Internet Access for Children's Online Schooling during the COVID-19 Pandemic and Parental Mental Health

Abstract: The outbreak of the coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) causing millions of people to be infected has posed major public health and governance challenges. This study evaluates the extent to which the unavailability of internet for children to learn online during the pandemic affects parental psychological wellbeing. We find that parents having no internet for their children to learn online during to the pandemic are 40.37, 47.22, 43.68, and 46.90 percentage points more likely to feel anxious, worried, displeased, and depressed every day. The study calls for the expansion of supports for children and families during the pandemic, especially for disproportionately affected communities.

1 Introduction

The outbreak of the coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) in China in late 2019 has posed major public health and governance challenges as a worldwide pandemic emerged. The COVID-19 pandemic has caused millions of Americans to be infected and hundreds of thousands to die. In addition to a public health crisis, the economic turmoil caused by the pandemic is substantial. In light of such a humanitarian crisis, it is critical for researchers and policymakers to understand the extent to which the pandemic-related aspects alter people's health and wellbeing.

This study evaluates the extent to which the unavailability of internet for children to learn online during the pandemic affects parental psychological wellbeing in the context of the U.S. The study contributes to the literature by analyzing the less tangible impacts of COVID-19 related aspects, particularly, the impacts on mental health, whereas other studies tend to concentrate on the visible impacts such as those on infection, hospitalization, and death. By doing so, our study provides additional scientific evidence on the relationship between pandemic-related aspects and public welfare.

We find that having no internet for children to learn online during the pandemic significantly reduces parental mental health. Specifically, parents having no internet for their children to learn online during to the pandemic are 40.37, 47.22, 43.68, and 46.90 percentage points more likely to feel anxious, worried, displeased, and depressed every day. The results emphasize the less discernible effect of a pandemic-related aspect, having no internet for children to learn online during the pandemic, on the mental wellbeing of parents. The findings calls for the expansion of supports for children and families during the pandemic, especially for disproportionately affected communities.

2 Data

Data on mental health are retrieved from the Household Pulse Survey Public Use File (HPS-PUF) conducted by the United States Census Bureau in cooperation with other U.S. government agencies. The HPS-PUF is a dataset that provides a good picture of American experiences during the COVID-19 pandemic. Besides rich information on mental health, the HPS-PUF also provides other characteristics of respondents such as race, age, marital status, education, state of residence, among others. Despite the weekly collection and dissemination of data in phase 1, the two-week collection and dissemination approach has been implemented since phase 2. It is worth noting that the collection periods are still called "weeks" in the HPS-PUF to maintain continuity [1]. In total, there are currently 35 survey weeks (waves) available, all of which are employed in this study.

Measures of individual mental health are based on responses to the questions about the frequency of displaying the following four psychological symptoms over the previous 7 days, including (i) the frequency of feeling nervous, anxious, or on edge, (ii) the frequency of not being able to stop or control worrying, (iii) the frequency of having little interest or pleasure in doing things, and (iv) the frequency of feeling down, depressed, or hopeless. Responses are put into a four-point scale as follows: 1-Not at all, 2-Several days, 3-More than half the days, and 4-Nearly every day. Based on these responses, we construct four measures of mental health, namely, Daily Anxiety, Daily Worry, Daily Displeasure, and Daily Depression. They are indicator variables equal to one if the respondent chooses the worst state (4-Nearly every day), and zero otherwise.

The HPS-PUF also asked the parents whether they currently have internet for their children to learn online during to the pandemic, and the responses can be 1-Always, 2-Usually, 3-Sometimes, 4-Rarely, and 5-Never. Therefore, our main explanatory variable of whether a respondent has no internet for their children to learn online is an indicator (*Internet Unavailability*) that takes a value

of one if the answer is 4-Rarely or 5-Never (*Internet Unavailability = 1*), and zero if the answer is

1-Always, 2-Usually, or 3-Sometimes *(Internet Unavailability = 0)*.

Our sample consists of over 580,000 parents. Descriptive statistics of our dependent and

explanatory (independent) variables are displayed in Panels A and B of Table 1, respectively.

Evident from Panel A, approximately 18.55, 12.70, 8.74, and 9.05% of individuals report feeling

anxious, worried, displeased, and depressed on a daily basis. As shown in Panel B, the average

number of parents who have no internet for their children to learn online is 1.80%. The proportions

of white, black, and other-race individuals are 78.98, 9.35, and 11.67%, respectively. The average

age of the respondents is 44.029. Roughly 70.91% are married and 35.42% are male. The fraction

of individuals having bachelor's degrees is 86.65% and the fraction working for the government

is 13.59%.

