oxford Handbook of Wittgenstein*, ed. Marie McGinn and Oskari Kuusela).

*Frank Cioffi* is Research Professor of Philosophy at the University of Kent. He began academic life as a social psychologist and has taught at the Universities of Singapore, Berkeley, and Essex. His papers are collected in *Freud and the Question of Pseudoscience* (1998) and *Wittgenstein on Freud and Frazer* (1998). His recently published papers include “The Evasiveness of Freudian Apologetic” (*Who Owns Psychoanalysis?*, ed. Ann Casement); “Wittgenstein and the

Cambridge University Press  
 978-0-521-83843-6 - Seeing Wittgenstein Anew  
 Edited by William Day and Victor J. Krebs  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

Contributors

ix

Riddle of Life” (*The Third Wittgenstein*, ed. Danièle Moyal-Sharrock); and “Wittgenstein on ‘the Sort of Explanation One Longs for’” (*Perspicuous Presentations*, ed. Danièle Moyal-Sharrock).

*William Day* is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Le Moyne College. He writes on aesthetics and moral perfectionist thought, with a particular focus on the work of Wittgenstein, Cavell, Emerson, and Confucian thinkers. His publications include “Moonstruck, or How to Ruin Everything” (*Ordinary Language Criticism: Literary Thinking after Cavell after Wittgenstein*, ed. Walter Jost and Kenneth Dauber); “Knowing as Instancing: Jazz Improvisation and Moral Perfectionism” (*Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*); and “Jazz Improvisation, the Body, and the Ordinary” (*Tidskrift för kulturstudier/Journal of Cultural Studies*).

*Richard Eldridge* is Charles and Harriett Cox McDowell Professor of Philosophy at Swarthmore College. He has held visiting appointments at Stanford University, Universität Bremen, and the University of Essex. He is the author of *On Moral Personhood: Philosophy, Literature, Criticism, and Self-Understanding* (1989); *Leading a Human Life: Wittgenstein, Intentionality, and Romanticism* (1997); *The Persistence of Romanticism* (2001); *An Introduction to the Philosophy of Art* (2003); and *Literature, Life, and Modernity* (2008).

*Juliet Floyd* is Professor of Philosophy at Boston University. She has received fellowships from the American Council of Learned Societies, the Dibner Institute for the History of Science and Technology, M.I.T., the American Philosophical Society, and the American Academy in Berlin. Her areas of research focus on the history of analytic philosophy and the philosophies of logic, language, and mathematics. She has written extensively on Wittgenstein, Kant, Gödel, and Quine. She is co-editor (with Sanford Shieh) of *Future Pasts: The Analytic Tradition in Twentieth-Century Philosophy* (2001).

*Timothy Gould* is Professor of Philosophy at Metropolitan State College of Denver. He has written numerous articles on Kant’s aesthetics, Emerson, Thoreau, Nietzsche, Romanticism, and Wittgenstein; and he is the author of *Hearing Things: Voice and Method in the Writing of Stanley Cavell* (1998). He is completing a manuscript entitled *The Names of Action: In Austin, Wittgenstein, Cavell, Emerson,*



*Marx and Nietzsche*. He has also been writing a series of essays, tentatively titled *Saving the Story*, on narrative in comedy, history, movies, trauma, and autobiography.

*Garry L. Hagberg* holds a Chair in the School of Philosophy at the University of East Anglia and is the James H. Ottaway Professor of Philosophy and Aesthetics at Bard College. He has written extensively at the intersection of aesthetics and the philosophy of language. He is the author of *Meaning and Interpretation: Wittgenstein, Henry James, and Literary Knowledge* (1994); *Art as Language: Wittgenstein, Meaning, and Aesthetic Theory* (1995); and *Describing Ourselves: Wittgenstein and Autobiographical Consciousness* (2008).

*Victor J. Krebs* is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the Pontificia Universidad Católica del Perú. He works on Wittgenstein, Cavell, language, aesthetics, and depth psychology. He is the author of *Del Alma y el Arte: Reflexiones en torno a la cultura, la imagen y la memoria* (1997); *La recuperación del sentido: Wittgenstein, la filosofía y lo trascendente* (2008); and *El impulso pigmaliónico: ensayos en torno a un complejo filosófico* (forthcoming). Publications in English include “The Subtle Body of Language and the Lost Sense of Philosophy” (*Philosophical Investigations*) and “‘Around the Axis of Our Real Need’: The Ethical Point of Wittgenstein’s Philosophy” (*European Journal of Philosophy*).

*Sandra Laugier* is Professor of Philosophy at the Université de Picardie Jules Verne (Amiens) and a member of the Institut Universitaire de France. She specializes in ordinary language philosophy, contemporary American philosophy, and moral philosophy. Her books include *L’anthropologie logique de Quine* (1992); *Recommencer la philosophie* (1999); *Du réel à l’ordinaire* (1999); *Wittgenstein, Métaphysique et jeu de langage* (2001); *Une autre pensée politique américaine* (2004); and *Ethique, littérature, vie humaine* (2006).