	Mean (1)	SD (2)	N (3)
Table 1: Summary Statistics			
Panel A: Dependent Variables			
Daily Anxiety	0.1855	0.3887	580875
Daily Worry	0.1270	0.3330	580875
Daily Displeasure	0.0874	0.2824	580875
Daily Depression	0.0905	0.2869	580875
Panel B: Independent Variables			
Internet Unavailability	0.0180	0.1329	580875
Respondent is white	0.7898	0.4074	580875
Respondent is black	0.0935	0.2911	580875
Neither White nor Black	0.1167	0.3211	580875
Age of Respondent	44.029	9.8194	580875
Respondent is married	0.7091	0.4542	580875
Respondent is male	0.3542	0.4783	580875
Respondent has bachelor's degree	0.8665	0.3401	580875
Respondent works for government	0.1359	0.3427	580875

3 Empirical Design

To quantify the relationship between having no internet for children to learn online during to the pandemic and parental mental health, we estimate the following regression model,

$$Y_{isw} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 IU_{isw} + \delta_s + \theta_w + X'_{isw}\Omega + \epsilon_{isw}$$

where the subscripts correspond to individual i, state of residence s, and week of survey w. The dependent variable Y_{isw} represents various mental health outcomes, including Daily Anxiety (whether the individual feels anxious every day in the past seven days), Daily Worry (whether the individual feels worried on a daily basis in the past seven days), Daily Displeasure (whether the individual has the feeling of displeasure every day in the past seven days), and Daily Depression (whether the individual feels depressed on a daily basis in the past seven days).

The main explanatory variable, IU_{isw} (*Internet Unavailability*), is an indicator that takes a value of one if the individual has no internet for their children to learn online during to the pandemic, and zero otherwise. State and survey week fixed effects are captured by δ_s and θ_w. Vector X'_{isw} is our covariate of individual characteristics such as race, age, squared-age, marital status, gender, education, and occupation. The variable ϵ_{isw} is the error term. Standard errors throughout the paper are clustered at the state-by-week level.

Our coefficient of interest is β_1 which captures the effects of having no internet for children to learn online during to the pandemic on parental psychological well-being. In other words, β_1 reflects the difference in the psychological wellbeing of parents having and having no internet for children to learn online, conditional on other characteristics.

4 Results

Main Results - The estimated impacts of having no internet for children to learn online during the pandemic on parental mental health are provided in Table 2. For each panel, each column represents a separate regression and the panel name indicates the outcome variable. Column 1 displays the estimates from the most parsimonious specification where we only control for our main explanatory variable, the indicator *Internet Unavailability*. In Column 2, we additionally control for a set of temporal and spatial fixed effects. Finally, Column 3 represents our most extensive specification where we further account for individual characteristics (race, age, squared-age, marital status, gender, education, and occupation), in addition to the set of fixed effects.

According to Column 1 of Table 2, we find that parents having no internet for their children to learn online during to the pandemic are 49.75, 61.75, 57.79, and 60.15 percentage points more likely to feel anxious, worried, displeased, and depressed every day. However, the estimates from the most parsimonious specification only reflect the correlation between having no internet for their children to learn online during the pandemic and mental health as important factors that could jointly affect access status and mental health are not accounted for. For example, highly educated individuals or white individuals tend to have internet for their children and better mental health simultaneously [2, 3, 4, 5].

Thus, we gradually include the set of fixed effects and individual characteristics from Columns 2 to 3. According to the most extensive specification (Column 3), we find that parents having no internet for their children to learn online during to the pandemic are 40.37, 47.22, 43.68, and 46.90 percentage points more likely to feel anxious, worried, displeased, and depressed every day. The estimates remain statistically significant.

Table 2: Internet Unavailability and Mental Health

	(1)	(2)	(3)
Panel A: Y = Daily Anxiety			
Internet Unavailability	0.4687***	0.4558***	0.3695***
	(0.0090)	(0.0091)	(0.0092)
Observations	584393	584393	584393
Panel B: Y = Daily Worry			
Internet Unavailability	0.5744***	0.5503***	0.4285***
	(0.0085)	(0.0090)	(0.0091)
Observations	584393	584393	584393
Panel C: Y = Daily Displeasure			
Internet Unavailability	0.5261***	0.5106***	0.3894***
	(0.0079)	(0.0088)	(0.0089)
Observations	584393	584393	584393
Panel D: Y = Daily Depression			
Internet Unavailability	0.5359***	0.5228***	0.4065***
	(0.0079)	(0.0090)	(0.0089)
Observations	584393	584393	584393
All Characteristics	.	.	X
All Fixed Effects	.	X	X

Note: *$p<0.1$, **$p<0.05$, ***$p<0.01$. Robust standard errors are clustered at the state-by-week level.

Other Outcome Measures - So far we have provided evidence that having no internet for children to learn online during to the pandemic can reduce parental mental health. Next, we adopt different measures of mental health. Recall that our main dependent variables are Daily Anxiety, Daily Worry, Daily Displeasure, and Daily Depression, which take the value of one if the individual reports feeling anxious, worried, displeased, and depressed on a daily basis, respectively, zero otherwise. Here, we utilize the uncoded measures of mental health, Uncoded Anxiety, Uncoded Worry, Uncoded Displeasure, and Uncoded Depression, which refers to the frequency of experiencing each feeling. Frequency is expressed in a four-point scale as follows: 1-Not at all, 2-Several days, 3-More than half the days, and 4-Nearly every day. Table 3 shows that adopting

uncoded measures of mental health leaves our conclusion on the relationship between having no

internet for children to learn online during the pandemic and parental mental health unchanged.

Table 3: Internet Unavailability and Mental Health - Uncoded Measures

	(1)	(2)	(3)
Panel A: Y = Uncoded Anxiety			
Internet Unavailability	0.1682***	0.1662***	0.1441***
	(0.0038)	(0.0047)	(0.0047)
Observations	580875	580875	580875
Panel B: Y = Uncoded Worry			
Internet Unavailability	0.1835***	0.1791***	0.1535***
	(0.0033)	(0.0046)	(0.0046)
Observations	580875	580875	580875
Panel C: Y = Uncoded Displeasure			
Internet Unavailability	0.1571***	0.1545***	0.1314***
	(0.0028)	(0.0042)	(0.0042)
Observations	580875	580875	580875
Panel D: Y = Uncoded Depression			
Internet Unavailability	0.1707***	0.1679***	0.1439***
	(0.0028)	(0.0043)	(0.0043)
Observations	580875	580875	580875
All Characteristics	.	.	X
All Fixed Effects	.	X	X

Note: *p<0.1, **p<0.05, ***p<0.01. Robust standard errors are clustered at the state-by-week level.

5 Conclusion

We contribute to the literature by analyzing the less tangible impacts of COVID-19 related aspects,

particularly, the impacts on mental health, whereas other studies tend to concentrate on the visible

impacts such as those on infection, hospitalization, and death. By doing so, our study provides

additional scientific evidence on the relationship between pandemic-related aspects and public

welfare.

Collectively, we have presented evidence that having no internet for children to learn online during to the pandemic reduces parental mental health. Specifically, parents having no internet for their children to learn online during to the pandemic are 40.37, 47.22, 43.68, and 46.90 percentage points more likely to feel anxious, worried, displeased, and depressed every day. Our findings are insensitive to the utilization of different measures of outcome variables. The results emphasize the less discernible effect of a pandemic-related aspect, having no internet for children to learn online during the pandemic, on the mental wellbeing of parents. The findings calls for the expansion of supports for children and families during the pandemic, especially for disproportionately affected communities.

References

Hoang, H. T., Nguyen, K. D., Le, T. T., Khanh, H., Le, K., & Nguyen, M. (2010). Does Property Rights Affect Women and Children's Well-being?.

Le, K., & Nguyen, M. (2019). Racial/Ethnic Match and Student-Teacher Relationships.

Le, K., & Nguyen, M. (2018). Classrooms: the Case of Corporal Punishment in the Home.

Nguyen, M., Le, K., Hoang, H. T., Khanh, H., Duc, K., & Trang, T. (2017). Does Temperature Shocks Affect Birth Weight in Vietnam?.

Hoang, H. T., Hang, N. K., Nguyen, K. D., Huong, N. T., Le, T. T., Nguyen, M., & Le, K. (2014). Conflicts and Human Development: A Literature Review.

Nguyen, M., Duc, K., Hoang, H. T., Trang, T., Le, K., & Khanh, H. (2015). The Impacts of Aerial Bombardment on Education.

Khanh, H., Nguyen, K. D., Huong, T. H., Le Trang, T., Le, K., & Nguyen, M. (2016). The Impacts of Spatial Policies on Health and Education.