*Edward Minar* is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Arkansas. He has written extensively on Wittgenstein and Heidegger, and he is currently working on Wittgensteinian responses to different forms of skepticism and on animal minds. His publications include “Wittgenstein’s Response to Skepticism in *On Certainty*” (*Readings of Wittgenstein’s On Certainty*, ed. William Brenner and Danièle Moyal-Sharrock); “Living with the Problem

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-83843-6 - Seeing Wittgenstein Anew  
Edited by William Day and Victor J. Krebs  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

*Contributors*

xi

of the Other” (*Wittgenstein and Scepticism*, ed. Denis McManus); and “Heidegger’s Response to Skepticism in *Being and Time*” (*Future Pasts*, ed. Juliet Floyd and Sanford Shieh).

*Stephen Mulhall* is Fellow and Tutor in Philosophy, New College, Oxford. He is the author of *On Being in the World: Wittgenstein and Heidegger on Seeing Aspects* (1990); *Stanley Cavell: Philosophy’s Recounting of the Ordinary* (1994); *Heidegger and Being and Time* (1996); *Inheritance and Originality: Wittgenstein, Heidegger, Kierkegaard* (2001); *Wittgenstein’s Private Language: Grammar, Nonsense, and Imagination in Philosophical Investigations, §§243–315* (2006); *The Conversation of Humanity* (2007); *On Film: Second Edition* (2008); and *The Wounded Animal: J. M. Coetzee and the Difficulty of Reality in Literature and Philosophy* (2009).

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-83843-6 - Seeing Wittgenstein Anew  
Edited by William Day and Victor J. Krebs  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## Acknowledgments

The editors wish to thank the Research and Development Committee at Le Moyne College for its generous support of this project; Wiley-Blackwell for permission to quote extensively from *Philosophical Investigations*; the British Film Institute for allowing us to reproduce a still from Derek Jarman's 1993 film *Wittgenstein* as our cover image; and Hopeton Smalling for capturing this image from an old video-tape cassette.

We are grateful for the sustained and supportive advice of our editor at Cambridge University Press, Ms. Beatrice Rehl.

Most especially, our thanks go to the contributors to this volume for their patience during and beyond the editing process and for the privilege of making available for the first time their original work on what is still a conspicuous blind spot in Wittgensteinian studies.

Cambridge University Press  
 978-0-521-83843-6 - Seeing Wittgenstein Anew  
 Edited by William Day and Victor J. Krebs  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

## Abbreviations of Wittgenstein's Works

- BB*     *The Blue and Brown Books*  
*BT*     *The Big Typescript*  
*CM*     *The Collected Manuscripts of Ludwig Wittgenstein on Facsimile CD-ROM*  
*CV*     *Culture and Value*  
*CVR*     *Culture and Value: Revised Edition*  
*DB*     *Denkbewegungen: Tagebücher 1930–1932, 1936–1937*  
*L3032*   *Wittgenstein's Lectures, Cambridge, 1930–1932*  
*L3235*   *Wittgenstein's Lectures, Cambridge, 1932–1935*  
*LC*     *Lectures and Conversations on Aesthetics, Psychology and Religious Belief*  
*LFM*     *Wittgenstein's Lectures on the Foundations of Mathematics, Cambridge, 1939*  
*LWI*     *Last Writings on the Philosophy of Psychology*, vol. 1  
*LWII*    *Last Writings on the Philosophy of Psychology*, vol. 2. References to remarks are given by page number followed by a letter indicating the position of the remark on that page – for example, “12c” for the third remark on page 12, “12d” for the fourth remark, etc.  
*NB*     *Notebooks 1914–1916*  
*OC*     *On Certainty*  
*PG*     *Philosophical Grammar*

- PI* *Philosophical Investigations*, 2d ed. References to remarks in Part II are given by page number followed by a letter indicating the position of the remark on that page – for example, “193a” for the first remark on page 193, “193b” for the second remark, etc. References to whole sections within Part II are indicated by Roman numerals – for example, “II.xi” for Part II, Section 11, etc.
- PO* *Philosophical Occasions*
- PR* *Philosophical Remarks*
- RC* *Remarks on Colour*
- RFM* *Remarks on the Foundations of Mathematics*
- RPP I* *Remarks on the Philosophy of Psychology*, vol. 1
- RPP II* *Remarks on the Philosophy of Psychology*, vol. 2
- TLP* *Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*
- WWK* *Wittgenstein and the Vienna Circle*
- Z* *Zettel*

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-83843-6 - Seeing Wittgenstein Anew  
Edited by William Day and Victor J. Krebs  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

Seeing Wittgenstein Anew